



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Good evening. Everyone. It is 6:30 PM. Welcome to our special meeting on a budget hearing for the Oakland Police Commission. In a moment, we are going to call for our roll call. We're just trying to get one of our commissioners in, from the outer marker into our panels.
- Juanito Rus: Edwin has been promoted.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, terrific. So I'd like to call the roll now. Commissioner Prather?
- Edwin Prather: I'm here, chair, thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Presente.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent, thank you very much. I am here and I am for the purpose of establishing a roll call in quorum. Alternate commissioner, David Jordan?
- David Jordan: Present.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. And alternate commissioner, Chris Brown.
- Chris Brown: Present.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. We, we have a quorum. We do know that commissioner Smith has an excused absence. We expect that vice chair Gage may also have an excused absence, although he may try to join us. And then Commissioners Harris and Anderson are finishing up their ad hoc meeting and will join us. But we will go ahead and move forward in anticipation of making some efficiencies, particularly around time. So we do have a quorum and I would like to read a statement for everyone's benefit.
- Regina Jackson: As part of the Oakland Police Commission's responsibilities with article budget, hearings annually. We are also charged with the responsibility to make recommendations to the city council. While this evening's budget hearing will inform the commission, this is in many ways, the beginning of a deeper and longer discussion. As a city, we are mid budget cycle, and while we will seek to make recommendations on the issue before us, we recognize that there is lots of study, deliberation and debate necessary for the longterm transformation of both policing and budgets related to policing and other city services. For many this is the beginning of that conversation, and this will not be the only budget conversation we will have.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Regina Jackson: We recognize that units of measurements are not how the Oakland Police Department budget is framed and while not data driven or performance based, we recognize that the current police model is not working and can be improved, and the budget is only one element of that conversation. We will first invite the Oakland Police Department to present budget information. The commissioners can ask questions, and then we will open the hearings to public comments. The commission will then deliberate and discuss next steps and possible recommendations. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: So let us move ahead on the slides, Mr. Bruce. Yes. So we are inviting the Oakland Police Department to present their budget information first. I see that we have interim Chair Manheimer and several members of her staff, Deputy Chief...
- Juanito Rus: Chair?
- Regina Jackson: Yes?
- Juanito Rus: The agenda lists the open forum, public comment first. I don't know if you wanted to switch order.
- Regina Jackson: I'm switching the order. We will first invite the OPD to present budget information, the commissioners will then ask questions and then we will open the hearing to public comments. This way they can respond to whatever it is that they've heard. And then the commission will deliberate and discuss next steps and possible recommendations.
- Chief Manheimer: Sorry, go ask a real quick.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Manheimer? [crosstalk 00:06:41]. I'm sorry.
- Chief Manheimer: I'm sorry. I'm here. Yes ma'am, can you hear me?
- Regina Jackson: Yes.
- Chief Manheimer: Okay. Thank you so much. Would you like me to just do an overall presentation and then take any questions? Or did you have any specifics you wanted me to focus on at this time?
- Regina Jackson: So one of the emails that I sent, spoke very specifically to a series of services that are currently provided by the police that perhaps do not require police to respond. I mean, we know that that has been the case, but we are very interested in looking at some of those services, recognizing what they represent



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

in the budget. And so if you can give us kind of an overview and then go into some of those, that would be very helpful.

Chief Manheimer: Okay, thank you, yes. So first I did send you a couple of items and I just wanted to make sure that I addressed your issues first, but if you would allow me... Oh there you go, thank you. If you would allow me sort of an overall, if I could step back for a moment.

Regina Jackson: Absolutely.

Chief Manheimer: I think that this is that moment in time when there's going to be a level of opportunity in all of the sort of scrutiny and shining the light on police in many areas. And I think we've seen that already and where we're moving towards with use of force and the reforms there. And I think as well within the budget we recognize, and I think we want to take the opportunity to look at critically some of these same, very same areas, Madam Chair, that you have pointed out, because I think in terms of community policing and in terms of sort of defunding other critical safety net services, to include those in the community, the community based organizations, as well as those safety net services through human services for mental health services, this sort of deinstitutionalization of both shelter and mental health services and the recognition that a lot of what the response from the emergency services providers and all include police, fire, and EMT, Falk, and ambulance.

Chief Manheimer: At this point, we've become the sort of the default defacto only ones who make house calls and the problem with that being, and I think you, and many others have said it, is that really a police response? When it gets to the point where there is violence attached, you could all argue, yes, there is. But the problem is that most of that is because it's not addressed upstream at a lower level with either the types of community based services, such as you've discussed with macro, the sort of the local complete space model and other services in which we actually ended up having opportunities, even through our own partnership, our own partnership with mental health clinicians and our net team. All of those have proved more effective than actually ending up with the emergency response. But the bottom line is because the individuals are frankly, out in the field, those who are unhoused, those who have the mental health crises, those who have some type of a substance use or abuse, they're not generally coming into the office of a clinician to get those services.

Chief Manheimer: And so they often wait and become an issue if you would almost criminalize because that's when the police become involved. So to that extent, we welcome and are in discussions with both the city and supportive of items like macro in looking for alternative delivery of service for mental health calls. And I might just start with that in your items that you highlighted here. If you'll see towards



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

the bottom of the screen, the mental health macro response. I believe that we, the council, the police commission, community based organizations, police, and fire, we are all in support of looking for a way to stand up alternative response mechanisms and models. And I think macro would be a piece of that. I think another piece would be that effective partnering of clinicians with those officers out in the field. And then I think for the unhoused as well, there's probably a lot of community based organizations that are already set up, but what we're lacking is the general infrastructure.

Chief Manheimer: And so the city administrator myself, the fire chief, we've had that discussion with Anne Jameson, Ms. [inaudible 00:11:44] and others about macro. Really, how do we go about taking this moment in time, making something positive out of it, getting the police out of that business. But, the bottom line for that Madam chair is, I don't believe we can take that money out of the budget until we have stood up the place to refer them to, because we can't just say we won't come. You know, at the end of the day of the 2000 calls for service that we handle every single day, about 500 of those being 911 calls, you have about 10% of those 911 calls, which are actually mental health calls. And so for those 18,000 911 calls per year, about a fifth of those being mental health calls, we'd like to be able to push a different button.

Chief Manheimer: We'd like to be able to have that alternative response, but until they do that, I don't believe that we can just say we won't go. So, that's kind of where we are with that. I don't know if you have any questions or comments, but we would love to even take a lead to convening the type of partners, public and private that would stand up that kind of an infrastructure. Cause it's multi-tiered and multi sort of multi needs, but others need to come out in the field with us to address and meet the folks where they are. Would you like me to go on or do you have any thoughts, comments about that?

Regina Jackson: No, you can go ahead and...

Juanito Rus: Okay.

Regina Jackson: And if hands are raised by commissioners, then we will let them follow up with questions as they come, if that's all right with you.

Juanito Rus: Okay, great. The second piece of that, if I'll just go down now, I'm sorry, Mr. Russo. I'll just start at the top now and go down. But I, did want to highlight that one because of all of these listings, I think that's the one where really we could wholly re-engineer alternative delivery of service models there. We did it in a tender line, when I was there and it was very powerful. And I think that... I can't tell you there's going to be huge budget savings there, but for the quality of life within the community and for those individuals, I think it would be very



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

important for the unhoused individuals. We do have three officers assigned to a homeless outreach services. They are trained with critical incident response, the homeless outreach team.

Juanito Rus:

Let me look, I'm looking for the total cost of that. So it's about \$745,000 total. If you're adding in all of the additional costs for the officers to be a fully budgeted position for those three and some O and M, which is Operating and Maintenance budget, and they are trained for the deescalation critical incident response. I think that they are, they get a significant amount of their calls internally from other calls to criminality associated with the encampment loosely. But one of the things that we have now, is a side layer with the city and the department of public works, as their employees had concerns and asked us to escort them through encampment cleanups, encampment removals or a redirection for safety concerns. And I think that we end up with the homeless encampments, pretty much to do the response in for those criminal issues, which oftentimes are a problem for the residents in the encampments themselves.

Juanito Rus:

So, that is that homeless outreach services unit. They as well are paired with clinicians and really, we hope that they become a resource and referral service so that we can get other services in there, recognizing that, we have only limited services and clinician training. That is the unhoused unit. We then have towing and abandoned cars. I talked with chief Armstrong who should be here fairly quickly. He, I think was finishing up in the use of force ad hoc committee. But while that detail is made up both non-sworn civilian personnel, they do request the assistance of our sworn officers. As you can imagine, people are not that happy when they have their cars towed. We try until those that are abandoned blights and hazards, we really act upon complaint. So we're not out there looking to tow cars, but we have at any one time, an incredible amount of requests and complaints back up.

Juanito Rus:

So this is a very powerful tool for, sort of, that crime prevention through environmental design, where they get these abandoned autos that are hazards, especially to children and, and those in the neighborhoods. So they are supervised by a sworn officer, a Sergeant, because they do enforcement as well as court testimony, activities. We believe they should remain in the police department. I think there was a question about whether we could put them over in the department of transportation, because there's both an enforcement component, a need to make sure that they are supervised totally by a Sergeant and the field operations staff. So we're not using it as a sanction or a punishment. And it's really only for those that are a blight and hazard, and that there is opportunity for both tow hearings and for release of vehicles that's needed to be done out of Eastmont station.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Juanito Rus: So for that for that unit, we do feel that they should remain within the department. However, I'm pleased to let you know that we are looking and working with the city at transferring over the next category, which is our crossing guard program. I think it's very important to recognize for the \$2 million that would be transferred over there. They will still, are trying to figure out exactly how they assign the supervisory duties over there. So, it's about two million now, but we may have to share or transfer supervisor with the unit. I think the reason why this... I'm sorry, go ahead.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry. I thought you were taking a break. I just wanted to acknowledge that Commissioner's Harris and Anderson have joined us. My apologies though. Go ahead.
- Juanito Rus: No, that's fine, and if I'm going too long, please let me know. I don't need to read it all, but for some people they're seeing it just right now. I did want to say that I think there is an affinity and an Alliance between the department of transportation and the crossing guard budget, because we try and place these crossing guards nearest and closest to where there are traffic issues and safety issues. So that we will be looking to transfer over. I think there was a question for a while, but we are going to do it. So Mr. Ruse, for the next one are community policing budget through measures Z. I think that's the last one on this page. And I do have, there it is. I did offer a line item budget for that. Sure, Jackson, and that will show you that within the measure... [crosstalk 00:18:55] Go ahead ma'am.
- Regina Jackson: No, this, this looks great, thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Okay. Within the measures, the proposed funded positions, while it is measure Z funded, there's not a lot of measure Z funding that goes to these. A lot of it is out of our general fund budget, but a portion of it goes there. And these are your area and district police officers who were assigned to those areas, our special victims section. And it really is meant to be the violence prevention piece of it. Those who work very closely with the DVP director of violence prevention and the ceasefire unit to get out there in the field. And if you wanted any further information on that, I do have a Deputy Chief Armstrong here, who is much more intimately familiar with this. If you wanted that level of detail now, or shall I just continue on? Chair? Did you want anything further on this, the program around the community policing and measure Z funds?
- Regina Jackson: Yes. Ma'am. I actually see a hand from commissioner Harris, so she must have a question. So I'll unmute.
- Ginale Harris: Yes, I do. Thank you very much. I apologize. I came on late. I was in another meeting, but I just kind of jumped in and overheard some things. On that first



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

document, I saw that there were some funding being moved over in regards to different policies or different areas, but like on the towing one, for instance, my concern is that the policy is not even up to date. So...

Chief Manheimer: You wouldn't talk about that? Yes. So I have Chief Armstrong here. Was the question... I don't know if I waited to hear your question, I'm sorry, go ahead.

Ginale Harris: Yeah. So the question is, the question has been asked even before you came here. Our policy, for towing, is not current. It's way out of policy practices or it's out of date. And so in order, like you're moving funding around to do what, like we're not, I'm not understanding how it's going to improve the policy or how we do things and towing.

Chief Manheimer: Yes, ma'am, we're not moving over, I don't know [inaudible 00:21:28] if you want to go back to that other page. These are all the areas that Chair Jackson, and really I think she did a great job of identifying those areas, that we should look at for opportunities to shift funds around. The one for towing and abandoned cars, we did not, we believe needs to stay within the police department because there's an enforcement component. And we really want to make sure that we have a high level of scrutiny on this because we don't ever want to weaponize towing, if you will. We want to make sure that the towing that we do of abandoned autos is truly for those blighted and hazardous vehicles. And so there is a high level of those. We respond on complaints for those. So we do feel that they should remain within the Eastmont stations.

Chief Manheimer: They have a high level of staff oversight. If you wanted to speak about policy, that's a different issue, Commissioner Harris, but we are not, we are not recommending that. We are recommending the next item, which is transferring over the crossing guards because of the big affinity with the department of transportation.

Ginale Harris: Okay. So the department, the crossing guards are under... Yeah, that's odd that they'd be under the police budget.

Chief Manheimer: Yes. And I do think, I mean, it's, like I said, a little bit earlier to Chair Jackson, a lot of things, because we have a large amount of supervisors... Did you want to speak to that? Chief Armstrong wanted to add in for a moment, so I'll shift over to him if you don't mind.

D.C. Armstrong: Yeah. So, I think initially the department had a much larger traffic unit and that traffic unit was also, had a grant that centered around traffic safety around schools in particular. And so, at that time, it made sense to have the crossing guards under the department, because that grant really was for officers to participate in the safe passage program, which consisted of traffic officers



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

coming around schools prior to school and after school. And so the crossing guard program worked well with that grant, but then after that grant expired and then we have also moved some resources out of traffic and back into patrol to help take calls for service. I think again, to the chief's point, it'd probably be better suited at DOT at this point.

Ginale Harris: Okay, and the chief did mention something when she said that measure Z dollars. Although some monies from the measure comes out of there for policing, most of it comes from the general fund. Why is that?

D.C. Armstrong: Well, I think there's the, the dollars are divided into multiple plots, if that makes sense. So some, some of the measures needs to dollars fund community resource officers, some farm fund crime reduction team officers, and then some funds fund ceasefire officers. And so that's where, that's where the chief is saying that some of our officers, that are community resource officers, are funded through the general fund. Some are ceasefire, our crime reduction team officers are funded through, through the general fund as well. And then, some of our ceasefire officers are also general funded officers, but the measure Z fund dollars are spread out amongst those three sections as well as our domestic violence section.

Ginale Harris: And now is that what the measure Z money is allocated for?

D.C. Armstrong: Yes, all expenditures is consistent with the measure. And we meet with the measures Z oversight committee, safety and services committee, monthly to go over that budget. We're also subject to audits as well with the oversight audits that come along with the funding as well.

Ginale Harris: Okay. Thank you very much.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Brown's hand is raised. You're unmuted.

Chris Brown: Thanks Chair. Good evening, Chief. I have a question and I'm hoping you can provide some clarity for me. Towing and abandoned cars, you're keeping them because of the potential for a violent interaction with people who are involved with their cars? Is that true?

D.C. Armstrong: No. So, so the law is very clear. The vehicle code requires that we have a towing authority to tow a vehicle. So when we tow a vehicles, its under that towing authority, but what we know is that these towing of someone's vehicle can be highly confrontational. And so there tends to be safety issues, even sometime with our non-sworn staff. So we provide an officer that is available to support them if they were to be confronted by an owner of a vehicle that was not happy with their vehicle being towed. And so there is some safety concerns when it



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

comes to towing vehicles, officer our non-sworn staff, sometime, need that officer safety support so that they can handle their tow in a safe manner.

Chris Brown: Okay, thank you. I have two other questions though, that come from that. One is, how would you contrast that risk of risk to officers say the risk of, of violence in that situation with the risk of violence at a mental health situation where the entire program has moved out?

D.C. Armstrong: Well, I think, even with the mental health situation, we have partnered with our mental health partners to make sure that if there were a situation where there was a violent mental health encounter, we still would intervene, right? We don't want anybody to be in danger, but we know the vast majority of these encounters are nonviolent. And so I think that's, and I think the chief can speak to sort of a three tier process we're looking at that includes officers being with clinicians, actually those officer's safety evaluations that need to take place where there's a violent response. And then the ones that don't need law enforcement at all, right? Those that are willing to work with community based organizations and others that don't need a law enforcement's intervention at all. And so that's the model that we're working on, is the one that is able to handle those that are nonviolent, willing to communicate and work with our community partners and don't pose a risk to the public.

Chris Brown: Can you... The second question I had is, the towing authority, is that a state law or is that a local law?

D.C. Armstrong: That's the state law. Towing authorities come from the California vehicle code.

Jose Dorado: Okay. All right, thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Deputy Chief and Intern Chief Manheimer... Oh, wait a minute, I just saw a hand. Commissioner Prather, you are un-muted.

Edwin Prather: Thank you, Madam chair. While I have you Deputy Chief, a question popped into my mind and I wanted to have you address it while we're on the topic. I think I heard you mention that towing can be quite a tenseful situation. And then there are officers who need to provide support to non-sworn personnel. Is that, is that what I heard you say?

D.C. Armstrong: Yes. When requested.

Edwin Prather: And then is that support uniformed in armed?

D.C. Armstrong: Yes. When requested.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Edwin Prather: So help me understand this, and differentiate this for me, because you know... The other thing, I think you're right. I think vehicles in General can be very tenseful and when people get in an accident or when people get a ticket, like a parking ticket, it's very stressful and very tense. And so I do think that's why, I'm sorry but for lack of a better word, meter maids or traffic control or not traffic control offers, but parking enforcement, right? They often get, they're even written into the penal code section, specific crimes for battery upon a parking enforcement officer. I believe that's correct. You'll correct me if I'm wrong, I'm sure. So I, what I don't understand then, is when we have other situations which deal with automobiles, which are stressful, intense, and can cause people to react, we don't provide support for parking enforcement when they write a ticket and they're in the same kind of danger than purportedly that would be involved when the towing of a car. So why would we provide uniformed armed officers to provide support upon request for towing when we don't do the same for parking or for tickets? Please, is there a difference? And if there's not a difference, then let's just chalk that up to, okay, maybe this is an area we need to look into more, but I want to understand that better.

Chief Manheimer: Yeah. I'll take, I'll take that one Commissioner Prather, if you don't mind, sir. So, there is no difference. These are both done by non-sworn civilian individuals. And so for parking tickets, as well as for towing of abandoned vehicles, we would only provide the assistance of a sworn officer upon request, right? I think for both parking and for towing of abandoned vehicles, which are the generally when we tow a vehicle, unless it's disabled, it's an abandoned vehicle. That's generally blighted, hazardous, as well as already complained upon generally, cause it's abandoned there. So we do not provide that sworn assistance of an officer unless we're called and requested to provide that backup, or if we know it's going to be tense situation going into it, but you're exactly right. There is no, we hope not to have, we hope to have the lowest level of intervention. And both of those are non-sworn positions, both the towing of the abandoned vehicles as well as parking enforcement. Did, did that answer your question?

David Jordan: It did Chief, but I think you can help me to understand this further. What is, a tense situation involving the towing of an abandoned car? What is it that gives rise to someone saying, I need assistance. Look, I can make up a hypothetical regards to a parking enforcement officer writing a ticket and then being falsely imprisoned by someone's car or having their little gold banner or something along those lines, but the towing.

Chief Manheimer: Right. I get you. I understand exactly where you're going. And I think what the delineation is, and I don't want to say they're all tense situations that clearly, if they were all tense situations, we'd probably just put the sworn officers out there. It is not often when they need our assistance, but when they do there's such a difference of taking of someone's property and of abandoned vehicle.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Parking assistance folks, or ticketers if you would call them that are actually not taking a vehicle, right? They're not taking property. They're actually writing the tickets and believe me, we don't get a lot of love out of that either, but it is the taking of someone's vehicle. Now, very often they are abandoned and that's really the ones we try and take off the streets.

Chief Manheimer: That's really the intent of the 72 hour tag that we put on there. But in the times that they need them, we do respond with a sworn officer, just like in mental health. We would love to have lowest levels of intervention and then escalate up as needed. So it is a difference, sir, I think in that it's a taking of a property from someone rather than simply writing them a ticket, neither which makes us a lot of friends.

Edwin Prather: I appreciate the distinction Chief and I believe this is correct. Let me confirm. Parking enforcement officials are officers. They don't carry weapons right? They're just officers. Uniform, but without weapons, correct?

Chief Manheimer: Yes, exactly. And they are not out of the police department. We just formed our department of transportation. Maybe two years ago. So they did go over there. And I think where Chief Armstrong was getting to was that this is a bit higher level of intervention, right? Taking of someone's property. And so they are associated more with us. Should they need our backup and also a closer level of scrutiny for what they are using, how they are applying towing and those principles.

Edwin Prather: So two things that come to mind and I'm sorry to take up so much time to my colleagues here with this point. But I particularly find the towing of cars a socioeconomic problem and there's been much written and said about how it disproportionately affects communities within Oakland. And I think that this is an important topic for us. I do want to say that when a owner is there with a car, creating a tense situation, the car is not abandoned. A abandoned car means that no one's there and you take the car. So if you're towing a car and the owners there contesting the tow or creating a tense situation, then it's not abandoned. You're just towing someone's vehicle. And so what I guess I don't understand is why are we not just asking when in a tenseful situation, it's not abandoned anymore?

Edwin Prather: Why are we not asking people to just move their cars? Why are we towing cars if someone's present? Why are we furthering a tenseful situation when we should be deescalating situations as such. And having the ability to call a uniformed armed officer to the scene when a car's owner's there and we're attempting to tow the car, seems to me to be in inherently, in the policy, an escalation of the situation that we don't need. And maybe I'm not really asking you a question, Chief, maybe I'm just making a comment and we can just chalk it



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

up to, we need to revisit this use and policy. But to me, this is one of those things where inherently the policy itself is a problem. And we don't need as a department to be supporting the towing of cars. And if it's tenseful, we need to make it less tenseful not more tenseful. So I think I just wanted to put that out.

D.C. Armstrong: So commissioner, if I could do the chair, I just want to make it clear. Our first stances at the police department is always to try to identify the owner of the vehicle and see if we can resolve it by the vehicle being moved. I think that starts with the initial 72 hours where we mark a car, trying to signify that the car needs to be moved. And then even before, prior to towing a vehicle, our staff will run that vehicle out and see if we can identify an owner. But if in situations where we have called a tow, because nobody has come to move the vehicle or the vehicles inoperable, we would then call a tow truck. And once that car has been, what we call hooked up by the tow company by contract, we are now on the hook for that car to be towed.

D.C. Armstrong: And there's an expense that comes with that. Now that sometime can be to your point when somebody comes out and it's down hooked, and there's an expense related to that, that could sometimes cause an issue. So our staff are all taught the escalation tactics and they're advised to step back and try to resolve it if we can allow the person to potentially pay that fee. But if they're not willing to do that, by contract, that fee has to be paid in order for that car to be released at that point. And so I think contractually, there's some things that cause us some issues sometimes. I just wanted to clarify the process.

Edwin Prather: Appreciate that deputy Chief. I do. And I know I'm aware of the policy. I do just want to say that I think disproportionately, we're talking about folks with low income or homeless individuals living in cars. And when we go out to the scene and tell them you need to pay or need to be towed, it's not always as simple as that. Not all people can write a check or put on a credit card, what is owed on a car. And so I do want to say that the minute we call a uniformed armed officer to assist on the scene, it's a failure. We failed at that point because we have escalated the situation into a tense situation. It's our fault. And I think we need to start recognizing and acknowledging our failures, that we've taken a car on the street that we'd like to have moved.

Edwin Prather: We've given them an economic pressure that they cannot comply with, that they can't do anything about. And now we're bringing an armed individual to the scene to have the car towed. That's a failure to me. And again let's move on from this, because again, this is our budget discussion. One topic, and I don't want to get stuck here, but I do want to make sure that we are recognizing the disproportionate effects, the socioeconomic effects that we're having here. We've talked about towing and abandoned cars before. Unfortunately, Chief, you weren't with us when we had this debate and talk. But this is something



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

that we really need to look at. And I think it speaks to a bigger problem that so many times we think that the solution is to send someone in who's in uniform and armed, and we need to get away from that because it just exacerbates the situation.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you, sir. And I'll-

Regina Jackson: Excuse me. Commissioner Prather's point.

Chief Manheimer: Yes.

Regina Jackson: One thing that I have is, do we know out of all the cars that are towed, how many of them belong to homeless who are sleeping in their car and may not be in their car when you tow it?

Chief Manheimer: Right. And so we make it a point not to tow the cars of those who were obviously homeless or lodging in their vehicle.

Regina Jackson: [inaudible 00:40:45] think so.

Chief Manheimer: I'm sorry, say that again.

Regina Jackson: I'm sorry, but we've made some mistakes and we have towed cars that have been owned by homeless people who are living in their cars. We have heard stories-

Chief Manheimer: And that may be, but if I could be clear that we respond to complaints of the community. We don't go out and look for abandoned vehicles. My goodness, there are a lot of them out there and there are a lot that are living out of their cars. So we really are driven by the complaints alone and we do not and it's against, it's in our policies, not to tow those of people who are obviously living in them.

Chief Manheimer: Now, do we always know chair when someone is living in there? No. And are we human? Yes. And if we make a mistake, we'll make sure to make that right. That's not in our policy, but to you and to Commissioner Prather, the law is on the book. But we are not driven, we are not enforcers of that law. We are going out and we get tremendous, tremendous pressure from communities who feel the burden of these blighted and abandoned vehicles that are a danger to the children and the neighborhood, et cetera. So I welcome you're looking at the policy. I just want to share with you that this is a huge community driven desire. We don't go out looking for cars to tow period, and we understand that there's a problem.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: But if in fact it's against the law, if it's a blight or disorder or hazard, sir, we will go ahead and tow that vehicle as we can't just say to the community member, "You know what? Sorry, this person doesn't want it towed and we're not going to tow it even though it's either not registered to them, it's inoperable, it's a hazard on the street". So I welcome your opportunity to look again at this policy. It sounds like there's history and it's outdated. So I'm happy to answer any other questions about that or continue on.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Prather's hand is up.
- Edwin Prather: Yeah. Thank you. Ma'am Chair, I just wanted to say two things in response to that. One is I'm aware that while it's probably true that officers don't go out and generally search for cars without a complaint, I'm aware that community members might complain generally about cars in their neighborhood being abandoned and that officers might go into that neighborhood looking for abandoned cars. So I think the department is presenting this picture of, "Hey, there's an abandoned Ford truck on our street. Please come investigate." That may occur. But I think what also is occurring are people just generally complaining about cars in their neighborhood.
- Edwin Prather: And then officers go into those neighborhoods, looking for cars to tow. That to me is a problem. Second, I just want to make sure that when we hear the department say that abandoned cars on streets are a hazard to the neighborhood and to children, that we are in fact talking about the car and not the homeless person living in the car, because it does have a... It does make me react like that. That I just heard that from the department. That the hazard of a homeless person living in their car is the hazard. And I think we need to be very clear about what we're saying here.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harris has her hand up. You've been un-muted.
- Ginale Harris: Thank you. I just have a quick question. I'd like to know how many officers work in the tow department or unit.
- Chief Manheimer: Hold on one moment. We have that. Just one moment. I think it's [inaudible 00:44:40] there. Chief Armstrong's looking it up. Okay, go ahead, Chief.
- D.C. Armstrong: Yeah a total of 10 [inaudible 00:44:56]
- Ginale Harris: So, while you're looking Chief I just want to bring something to your attention. I appreciate commissioner Prather's comments. However, I live in East Oakland, deep East Oakland, and they are abandoned cars, almost every corner you turn. Matter of fact, there's two abandoned cars on my street where I live that have been here for months and nobody came to tow those. Nobody lives in them.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Nobody complains about them I'm guessing. I don't know. But in my mind, this department is supposed to be doing service in all communities. And they mark the cars that have been left there with a note, right? They put the sticker on it, are supposed to put the sticker. And if the car is there two weeks later after the sticker's on it, then they tow it. That is my understanding of how cars are supposed to be towed. Now I have heard that people who are sleeping in their cars, they're towing their cars, and I do not condone that whatsoever.

Ginale Harris: But these cars are everywhere in East Oakland, everywhere. And so I think instead of us complaining about towing the cars, we need to find a place for people to live. You know what I'm saying? So everybody has a safe space to live, not tow their car. But I'm interested to know how many police officers you have in this unit, because I don't even think that one police officer should be dealing with this. And two, I think it should be ran by civilian staff like a tow company or abandoned car company.

Regina Jackson: Thank you Commissioner Harris.

D.C. Armstrong: There's 10 civilian staff that are supervised to that. I mean, that are assigned to that unit with one sworn officer. The reason it's important that we have a sworn officer is because these tows have the ability to be escalated to a court appearance by a sworn officer to testify regarding the tows, as well as participation in a tow hearing. That's required as well by law that we provide the owner of the vehicle, an opportunity to contest that tow. So those things, as well as the police report, that is completed by the towing staff, they have to complete that police report and that police report has to be reviewed by an officer to make sure that we had all the legal requirements to make the tow. So it's like an accountability issue.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Mr. Alden's hand is up here. Unmuted.

John Alden: Thanks madam chair, Deputy Chief Armstrong, just to follow up with you there. I'm afraid I lost you on that last response. I understand if I followed correctly, that you're saying that you need to have someone sworn in order to provide testimony in court. And I have to tell you as a lawyer, I don't see why that would matter. When I was a prosecutor, I would call civilian witnesses all the time for all sorts of important matters and they didn't need a sworn person to do that. So can you fill us in a little bit better on why tows require someone sworn to provide testimony because I have to honestly say that's not making any sense to me.

D.C. Armstrong: Yeah. The sworn staff does not have to testify on behalf of the actual tow, but what he's doing is reviewing the report to make sure that we have complied with the legal standard for towing the vehicle. And then he is coordinating when



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

there's a need for somebody to appear in court. So he, as a supervisor would direct the staff to appear in court, to testify for the tow. Does that answer your question? So if there were to be a subpoena that was levy for an officer's appearance, that officer that manages that unit, would be the person that's handling the administrative portion of distributing the subpoena for court appearances. They would also be doing the review process for the report that's completed regarding the tow.

John Alden: I appreciate you providing the extra detail Chief. And I think I understand your answer a little better, but I think my concern remains the same. If you are looking for someone to provide some supervision over this paperwork generated about tows, I'm still not understanding why that would be a Sergeant. And honestly, that makes the cost issue I think even of greater concern to me. Because I think you can have a civilian supervisor doing that too at half the cost of a Sergeant.

John Alden: And that seems to me, not a particularly good use of the intense training that a sergeant has, but also, not an effective staffing arrangement. Even if you had just a patrol officer doing that supervision instead of a sergeant, maybe that's how you're staffing it, I'm still not following why that person would need to be sworn. That seems like it's right for civilianisation at substantial savings.

D.C. Armstrong: It's an officer actually, like I said, it's just one police officer.

John Alden: Well, even so, I'm not understanding why it needs to be a sworn police officer. In most departments, I've met civilian supervisors who do that work. And again, at substantially lower costs than a sworn officer,

Chief Manheimer: Thank you, Director Alden. We have need for the background and for any stolen vehicles or other investigation that is done there. And for us, I think that higher level of ability to plug into when there may be issues and maybe criminal or legal issues, it has been helpful for us thus far. So we're happy to discuss that further and the policy if you like at a later time.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Brown's hand was up.

Chris Brown: No, thank you chair. Listening to the Chief just now I think that we can defer my question. It was similar. My comment and question were very similar to Mr. Alden's about using a paralegal to do... Why a paralegal would not have the experience of an officer for this particular matter?

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. So given that, I think we can move forward in terms of Chief Manheimer.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Chief Manheimer: Yes ma'am. So I think we've gone through Mr. Russ I think there's one more category at the bottom of the page here, or there's a couple more. I'll take that category now. Chair Jackson, I think you picked out three or four, what we'll call lower level priority three calls for service. And I put them all together because we're unable to separate out by call code all of these different calls. So I appreciate, and I think once we get another CAD (Computer Aided Dispatch system, there are certainly a lot of things we'd like to be able to better parse out and analyze and get better data for. But for right now, these are all priority three calls. Commercial disputes, public drunkenness, disorderly conduct disrupting the peace.

Chief Manheimer: Generally they either are of a lower level and don't get a response right away. A lot of them we will, simply because we're backed up so many calls, we'll put it out as information only. And then if there are no officers available for the response, either they may escalate at which point we would be called regardless, or they are resolved in some other manner. Our dispatchers do have referral numbers for alternative community dispute resolution services. I think for public drunkenness, we probably don't go out on those because unless they are a problem, they're a low level issue. So a lot of these, particularly if they're calling in on a suspicious person or something along those lines, we don't go to a lot of them. They are put out as information on the beat and if an officer's available to come by, they do.

Chief Manheimer: For commercial disputes we likely will refer those to any of the mediation and dispute resolution services. So I don't see a way in which we could really parse those out now, but a lot of them, we simply don't respond to or we have a very long wait time.

Regina Jackson: So Chief, in terms of dis-aggregating those, what would it take?

Chief Manheimer: I think a couple of things. We really would like to do a better job because I believe that we have a lot more mental health calls than we show. If you talk to our officers, they will tell you that almost 50% or 40% of the calls that they go on, have a mental health component or some type of a social service or trauma need that end up a lot of times manifesting within these types of calls. Now commercial disputes are a little bit different, but we really don't go on those.

Chief Manheimer: A lot of those are civil calls that we will simply let them know. So our problem is somewhat in dispatch in that we don't have... We have an old outdated system that we can't really get the data that we need. And that is, just a huge cost to go to a new CAD assisted data system. We have a third party, I guess it's called like a data aggregator, similar to what you're talking about. And it's not very well and it doesn't work very well. We are pulling out some of the mental health calls from there, but I will tell you again, I think some of these disorderly conduct,



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

disrupting the peace, public drunkenness, public inebriation, a lot of those are coupled with mental health. And that is where I think we need to go is the mental health and the clinician informed program for now. And I think you end up getting to a lot of those calls.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. Commissioner Anderson has a question. You've been unmuted.

Tara Anderson: Thank you, Chair Jackson. And I join Commissioner Harris with apologies for coming over late. We were both at an ad hoc meeting on use of force. I find myself in this combination of space where trying to be gracious yet continue to be courageous. And by gracious, I think I'm thanking the department for responding in earnest to the questions posed by the chair. And I think also in part being responsive to the dialogue from earlier this week on Tuesday during city council. But what I've heard so far is still quite unsatisfactory and not directly responsive to the real structural change that we need to see happen. And I'm hoping that we can be creative and until we can, it's our job as a commission to call out the areas that still are extremely concerning.

Tara Anderson: And we need to signal for our city council. Which also is alarming to me that we need to have this special hearing is because we are not hearing our elected voices, absent council member Bass, come up with a solution that the community is calling for. And so as we center around this last piece of priority three calls and talking about the CAD system, I found it very frustrating going online and only seeing the most recent data available for calls for service that's public is from 2018 and the website actually didn't even function properly to give me that information. So now we're just left with the word on the record here that's being shared with us. We're left with previous meetings where calls for service are repeatedly put forward as evidence further legitimizing the very budget that we're reviewing.

Tara Anderson: So I am incredibly frustrated that now we are in a place where we are told the system is bad. It doesn't tell us enough. And I hear that you're frustrated as well, Chief or interim Chief. So I guess I just need to lean on what I do know and what I do have access to is information about San Francisco and what their calls for service look like. And I know that 40% of their calls for service involve nuisance, mental health and traffic related incidents or engagement issues. And if we're anything like that, which I know we're a different municipality, which it makes it incredibly frustrating to have to use their data, to help us drive decision making. There is a more appropriate response that can be called for and decision making that can happen at dispatch.

Tara Anderson: And I'm looking for your creativity and courage in coming up with what that alternative can look like. I think it is, also two points that were made earlier. We



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

have legal structures, both the most conservative interpretation of them that are resulting in having to Director Alden's point inappropriate staffing patterns, because of a legal standard and who needs to review, when really we're trying to take out of the hands of the justice system, actions that can be carried forward by other parts of government or not government altogether. And I think about testimony that we've heard before and things I know from my own personal work experience of trained medical, mental health professionals, having to call on police to get permission in order to proceed with the most appropriate care for an individual.

Tara Anderson: So my question comes back to what data can we trust when we continue to be redirected towards the fact that there's a significant volume of calls for service community calling upon police when we aren't given any numbers about what that looks like? And I guess focusing in a little bit more on that point is, within the data, being able to understand when calls for service are actually community lead versus officers themselves calling upon dispatch.

Chief Manheimer: I think you are, I'm sorry, Commissioner Anderson, I'm hearing you. I was trying to figure out, I actually am holding the document in my hand, and I was trying to figure out how to scan it in. The citywide calls for service are on the website that I'm looking for. I am going to try and have them scanned in and sent to Mr. Ruse. They are of each month broken down by that month and compared to the month before and compared to a historical range and compared to the past five years. It's officer calls for service, those routed to patrol, those initiated on their own, the number of priority one, priority two, the median response time to also, we do have that. And if I can figure out... I was looking in my email to see how long ago I got it. But let's figure out if we can't get it scanned into Mr. Ruse, and then I can share it with you or I can get it with you for you later.

Chief Manheimer: I will tell you that, and you may not have been on the call earlier, that not only are we committed to looking for alternative service models for particularly these issues, which we believe are more safety net services, those that have, and could have a much more effective response either with police partnered with clinicians or the higher level safety issues, or simply the model like Cahoots or whatever. And we've been talking a lot in the city this last couple of weeks, about how we best convene and undertake that a re-engineering of the safety net services to a non police response.

Chief Manheimer: There is not a police officer you would talk to who does not want to go on a mental health call for service, not because they don't want to help, but because when we go, we are not clinicians. And the most effective in this, I did this in the Tenderloin when I was there I don't know how many years ago, but it was first tier is community based like Macro or Cahoots or any number of other safety



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

net services that are likely already embedded within the community, but not in a coordinated safety net infrastructure.

Chief Manheimer: Second tier would be that sort of net which we have and we are expanding, which are clinicians partnered with officers for intervention. And then the third level is, there's those calls we just have to go to that are hard priority because the individual's already causing a violent disruption. So I am wholly for this. I would welcome the opportunity to... I don't have that much time left here, but this is a huge, huge passion of mine to not criminalize the unhoused and the mental illness and the substance abuse. But there frankly is no one else who makes house calls.

Chief Manheimer: We go to these calls, we do the best we can. And my only problem, and this is what I asked you. I've asked the council and I've asked the city administrator, someone has to go. Of the three, 2000 calls we get a day of which 500 are nine one, one and 50 or so are mental health calls, I would guess it's a lot more. I would guess like you Commissioner Anderson, it may be up to 40% from what I just hear anecdotally. And yes, we don't have great information on breaking those out. But yes, unless and until we actually stand up that other model, we can't just say we're not going.

Chief Manheimer: And so I am wholly committed to this. I am happy to help too. I would start on the fire Chief and the city administrator today, and we would be happy, to have someone else. But the fact of the matter is, those other services aren't out there on the street where the people are. And so I can pledge to you that if we get the attraction to stand that up, and I think macro is a good beginning, but you know, it needs to be part of a safety net infrastructure. I'm sorry to take so much time, but that's really important to think about. This is the moment. And that is the nugget.

Tara Anderson: And through the chair. Thank you. I appreciate it. And interim Chief Manheimer, I hear you. And I just want to reiterate that I don't want us co-opting community voice and disguising this dialogue around calls for service as legitimizing circumstances that you have acknowledged, others have acknowledged police should not be responding to in the first place. And that we need to have the data in order to inform this process. And I look forward to getting those documents, but it's clear that there's a step before deploying an officer. We need a triage process that happens through 911, recognizing there are individuals that exhibit their own bias and prejudice, and are calling upon police to do inappropriate things. We have a responsibility here, and we have responsibility when talking about the issue to not just generalize and further legitimize a structure that everyone is seizing in this moment, and calling into question.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Tara Anderson: What I'm hearing is the community is calling us, and we're just responding to what the community wants. It is so much more than that. I do hope that at a minimum, we can acknowledge that, not just having the social safety net and the replacement. I think there is work that we can do with existing resources that triage and divert current call for service from community and get the appropriate non-police response.
- Regina Jackson: Chief, we have another commissioner. Who's got his hand up. I'm Commissioner Jordan. I'm un-muting you.
- David Jordan: Thank you. Thank you, Chair. Hello, Interim Chief Manheimer.
- David Jordan: A lot of what I'm hearing here is... Parts from what I heard from earlier in the conversation around the unhoused, around the conversation and how that sort of intersects with that conversation around towing and, and the conversation now about stats. What I'm hearing essentially is that there are a lot of things that you agree, and we've all heard this, and this is a nationwide thing that maybe police are not the most appropriate resource to tap to address very specific issues, but that, you're the only one that makes house calls, which is a thing that we hear a lot. It feels like a little bit of a chicken and the egg thing here.
- David Jordan: We know how much of the city budget and the general fund the police force is using, and you're saying, "Well, if we have these other resources, we would utilize them. We'd be happy to utilize them. We'd be happy to step back and focus on things that are more strictly determined to be appropriate for an armed individual to respond to." But, where does that come from? Where do we find the resources to develop those programs, if we have a finite amount of money. I agree with, with Commissioner Anderson, I think that there are ways to leverage the money we do have, and use it more efficiently and to start the process. But to suggest that, "Well, we just have to keep the status quo. We just have to maintain because we're the only ones doing it."
- David Jordan: If we stopped doing it, then things will completely fall apart. I agree, that removing the police altogether is not the answer, but we need to start making a very determined, progressive move towards moving that funding into both elements that are going to address our current issues around substance use, substance users, homelessness, mental health, but also long-term forward-thinking solutions that address those things so that we don't have those amount of challenges on the street constantly.
- David Jordan: You know, we talk about it's been said, and I'm not the first one to come up with this, but we talk about how well, "It's really challenging the idea of defunding the police, because they're the only ones who are the safety net", but we've



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

been defunding all of these other social services for decades now, as if that that was not an issue at all.

David Jordan: I think that we really need to, like Commissioner Anderson said, start thinking much more creatively about how we can use the city budget and some of your budget included to start developing both problems to address acute issues and long-term issues. That's all.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Jordan.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner... I mean, excuse me. Police Chief, I see that some of this information that you were talking about in terms of the calls is up. I wonder if you want to speak to this, and walk us through this document.

Chief Manheimer: Yeah. I think I wanted to show you that we do, even though our systems are outdated and our website is really core, I will just say that, and I think we need to really work on that. That's one of the things I do want to do while I'm here. We're actually starting to work, and that's another presentation we'll bring you another time to show some of the initiatives and some of the work we're doing.

Chief Manheimer: To Commissioner Anderson's point, we do have this information and this is updated. This is out of our crime analysis. I would love at some point to have any, or all of you Commissioners come a risk management meeting that we do with a tremendous amount of data from ShotSpotter, from CeaseFire, from analyzing calls for service, from looking at where we have the tremendous need, to how we're applying the right amount of levers for both crime and for intervention and prevention. I did want to share that it's not all bleak. That we do have some good data, and that I'd welcome any, or all of you to one of our risk management meetings, where we do parse out and analyze the data.

Chief Manheimer: To your points, though, all of you, this is not good enough. We are still trying to get other data, but I wanted to share with you that there's much more data, that we're happy to... Over time now that we have this opportunity to get about 10 minutes of your time, can bring you little pieces of. Analyze them. What they mean for our workload, for our volume, how we are applying resources, and then go from there to invite you to a CompStat or a CeaseFire meeting with us.

Chief Manheimer: I wanted to show that briefly, and unless anyone has any questions, that will be in all your packets and Commissioner Russe. I mean, Mr. Russe-

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harris does have a question. I'm un-muting her.

Chief Manheimer: I'm sorry. Go ahead.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Ginale Harris: Thank you. I would take you up on going to one of those meetings. You've said that we have a not so good data collection system. I'm interested to know how you guys are analyzing data, if you can't even get it? [crosstalk 01:13:41]
- Chief Manheimer: No. Commissioner Harris, I meant with our CAD data that we cannot parse out. You see at the bottom of the screen here, it says priority 1 and priority 2 calls.
- Ginale Harris: Yeah.
- Chief Manheimer: We can't go in and show how many of those to, exactly on point to Chair Jackson, which of the 415 public disruption calls are for drunkenness, or for landlord tenant, or for a disruption in the street, unruly conduct. We can't parse it out like that.
- Chief Manheimer: Our data collection in terms of crime, and ShotSpotter, and CeaseFire and racial stop data, discipline complaints, all those things that we do in risk management, in our crime meetings, all of that is of a very high caliber. Higher than I've seen in most departments, large, medium, or small.
- Ginale Harris: Right.
- Chief Manheimer: That's the data I was talking about, that I'm very impressed, for an agency this size that they have that. It's been very important for a lot of the NSA data, in terms of reducing disparities and stops, in terms of-
- Ginale Harris: Chief, can I stop you right there?
- Chief Manheimer: Yup.
- Ginale Harris: Sorry for interrupting, but I'm going to forget my question.
- Ginale Harris: My question to you in regards to the CAD, I know that 73% of those calls come out of East Oakland. I believe that I sent you, asking some information on budget cuts, because my concern was, is that we already don't have any resources in East Oakland. My concern is that more... I don't want any resources to be taken from East Oakland because we already don't have any. 73% of your service calls are out of East Oakland, and we still cannot get a police officer out here.
- Ginale Harris: I have been on a ride along, and I rode with an officer for about 6 hours. He was very nice. We only got to 4 calls in 6 hours. That's 4 calls in 6. They were all the level 1, those high level calls.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Ginale Harris: One of our calls, we were at a grocery store where 4 police cars were there for a woman who walked out of the store with the Capri Sun. I don't know if you know what those are Chief? But, those little sippy drinks-

Chief Manheimer: I know them well. My kids love them.

Ginale Harris: Okay. So, we were there for almost an hour and some change. A technician came out. The manager didn't even show up. We were wasting all of these resources on a Capri Sun call. That [crosstalk 01:16:39] me a lot. I want you to know, I'm not clear on how we're determining which calls you go to.

Regina Jackson: Prioritization. Yeah.

Chief Manheimer: Can I just say Chair Jackson, because this is really important. I was quite stunned and really concerned about the disparity of resourcing in BFO too, for East Oakland in those areas. Because, from the day I got here, I noticed this tremendous, we get it and you all make it a too, how many calls are holding? How many calls are standing when you're not even taking priority 3 calls. What we've done working also with Council Member Taylor is, we put an extra squad in East Oakland last week in East Mont station. We have another squad coming out of the field training next week. That is going there. And I've vowed that if that doesn't do enough, we are going to do a workload study and we will get more resources in there. Because, I cannot fathom that people would be waiting a day or two for a priority 3 call report. I cannot fathom that there would be times when you call 911 and someone doesn't respond. That is absolutely a change Chair Harris. I just wanted you to know that.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. We also have two more hands up, Commissioner Prather through followed by Commissioner Brown. I have un-muted you Commissioner Prather.

Edwin Prather: Thank you, Madam Chair. Through the Chair, I would like to ask the Chief, there's been references to a lot of shortcomings of our department since... or identification of shortcomings of our departments, since the Chief has been with us.

Edwin Prather: Specifically, I've been jotting some notes down that our dispatch system needs an upgrade, our website needs to be upgraded. There are staffing disparities in different zones. I'm wondering if we can get... For one, let me say that, that's very disconcerting to me because what have we been doing for the last few years? Because this is the first I'm hearing of this.

Edwin Prather: It's really surprising that someone who came... Excuse me, Chief for characterizing you in this way. Someone from the outside comes in, and can



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

immediately identify shortcomings, and problems that we have within the department. No one's ever mentioned a problem with the website. I may have heard problems regards to dispatch, but never with a type of clarity that the Chief is raising in this particular meeting.

Edwin Prather: So, through the Chair, I would like the Chief to provide for us a list of the things that have been identified as shortcomings in the department since her arrival, because it sounds like there's a to do list or to be fixed list. I would like to know what those things are, and where we are falling short on the job.

Edwin Prather: I'd like the Chair to perhaps asked the Chief, how long that may take. It may be something that exists already, and it is simply provided. If there's any confidentiality in regards to it, I'd ask it be provided to us in a manner consistent with whatever needs to be kept confidential, because there are maybe public safety issues involved. But, it is something as we oversee the department that I think is very important that we have in front of us as soon as possible.

Chief Manheimer: Shall I... Just very quickly, I think there is benefit of someone coming in with a fresh set of eyes. I can say that we are working and should have our new CAD system in probably within, what do you think, 6 or 9 months. That's a huge issue. We just got a whole new Vision and Slalom database, where we're going to have dashboards, that are going to become the focus of our website. They are going to have everything from stop data disparities to, calls for service, to all of these things that will let our community know the business of our department and how we're doing in it.

Chief Manheimer: There's a lot of good things in the hopper as well. There's always a to do list in any police department because if we're not innovating, we're falling behind. We're for standing still, we're falling behind. The rate and pace of technology from... any one of you are accomplished individuals in your own, whatever your own sector is, and you know as well that the rate and pace of change, is one that we need to keep up with, and this department does. But, clearly there are a lot of projects in the hopper.

Chief Manheimer: I have some great ideas about things that I could do in my short time here, frankly. I can note those things and, we are working on all, and a lot of them. My job really is to position the department well. A lot of it within trusting relationships with our NSA, getting us into compliance and making sure those other projects move ahead. I look forward... I'm excited to get our website up to speed because that is one thing that I have some background in and that I have some staff to do with.

Chief Manheimer: I'm happy to put a list down of my goals. In fact, Chair Jackson and I talked about, it's just been so crazy that we haven't had a chance to sit down and



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

really, in my couple of months that I've been there, do an assessment of where I think the department is. Goals moving forward. I'm here for an interim time period, as I hope a good steward for not only this department, but to really increase that communication relationship with you all. That's number one priority.

Regina Jackson: So, Chief Manheimer, I know that you just spoke about the goals, but hopefully we can have you also identify the challenges, and will I be able to get that within a week?

Chief Manheimer: I don't know about within a week I'm Chair Jackson. We are in an extremely intense, extraordinary emergency operations, extended period. We have demonstrations each and every day, and we are in the middle of real budget, hard discussions. So, if you'd allow for a couple more weeks to focus in on the budget.

Chief Manheimer: I have three city council meetings coming up focused on that. I know this meeting for you, and then we have the use of force. I'm certainly happy to pencil out interim goals, but I'd hoped it would be a bit of a longer conversation. So, I make sure that I'm meeting, and we're meeting your goals as well.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So, if today's June 18th, I can make sure to have that information by July 7th, correct? I mean, July 9th.

Chief Manheimer: Yes. Madam you got it.

Regina Jackson: Okay. We'll write that down. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: And, I'm sorry, but I'm Alternate Commissioner Brown's hand was up. It has since come down. I just want to make sure that his question has been answered. You're un-muted.

Chris Brown: Thank you Chair. Yes, my question has been answered.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So, given where we were, and you were walking us through the calls for service, I think that you can continue Chief Manheimer.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you. That's it for that. You'll all have the packet to absorb further and feel free to ask any through the chair, any further questions, either offline. Then I can answer to all of you in a, do not reply email so that you all can get those answered and/or I'm available for one-on-ones, or to come back and respond.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: Mr. Russe, if you could go back to that first sheet, for the very last category, we'll be done with that. Then I wanted to give you an overview of where the rest of our budget stands. The last-
- Regina Jackson: Before you get started.
- Chief Manheimer: I'm sorry. Go ahead.
- Regina Jackson: I'm sorry. Commissioner Harris raised her hand. You're un-muted now Commissioner Harris.
- Ginale Harris: Thank you. I had a quick question, Chief. So, we get... I think we're on the 63rd or 4th report or something like that. I pulled up one of our reports. Let me pull it up. I pulled up one of our reports where, there are tasks that are supposed to be achieved. One of them was technical assistance in our 63rd report. It addresses the database called Vision, which is task 41, and several department policies as well.
- Ginale Harris: I'm interested now to know while you were putting your budget analysis together, did you refer back to any of these reports?
- Chief Manheimer: We embed these reports in our every day staff meetings. I am standing up now a professional services unit that is going to be absolutely focus number one, on the compliance within these tasks. Vision has been one that has been extremely challenging between city IT, and our department, and the vendor, and all of the things that go wrong with a technology product problem. It tends to highlight the fact that we're struggling with it.
- Chief Manheimer: I will say that is a city IT led project. Peterson has been the lead on that one. But yes, we go through these every single day. We go through either our bi-weekly compliance updates. We do have an IMT site visit. I'm on the phone with the monitor probably twice a week. They're very top of mind.
- Chief Manheimer: Is there anything in particular you wanted in terms of those? The Vision risk management is the city led IT projects.
- Ginale Harris: Right. Well, I remember going to a public safety meeting and I brought a report on Vision. We keep bringing up, "Oh, we have new technology. We have this", and Vision is frowned upon. Vision it was not... It did not have high marks. It did not say, "It's going to take us to a level of where we need to be", and there's a lot, a lot of problems with Vision.
- Ginale Harris: We have spent an excessive amount of money on Vision, and it doesn't work. That is my thing to you, because you weren't here, and in all fairness, you



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

probably didn't know that. I don't know if anybody told you that, but I took it to a public safety meeting, because somebody stood up from the department, and harped on how great it was. I had a document in my hand that said, "No Vision is not... It doesn't work. Vision is not good."

- Ginale Harris: I wanted to say that, because I want you to see this is the dog chasing its tail.
- Chief Manheimer: Yeah. I agree with you, Madam Commissioner. I have been around to enough departments and enough different positions to know that technology implementations are at best a rocky road, and when the technology itself is rocky and requires so much personalization... It's had a poor rollout.
- Chief Manheimer: What we're finding now, because I brought it to a very high level and met with city administrator, IT director and the monitors folks, because I was hearing the same things you were hearing from the troops, as well as the frustration level. I don't believe it's ideal. I do believe however, that the fixes are in specific reports that need to be written.
- Chief Manheimer: We have right now, and it blows my mind, about 80 of them that need to be written over time. I have prevailed upon city IT and city administrator to actually hire some temporary people out of like a Robert Half type organization, just to write the darn reports and get them out, so we can get some fixes in.
- Chief Manheimer: What is exciting is over Vision, what the platform and foundation of Vision affords us is Slalom. And Slalom are these really cool dashboards of where we are, where we stand, they're searchable, they're relatable. They will turn our website and our transparency, and our ability to really get data that's meaningful and manageable upfront. So, Vision is kind of that underpinning, but it has been a rocky, rocky implementation. I will agree with you ma'am.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you [crosstalk 01:29:54] Manheimer.
- Regina Jackson: I have Mr. Peterson, who was on the line. He wanted to be able to make a statement.
- Chief Manheimer: Great.
- Regina Jackson: Go ahead. You've been on un-muted. Mr. Peterson?
- Andrew Peterson: There we go.
- Regina Jackson: Sorry.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Andrew Peterson: Hi, this is Andrew Peterson. I'm the CIO for the City of Oakland. I'm just listening into the Commission meeting and I'm hearing some conversation or discussions about the Vision system, and I guess its applicability or its viability as a system for the City of Oakland.

Andrew Peterson: I guess I would have to disagree with the Commissioner and her characterization, and also the acting Chief in their characterization of the system. Vision is a very good system. It has some issues, as all software products have issues. We are working through those issues, but we're collecting data we've never collected before. We're aggregating information from 7 or 8 different operational systems that the police use every day. We're pulling that information together. We're correcting data issues that have been put into the system because of lack of data validation in the the systems that were used before. Lack of standards, that were using the systems before. And, through these efforts, we now have the ability to look at police behavior, police performance, department of the report, whether it's at the department level, whether it's at the area level, the squad level, the individual level. We can look at everything in the department from a 360 degree perspective.

Andrew Peterson: I don't think we've ever... I know we've never had that capability before. You talk about the cost of developing the system. Prior to Vision, there was a system called Prime. The city has spent, I don't know, \$5 to \$7 million on Prime. That system was inadequate. It went live probably 2 months after I started, and in my 4th month I decided that it was unworkable and needed to be rewritten and redeveloped.

Andrew Peterson: The system that was born out of that is the Vision system with its risk management dashboards. It was done at a 3rd of the cost of the Prime system. I'm not quite sure where you guys are getting this information, or your facts, but I would gladly come before the Commission. I would gladly show the operation of the Vision system from the transactional side, which is called Vision, where the officers put in their information and where we aggregate information from the trainee system, from the personnel system, from the records management system, from the field based reporting, where we pull all that information together, we make information available to the police department or to administration that's never been available before.

Andrew Peterson: I can then take you from that stage and where we move into what we call a data warehouse. We're able to again, look at a 360 degree view of the police department at all levels. We're able to drill down from the department level, to any other unit level that we have. We're able to look at individual officers. We're able to compare those officers to their peers. We're able to look at their supervisors. We're able to look at over time, year over year, day over day, week over week. We can then ask a variety of questions. So, I'm not sure where you



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

guys are getting this information, but it's incorrect. And again, if asked, I can come to a Commission meeting and answer any questions, as it relates to this system.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Mr. Peterson. I do have a hand up by Commissioner Harris. I'm not sure if the question is to you or to Manheimer, but I'm going to un-mute her.

Ginale Harris: Thank you. It's actually to him. Thank you Chair.

Ginale Harris: My information came from a data report that I pulled up. It was online in regards to Vision. I brought it to a public safety meeting. So, it's recorded.

Ginale Harris: We have never been introduced to this system. I've been a Commissioner for almost 3 years now. When I first came on, we were promised a data system that would share information between the CPRA agency and IA agency. Mr. Russe is on the line, and he can give you more information which I am, through the Chair, hopeful that he can, in regards to what was supposed to be. As you stated, we spent millions of dollars on the data system Prime that didn't work.

Ginale Harris: I feel like what authority does our city think they have to waste millions of dollars on something that doesn't work, and then start all over. Tell us it works. We don't know about it, or we've never been given the opportunity to know what it does, because the report I got was that it's no good. And clearly, it's not doing what it's supposed to be doing because our Chief of police says it's not, and she works there.

Ginale Harris: So, that's a concern to me. I don't know how much it costs, but I do know that the CPRA spent... Mr. Russe can you tell me how much we spent on Prime?

Regina Jackson: So Commissioner Harris, my suggestion is that we have Mr. Peterson present to us at an upcoming Commission meeting so we can get clarification, and introduction to all the bells and whistles it's supposed to bring, and whatever challenges that we've been to date.

Ginale Harris: Very good. I wanted to give him a brief history, because we probably started around the same time.

Regina Jackson: Okay.

Ginale Harris: I don't know if he knows what we know. I wanted to share, we were supposed to be sharing data, and to date, we should be sharing data. I don't think that's happening. So, I will [crosstalk 01:36:11].



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Andrew Peterson: Through the Chair, Ms. Harris. There's a difference between technical issues, and bureaucratic issues. The fact that you're not sharing is not a technical issue. The fact of the matter is that, the Vision part of the system didn't go live until November of last year. The analytics part of the system will go live in the next two weeks. We are in training right now. Training supervisors in the force on how to use the analytics portion of it.

Andrew Peterson: Again, I'm not sure where you're getting your data. I was here when Prime went live. It went live a couple of weeks after I started. I made the decision that Prime should be scrapped, because of the way it was architected. I did not make the decision to develop Prime. I did not make the decision to spend the money that was spent on Prime, but I thought it was in the best interest of the city, to scrap it, rather than throwing good money [inaudible 01:37:06], and to build something that was going to meet the needs of the city and get us compliant with the NSA requirements.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Mr. Peterson, we will follow up with you to see when we can bring you before the Commission, so that we can get a full overview on Prime. Like I said, it's bells and whistles, and what challenges you've had to date and what ever additional understanding that we will be able to use, and see dashboards and all kinds of stuff. Does that work for you, sir?

Andrew Peterson: It does.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. We have Commissioner Brown's hand. I am unmuting you.

Chris Brown: Thank you, Chair. Mr. Peterson, is it correct then that I can call your office and meet with you or somebody in your office about the details of your implementation?

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Brown, I think that it might be most useful to have Mr. Peterson come before us all, so that there aren't any redundancies in terms of the presentation that he might give.

Chris Brown: Alright, I'm interested... Okay. We'll start with that. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much.

Regina Jackson: Okay. I think we're going back to Chief Manheimer for the last one or two sections that are currently up on our screen.

Chief Manheimer: Yes. Thank you so much. It was great to see Peterson here. We were actually very excited that the Slalom dashboards, that I was talking about, that I think



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

are going to bring both our website, our transparency, and our ability to have a user interface that will be much more smoothly accepted, is going through training right now. We have training going on in Eastmont, and with our admin staff. That is going to go live and I think people will really start to see the value of the aggregation and collection of all that data once we get slalom. And it would be great to get a demonstration for you all from Pete or whoever else would be best to do that. I'm not as familiar with the program, but it's a wow factor to be able to have that much data. I think that will be something that you all will have access to as well. So that is it. My last category here is mutual aid and the chair I think had a question about the cost of mutual aid and how that works. There is no cost for mutual aid. It's provided through our regional mutual aid coordinators, which is there's nine regions in the State of California under the statewide umbrella. Our region's particularly large.

Chief Manheimer: It goes from the Oregon border through Monterey County on the sort of the West side of the state. There is no cost. However, what happened in the last three or four weeks since there were such a huge draw on the need for mutual aid because of the large size of some of the demonstrations, some of the looting, we ended up having to go outside our region. If we do do that, and for instance, our mayor was able to go directly to the state OES and the governor and we were able to get additional resources here on some of those nights we had the looting issue. We were able to get some, but we had to pay for their housing. Luckily our city has some contracts for housing and some of the hotels right now because of the COVID, had an opportunity to house some individuals, but generally there is no cost for that, as we agree to provide resources to others when they need them as well. So that was it for that question.

Regina Jackson: Chief, I do have a question on that. It's only because of what I've been hearing around the City of Berkeley and their decision not to use tear gas and the sheriff responding that they would not support them in an area of mutual aid. Am I to understand that when you call out for mutual aid, that the negotiation starts then around what kinds of force you will use? It sounds like the sheriff's got some bully tactics going on and I just want to clarify my understanding or make sure that I'm not misunderstanding.

Chief Manheimer: Yes, thank you. We did actually get a letter from the sheriff as well as the marshal. So there's two forms of aid, there's state and then there's national. And we called on both during these last several weeks of our operational period. When you go for mutual aid, the understanding is that if they come into our city, or any city for that matter, that they end up bringing the tools and the equipment that they are trained with because we don't have enough of our equipment to provide for them. Generally, and I will tell you, we got over 500 officers a couple of times in the last couple of really dangerous periods, and so



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

they have to bring the equipment, the training and the skill that they have with their equipment.

Chief Manheimer: So really, if you're going to say to mutual aid, you either say you want the personnel and the equipment, or you say you just want personnel. If you just want personnel and they're not allowed to bring their equipment, most any agency would not come because they're not able to protect themselves and stand up on the line. So the problem is-

Regina Jackson: But my question-

Chief Manheimer: So I'll just tell you, for our county, while the sheriff said he would not provide the mutual aid, he didn't say, "Because I'm the mutual aid coordinator you can't have any resources in the region," but all of the chiefs in the cities have decided that if we are not allowing them to have their own equipment, say the tear gas or whatever it is, they would not be coming to our city. So I think that's where I think things got a little bit misunderstood, but both the US marshal as well as the sheriff had advised that if we were not able to use gas and smoke, and again, those are last resorts only when we have unruly and disruptive crowds that are aiming projectiles at the officers. If they're unable to protect the officers with the tools that they have, they would not be coming to assist in our crowds.

Chief Manheimer: I want to say that we haven't had mutual aid a lot. We've had four or five demonstrations every day, peaceful most of them with the exception of last Friday night up in the Temescal District, but generally peaceful, some rambunctious. We have not had to call on mutual aid. When we do call on mutual aid, it's generally because there are riotous and disruptive looting, arson, and that is when they need to come and bring their equipment. If a city does not allow them their equipment or does not allow the use of tear gas, they would not be coming into the city. That's where I think all of the cities in the region are clear on that and most of the regions in the state are clear on that. We would have options of National Guard or the state has a State Guard, but those generally require about 24 to 48 hours. I know San Francisco tried to get them about two weeks ago and they couldn't get them because they need about 24 to 48 hours.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Chief Manheimer.

Chief Manheimer: That's mutual aid.

Regina Jackson: Questions. That's Commissioner Jordan followed by Commissioner Harris. You've been un-muted Commissioner Jordan.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- David Jordan: Yeah. Thank you, Chair. So Interim Chief Manheimer, I do have a question. So I do understand what you're saying about the equipment and their cooperation or their aid being contingent upon them being able to utilize equipment even if it is against our municipal, our city ordinances. I do have a question about command and control during crowd control elements. Who is in charge? Is there one central command or are Sheriff's Department officers being led by Sheriff's Department leadership and OPD is being led by OPD leadership? Do they have communications? And who's making those decisions? Clearly we had mutual aid during the protest a couple of weeks ago and it seems as though there were Sheriff's Departments and we still haven't gotten the report back about who is potentially responsible for using gas and sponge rounds and CS flash bangs and things of that nature, though, I presume we will be getting that report soon. I do have a followup question about policy after you answer that.
- Chief Manheimer: I'm looking at Chief Armstrong here and he will answer that. I think that I'm looking forward to a larger discussion with you all and I'm not so sure this is the forum to do it on crowd control and the policy and the use of gas. We do have more of a presentation, but I'll turn it over to Chief Armstrong for just that question there, if I could, Chair?
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you.
- D.C. Armstrong: Yes. [inaudible 01:46:50] the chair. So our policy requires that when mutual aid agency comes to support the Oakland Police Department, they first check in in our staging area. We give them a briefing of our use of force policy and then we ask them what munitions they've brought with them. We do log those munitions that they have. Then when they're deployed into the field, they are given a, what we call Pathfinder. So an OPD supervisor or command personnel with an OPD radio goes along with that agency and they communicate directly with OPD when requests to go to a location or ensuring that they have direct contact with OPD.
- D.C. Armstrong: So that Pathfinder stays with that agency the entire operation that they are supporting the department. And the other question you had around who commands, there is an overall incident commander for each operation, OPD incident commander, usually at the deputy chief level for a large scale event and we have a full command structure that is consistent with the incident commands structure. So that is filtered all the way down into the field, as well as that commander does have complete command over mutual aid resources as well.
- David Jordan: Okay. So when there's a decision to be made about how to respond to an action by the public or in a specific instance, there isn't action taken until that watch commander has made the call about should we engage these particular



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

resources? I understand that correctly? And they're not responding off the cuff. They're they're asking for there to be advised about how they should respond?

D.C. Armstrong: Yeah, so there's two different ways in which that occurs. So typically you're right. The incident commander makes the decision as to what actions we would take related to crowd control. The only caveat to that is the exigency circumstance, which is that if one of the officers were to come under attack or have a bottle or something that would be a risk to their safety, they can deploy in order to maintain their own officer's safety or the safety of even a protestor or someone else. So typically the incident commander by policy is the one to make the decision unless there's an imminent threat to the officer from the outside agency, and then they can deploy for their own safety.

David Jordan: Okay. Thank you very much, Deputy Chief. I agree with Interim Chief Manheimer that we should have a much more robust conversation about crowd control policy and when that exigency circumstance maybe kicks in and what that looks like in addition to a whole variety of things. My second question was around policy. So for instance, we have a standing policy on use of force and we have a potentially new use of force policy upcoming. When we have outside police agencies acting within the city limits, I presume that they are not guided by our policy. How is that negotiated? I'm thinking specifically here around our use of force policy around shooting at moving vehicles and the case that happened recently where the CHP shot that individual in a moving vehicle. I know that there was potential extenuating circumstances there. I guess I don't really need to debate that. Maybe that's a thing we can discuss later, but how does that policy question matters is my question.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you. So really the reason an agency would be in another city, right, is either through mutual aid or through a mutual taskforce or through investigation that brings them into the other city as happened with the CHP. And each agency is held to its own policy and they are investigated by their own agency to ensure adherence with their own policy. I will tell you, in the State of California, most agencies have fairly similar policies. They either use Lexipol, which has about 98% of the agencies, or as in our case, we use, because we have the NSA and other policies we've developed, we use those. But everyone is held to their standards, their policies, their practices, and they're held to those in adherence.

Chief Manheimer: So when we're on a task force, for instance, and we might do a pursuit, whereas another agency might not do a pursuit. When we are in a mutual aid, we ask, as Chief Armstrong said, that that agency comport with our, with our policy, but there are exigent circumstances where they might find themselves, as in the case of one night where they were standing on the scrimmage line, if you would, in our downtown area so we could get out to East, Deep East Oakland,



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

and other places that were having the horrible looting and the other issues. So it's very fungible circumstances, but the agencies in this county have some countywide protocols as well, so that we take care to try and develop those.

David Jordan: Okay. Sorry, just one last thing and I will move on. I am concerned. I just actually went through the use of force policy training with Sergeant Turner literally just a few weeks ago, a couple of weeks ago, and there was a long conversation about the potential exigent circumstances involved in shooting at a moving vehicle. Based on my understanding of that, what happened with the CHP and the Eric [inaudible 01:53:12] situation seems like it is not consistent with our policy. And I do. I just want to say for the record, I'm very concerned that there are potentially police agencies working within city limits that have policies that are not fungible with ours, that are actually fairly different and potentially that puts our citizens at risk. But that is all.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you very much, Commissioner Jordan. It was a question that I raised two and a half years ago about the meetings for intra-agencies because we have many different policing entities inside open. We have got to be able to know that as we adjust policies that there will be a process by which they will also either follow them, acknowledge them, respond to them, what have you, but that's a different question for another time. We have three hands up, Commissioner Harris, followed by Brown, followed by Mr. Alden. You're unmuted Commissioner Harris.

Ginale Harris: Thank you. So it is my understanding that when we get mutual aid that comes into the City of Oakland, they do not have to abide by our rules, our policies or our ordinances, and that is a very big concern for me. The concern is, is that regardless what is happening, I watched to the protests and there were some different things that I saw. My concern is, is that they come in, they terrorize and then they leave. These are not their citizens. These are not their people that they deal with or taxpayers. They have no connection to us whatsoever and so they do whatever. And I found their actions to be harmful and hurtful to the people that live here.

Ginale Harris: I keep hearing this talk of the looting and the this and the that, and there were a lot of peaceful protesters from Oakland, right? We all know that outsiders come here and do stuff like that. I don't know who was doing that, but there are professional agitators that come to the City of Oakland just to do that. I do know that. However, going back to the mutual aid, I am totally against it. I don't think that they should be allowed to come into our city and assist us if they are not going to follow the rules that we put in place for our own officers. Why would we say yes to let an outsider to come in and do what they want to do in our city when we don't even allow the people who police us and protect us to do that? So that is a concern for me. I do not support mutual aid.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Harris.
- Chief Manheimer: Did you want me to respond or just take the rest of the questions?
- Regina Jackson: Please do respond.
- Chief Manheimer: Do? You said do?
- Regina Jackson: Yes ma'am.
- Chief Manheimer: Okay. All right. So it's our hope that we never have to call mutual aid. What we saw over several nights of 200 businesses being looted, most of Chinatown not having a business that was not vandalized, no pharmacies available throughout the entire city, shootouts in our marijuana dispensaries, shooting at the officers, shots of the federal officers. You are right, Chair Harris, I don't have the number and addresses of where these agitators and disruptors come from, but they come in and they would work under the cover of demonstrations and take advantage of all kinds of situations. We did not, sorry, if we did not have mutual aid during those times, I think we would have seen widespread swaths of destruction in our city. It is not our desire.
- Chief Manheimer: We don't have a lot of other agencies who just come in here and do their policing. It's generally when a crime leads them here. For the CHP that evening, it was one of the stolen Dodge Chargers out of the Dodge dealership in San Leandro. So I'm going to take a break and have a drink of water, but it is our hope not to, but I would say that if we did not have mutual aid, Chair Jackson and Commissioner Harris, we would have a world of hurt in our city.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. We have followup questions from Commissioner Brown, then Mr. Alden, then Commissioner Anderson. Commissioner Brown, you're un-muted.
- Chris Brown: Thank you very much, Chair. Chief, and this is actually to the chief, to the deputy chief, and if he would like to respond, to Mr. Alden. Under CPRB we had a case where we had mutual aid with the city of Hayward. They came up and there was a complaint against them for search and seizure. The complaint was made through the CPRB and by the time it got to the point where it was investigated, it was discovered that the actual officer involved was not an Oakland officer. So we had to decline to make any action on it because it was out of our jurisdiction. At the same time, enough time had passed that it was impossible to get Hayward involved in discipline for this officer.
- Chris Brown: So the entire matter, there was no path for the person who had clearly had her rights violated to get any kind of relief from any of the people involved. So we



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

asked at the time whether there was a way somehow for the hosting department to have some way to initiate or carry a complaint to another department and have that department accept that complaint so that having mutual aid does not cut off people's right to have violations addressed.

Chief Manheimer: Sir, I'll start with that, sir, because I fully and wholly agree with you. Yes, any complainant that we would get that was an outside agency, that would be passed along to them and for any ... So my experience with say the Vehicle Theft Task Force, if there is an issue or violation with an officer who's on that task force in our city, that will go to the agency of record and they will absolutely investigate that. There is no reason, and I would guess that Hayward likely did their own internal investigation if he was being investigated here. I also would say that the individual who complained should have also been advised, go to Hayward and complain about this officer.

Chief Manheimer: So for instance, let me just take, so you all understand the CHP officer-involved shooting, and I'll just briefly lay out for you that there is an internal investigation being done by CHP determining, similar to CPRA or what we would do in IAD, was this officer's use of force, or multiple officers, consistent with their policies, within those policies and practices? We then do the underlying investigation for the district attorney. So it happened in our city. We document, we memorialize, we take statements and we turn all that over to the district attorney and the district attorney is charged with determining the legality of the lethal use of force. So just so you understand, there is almost always, there would be, should be, and is an avenue in which they are held accountable in their own agency regardless of what city it happens in. I hope that was clear and answered that.

Chris Brown: It did leave one question, which was as the hosting agency, I'm not sure that people who are dealing with the police have the time or the focus to differentiate between whether it's a Hayward patch on somebody or an Oakland patch on somebody. When they assume it's their city, it's going to be an Oakland officer. So is there a way to, and maybe this goes to Mr. Alden, to find out whether these ought to be forwarded and to take responsibility for forwarding these kinds of complaints because we are the people who invited them here in the first place?

Chief Manheimer: I'll answer first and then I'll defer to Mr. Alden because I'm not familiar with how CPRA does it, but absolutely. So we investigate until we determine who the officer is and then it will go to that agency, unless of course there's some criminal violations that need to be investigated in a different manner or there's an underlying crime that we need to investigate. But absolutely for us, at least, and I'll let Director Alden speak to CPRA. Yes, that would go forward to that agency for sure. That's generally sort of a chief-to-chief call.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Chris Brown: Perfect. Thank you so much. Mr. Alden, did you have anything?
- Regina Jackson: Mr. Alden?
- John Alden: No, I don't have a whole lot to add other than to say I agree with Chief Manheimer that it would be appropriate for us to forward that complaint on to the agency to employed the officer. And also let the complainant know that officer's from a different agency and explain it to that person, to that agency. We have done that in the past and it may be in some of these protests cases that the same happens. And Commissioner Brown, I think you make a good point. Many people honestly don't know when they have a negative experience with a police officer which agency that officer might be from. They just know that they're in the City of Oakland where it happens and so naturally they call the CPRA and let us know about it. And we're happy to help them get in touch with that other agency.
- John Alden: It is one of the things that's tricky about agencies operating in the City of Oakland, other than Oakland Police Department, like CHP or their agencies might be from elsewhere, and it is also another thing that is very tricky about mutual aid situations, but we do try our best to make sure we get the complainant to the right agency.
- Chris Brown: Thank you very much.
- Regina Jackson: Mr. Alden, was your hand up to ask a question, respond to an answer? I just want to make sure that I don't pass over you to get to Commissioner Anderson if you've been in the queue, as I think you have been.
- John Alden: Very kind of you. I would be happy to go after Commissioner Anderson. I did have a budget-related question, but I think I'd rather have the commissioner go first, if that's all right.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Very good. I appreciate that. Thank you. Commissioner Anderson, you've been un-muted.
- Tara Anderson: Thank you, Chair Jackson. And through the chair to Interim Chief Manheimer, I just want to bring us back to budget and clarify my understanding that outside the instances where we need to go outside of the region for aid, this is no in the moment real costs to us. Save when we go outside the region, you gave the specific instance of recently where housing needed to be provided and other funds were leveraged to do that. Then I'm hearing that the real compromise comes down to our values and policy and what we've held our officers to as a standard is, is potentially compromised in the negotiation for aid and that we've essentially been given notice by the marshal and the Sheriff's Department that



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

they will not assist in providing aid if we make certain policy decisions as a municipality.

Tara Anderson: I find it extremely concerning that the same agency that has indicated they'll refuse aid if we make a policy change that's within our values as a community, that they are the coordinating entity to then issue the additional aid. So there are significant policy implications here that I'm hoping that we can address next week when we convene, but I guess maybe to keep us on topic of the budget here is understanding the lawsuits and liability that comes from inviting outside entities to hold the line as it were, when they harm someone in our community. While we've discussed how we might go about investigating that conduct and what our responsibilities are, who at the end of the day are they suing and who's paying for that?

Regina Jackson: Chief Manheimer.

Chief Manheimer: Yes, thank you. So we will have a deeper dive discussion on this. I think that when we call for public safety, they come with the equipment they have and if there are complaints, we follow the complaints wherever they go. If those complaints are to be handled by our agency as we handle our complaints now, we are handling those and our uses of force. They handle those, theirs and their uses of force. We have some. We don't negotiate. Either we get the mutual aid or we don't, but at the same time, we do have some level of opportunity about where we place and how we control the tempo and placement of different individuals, right? Unless it's a highly disruptive, highly mobile exigency circumstance, we generally have opportunities to try and have influence around how we place and how we conduct things.

Regina Jackson: Mr. Alden, your hand is up. I've un-muted you.

John Alden: Thank you, Chair. Chief Manheimer, about the crossing guard issue that you brought up early in your presentation, if I'm following you correctly, your proposal is to move the crossing guard unit from the police department over to Department of Transportation for a savings of 2 million. If I'm understanding you correctly, the cost to the City of Oakland would remain the same. It's just that that \$2 million expensive meant from the police department to the Department of Transportation budget? Am I right about that or is there some other reason why the city would actually save some money on that?

Chief Manheimer: I'm not sure exactly. That was a recommendation from city administrator. That money would come out of our budget. I'm not sure what level of overhead and how much need they have for the use of those. With the Safe Streets Initiative now, there may be a lot less that they're doing in terms of the need for controlling the crossings. So that's really something you'd have to ask through a



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

city administrator through the Department of Transportation, which is a newer agency just really stood up and now they're trying to aggregate all of those related services under that agency.

John Alden:

Okay. I am gathering that we're not sure exactly what the total savings to the city might be. Fair enough. The reason I ask is that I'm trying to make sure I'm distinguishing between changes that we might make to the police department's budget that would actually free up funds for some other purpose as opposed to expenses that are just moved as a line item from one department to another within the city, such that there isn't a net savings. In that regard, as we were talking just now, and I apologize for not bringing this to you sooner, but it occurred to me during the presentation tonight that at our previous meeting, I believe it was Sergeant Smith was telling us about recruiting at the police department and how this might be a good time to switch from doing police academies to train brand new recruits who have never been police officers before over to lateral academies where we'd be bringing in officers who've had some experience somewhere else and would therefore require less training.

John Alden:

And I might add, we have the advantage of finding out whether they had any problems with the previous agencies too so [inaudible 02:09:55]. I would imagine that would create some savings and if I recall, I think that Council Member Kaplan had asked about that a few weeks ago. That seems like a net savings to the City of Oakland. Are you considering moving to the more lateral academies, particularly as officers get laid off from other agencies in the next few years, it strikes me as a substantial area of savings.

Chief Manheimer:

Yes. Through the chair, Director Alden, my discussions here with staff are that we have not had great luck with laterals in the past, recognizing there may be a different market now, as other agencies may start layoffs or other issues. We have had lateral openings for recruitment for the past year and a half and I've had six individuals that entire time. I don't think of those there would be any enough that we'd be interested in hiring that actually would start at lateral academy. Yes, you're right, you save about half the time. I'm really simplifying right. Half the time in the academy, maybe half the time in field training. You're right, we know more about them. I will say that most departments, experiences with laterals are generally that if someone's unhappy where they are, they bring themselves with them and they tend to get unhappy where they go.

Chief Manheimer:

That's a really horrible, it's a generalization that doesn't mean that the market won't change and we'll see a lot more laterals. So we certainly are keeping it open and we do have openings right now. I know we're always assessing the market. So you bring up a good point. There would be savings there and a documented history. As you know, I think it was Council Member McElhaney and a couple of other council members who just did a really nice resolution on



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

banning racist practices and hiring and selection throughout the city, and particularly the department. And I worked with them on some of the hiring and selection practices, so we're open to it. I haven't seen us attract a lot of lateral interest.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Chief Manheimer. I have a question how many officer days just OPD spend on mutual aid to other cities? Do we support mutual aid to other cities?

Chief Manheimer: Generally when we do it's for large scale, the wild land fires, I know we'd gone up to Santa Rosa a lot, we've gone to other areas around the fires. We do get called to Berkeley and we do... But generally, I have to tell you, Oakland attracts an awful lot of the demonstrations, and that says a lot for us in a good way, right? Because Oakland values and tolerance, but at the same time we tend to be very heavy in our needs for mutual aid, more than going elsewhere. But we've done quite a bit on the fires.

Regina Jackson: When we've done that, how much time have we spent there? How many officer days? Because I recognize that there's a cost associated with that.

Chief Manheimer: Yeah. I don't think... I think it's fairly... I'm looking to... Chief Armstrong, did you want to speak to that, sir?

D.C. Armstrong: Yeah. Typically, if we were to go locally, like Berkeley, it would be in most cases, a one evening event and what we do is an assessment of what available resources we have, we do not take away from our patrol resources, so we will continue to maintain our level of staffing to respond to emergency calls in the city of Oakland. Then if we have a group of other resources we'll gather them together and then take them as mutual aid officers to another city like Berkeley. But, to the chief's point, we rarely end up going because we seem to be the epicenter for most protests. When it comes to fires, like the major fire in Sonoma County that happened last year, where it was a statewide request for mutual aid, we sent officers to support that for multiple days, so I believe we had been there for maybe a week or two supporting that in Sonoma County. That was because they were desperate to have agencies assist from across the state, but we only sent, even in that instance, our traffic officers.

Chief Manheimer: Send it again.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. Two questions, commissioner Brown followed by Commissioner Harris. Commissioner Brown, you've been un-muted.

Chris Brown: Thank you, chair. Chief just a brief clarification aside from the information that's available through a Senate bill 1421 disclosure. What other information can you get on an officer from another department to use as part of the hiring decision?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Excuse me, Commissioner Brown, that actually is not part of the agenda. We're really supposed to be focused on the budget.
- Chris Brown: All right, thank you so much.
- Regina Jackson: Can we ask that question at the next commission meeting, perhaps.
- Chris Brown: Absolutely. Thank you so much.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Harris you're un-muted.
- Ginale Harris: Thank you chair. Chief Armstrong you said something that I'm interested in, in regards to when we send people to do mutual aid or help in other cities. Now I've been a commissioner almost three years now, and we have never been fully staffed to where our city is secure in its services. I know that we staff... We brought up the staffing when the Warriors were here, and all these sports teams, and now they owe us money. I'm just interested to know how we can afford to send people to a fire, which I'm sorry the fire happened, but again, we are not covering ourselves in Oakland. You can't even get to the stuff we got going on here. How are we affording to send our officers somewhere else? Whether it be Berkeley, or to the fire or, to the Giants game, or wherever, how can we do that?
- D.C. Armstrong: So commissioner do the chair. When a mutual aid request comes in just like all the cities that come in and support us, I think we use more mutual aid in any city in the Bay area. They all come and support us. When the request comes to the department, again we do not use the resources that are assigned to our patrol division or responding to emergency calls, but we will put a call out for officers that are willing to volunteer to go on overtime, to go and support that mutual aid effort. It really is something that's important because when the need for us as an agency who frequently calls for mutual aid, or I mean when we're in need of it, it's reciprocated by them coming to support us. So really the call doesn't come very often where we have the resources to send, but if we can gather up a group, we will send them.
- Ginale Harris: Right, and my point in being is that we have never been fully staffed, right? So I think one of our focuses needs to be on fully staffing our department, so we are not dependent on other departments, which they say mutual aid is free, but what we send our officers somewhere it costs the taxpayers overtime money for police officers to go somewhere else and help them when they don't even help the citizens that pay for them. You see what I'm saying, again it's the dog chasing the tail.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: So Mr. Harris, I would suggest one thing though, it is such an uneven equation for the couple of days that we would go to sort of put money in the bank of exchange if you would, the amount of leverage that we get for all of the... We have Juneteenth tomorrow with maybe 15 to 25,000 people, we have not pulled the mutual aid button, I hope, and we all hope we don't need to do that. It's peaceful, it's manageable, but we know we'll get it because we will pay back to the others when they need it. And there's no [crosstalk 02:18:38].
- Ginale Harris: I understand that [crosstalk 02:18:42].
- Chief Manheimer: Yeah.
- Ginale Harris: Chief I get it, I hear you and I hear the concern. However, my point being is that we need to get on our j-o-b and why aren't we fully staffed?
- Chief Manheimer: That's a good question, thank you. I'm with you on that. We are very aggressive in trying to fill these next two academies. We have one academy filling right now. We have good prospects for our next academy, I'll bring you some of that demographic data.
- Ginale Harris: I get that part, we have people coming in, but I'm just saying this is past practices the dog chasing the tail.
- Chief Manheimer: Yes.
- Ginale Harris: You're spending money to service other people who help us, which we appreciate, but we shouldn't need the help like that.
- Chief Manheimer: Actually the Chair Harris, just FYI for you, all of those statewide deployments are reimbursable, so we were paid back for the overtime cost because when we send people either on duty or overtime you're exactly right, we have to backfill them. We have to cover our neighborhoods, but at least for those wild land fires and every time like you heard, we declared a state of emergency here, when you do that you do get reimbursement for you and the responding agency. I would guess that all of the deployments that were wild land fires were all reimbursed.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, chairman. Chief Manheimer I'd like to know if there are any other questions from commissioners so that we can get to public comment.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, there being none. I will turn this over to Mr. Rouse and we will start public comment. We have allotted at one minute per person. Thank you.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you chair. At this time I will open the floor for public comment. We received, excuse me while I share the clock, we received 33 public comments, total public comments, prior to meeting. Those commenters are, and I will list them, Gabriel Cardener, Aviva Cardener, Pamela Nicole Mint, Jennifer Williams, Charlie Mintz, Adrian Beaun, Jillian Silver, Spencer Murphy, Ashley Erickson, Natasha Price, Erica Druby, Andrew Morales, Joshua Mayfield, Isaac Catan, Cassandra Carver, Amber Turner, Josefina Lobu, Connor Carol, Eve Broadly, Christina Miller, Ralph Poem, Devin O'Rourke, Maya Kulkarni, Olivia Lee, Teddy Albinac, Justin Carter, Esther King, Jacob Conn, Bea Von Suelen, Nora McKinnon, Timothy Johnson, Dream Dungeon, and David C Ralston. This time I am seeing 84 hands in the queue, 86, 87, 88. It is skyrocketing. We're up to 110 comments in the queue. I am going to cut the comments off. It's still going up very fast chair. We're at 130, should I just take comments or do you want to provide a cutoff? I'll leave it to your discussion. Through the chair [crosstalk 00:10:36].
- Regina Jackson: [inaudible 02:22:38] off and you didn't.
- Juanito Rus: They're adding faster than I can scroll down, excuse me. I will cut it off at Asha Bora, that is comment or number 140.
- Regina Jackson: Before you get started, Commissioner Jordan has his hand up. Your un-muted. Alternate Commissioner Jordan.
- David Jordan: Yeah, sorry. Before we get into public comment, I just had a quick thing that I wanted to say, I personally highly value public comment, and I think that we all do. I also value the incredible amounts of political will that has developed around black lives and police reform, specifically around violence. And further I value a lot of the grassroots communities that are helping mobilize, specifically the youth, but people in general, a lot of people, who until a few weeks ago, rarely even thought about police reform and they've mobilized them by providing them with talking points that, sometimes specific sometimes very general, around how we should be approaching a reform of the police. I think that, that's helpful for an educational standpoint. I also understand it is a way that grassroots under-resourced organizations are able to move the needle with large slow moving legislative bodies and policy bodies.
- David Jordan: That said, the police commission we are trying to not be that slow moving. We are trying to utilize all of this political will to move the needle. As Mr. Ruth said earlier, all that public comment that we got earlier in written form, I look through it. I think a lot of us look through it and what we saw was it's largely the same talking points from the same organization and that's fine. It really helps sort of crystallize and catalyze what's happening here. But from a time perspective, we don't have all of the time. We have a limited time to actually accomplish things while the group of us are here to make concrete



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

recommendations. Though I want to hear from everyone and I would never want to edit anyone, I want to ask that if you are a person who is intending to just speak to those talking points without something specific or additional to add, maybe rethink how much time you want to take up, because it really cuts into our ability to get the job done. And that's what you want us to do is get the work done. I propose to listen. Sort of repetitive message.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Alternate Commissioner Jordan. So we'll go back over to Mr. Rus and we will hear every comment.

Juanito Rus: Thank you chair. In that case, starting the first name in the queue is listed as Gabriela O. Hello Gabriela, can you hear us?

Gabriela: I'm calling to defund the police and invest in our Oakland community. I stand by APTP's demands to defund OPD by 50%. Invest it into the Blackman deal that will stop the use of violence against protestors and remove CHP from Oakland. The 50% allotment of Oakland's general fund to OPD is shameful and harmful. First it deprives our Oakland black and brown communities from vital services, including education, public health, living wages, housing and youth services. Moreover, our public servants fiscal and epistemological prioritization of police has resulted in the inflection of intergenerational and institutional trauma, upon our black communities, our black trans woman, our brown communities, our unhoused, our neighbors battling mental illness and/or addiction, and our neighbors with intellectual disabilities. So call for the divestment of the people's money from OPD and the funding of alternatives to police led by and for, impacted communities like Macro. Defund OPD, invest in our community and allow communities most impacted by police to lead re envisioned community safety alternatives. As review quantitative data analysis and supportive budgetary allocations, remember that reported disproportionate rates of the use of force against lack of [crosstalk 02:27:14].

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Thank you, Ms. [crosstalk 02:27:20]. I'm going to lower your hand. The next speaker I have in the queue is listed as Mariam Khademi. Hello Mariam, can you hear us? You can un-mute yourself.

Mariam: Yeah, yeah. Hi.

Juanito Rus: You have one minute, whenever you're ready.

Mariam: Okay. Thank you. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Mariam: Yeah. This is Marion Khademi and I urge you guys to defund the Oakland police by 50%, \$150 million, and instead invest that money into passing the full Black New Deal. Reform has not been working. Defund is the only way to go at this point. You need to also stop these of violence of any kind against protesters, including tear gas, rubber bullets, or arresting. It's also important to cut the contracts with the CHP as they brutally murdered Erik Salgato in East Oakland just a week ago. We need to get the California Highway Patrol out of Oakland altogether. Yeah, that's it. I give up the rest of my time. Thank you.
- Ginale Harris: Mr. Rus?
- Dean Welliver: Hello? Can you hear me?
- Ginale Harris: Where you at Mr. Rus?
- Juanito Rus: Excuse me, I was muted Mr. Welliver you are un-muted, you have one minute whenever you're ready.
- Dean Welliver: All right, thank you. Hi, my name is Dean and I'm a resident, taxpayer, and voter here in Oakland. I'm here today to ask you to stand with the community and recommend the City Council to defund OPD's budget by 50%. We really need to reinvest these funds into resources for the community like Macro, The Black New Deal, affordable housing, education, youth programs, restorative justice programs, and crisis response teams to operate independently of law enforcement. It's time for us to rethink the way that we do public safety. We need these resources to keep our community safe. I yield the rest of my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. I will lower your hand in the queue. The next speaker I am showing is listed as Kyle Garrett. Hello Kyle, can you hear us?
- Kyle Garrett: Hi there. Yeah, I'm here, thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready.
- Kyle Garrett: Okay. My name is Kyle, I live in district two. My comments, a little bigger picture. Mayor Shaft recently emailed me regarding the defund OPD demands saying quote, "Oakland can ill afford to further defund its police department. As we already have the lowest officer per crime staffing levels of any department in America." But this framing misses the point. Officer per crime is only relevant in so far as what we criminalize. Where we're talking about when we call for defunding the police is a re-imagining of what public safety can be. Crime is defined impacts the marginalized among us and becomes a racist by its implementation. We placed too many solutions under the blunt instrument of policing, and this is what we reject. We need a full scale decriminalization and



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

demilitarization effort via budget cuts and a re-imagining of what it means to be a community and how everyone can thrive within that re-imagining. Smarter people than me have lots of specifics on this and Oakland's chance to start is now. I urge you to act strongly as [crosstalk 02:29:06].

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Garrette your time is up.

Kyle Garrett: Thank you.

Juanito Rus: We'll lower your hand. The next speaker I'm showing him the cue is listed as Carrie McCray. Hello Carrie, can you hear us?

Carrie McCray: Yes, I can. Thank you so much. I just wanted to first off thank the commission, especially in moments like this, having citizens like you advocating on our behalf is invaluable. Based on what I've heard, the commission say tonight I feel really heartened by the commitment to change that has been spoken by the commissioners. There's no question that we're in a historic moment and an opportunity to make real change in our city and the world, and moments like this call for bold and courageous action. In the wake of the murder of George Floyd, Minneapolis will disband their police department and create a new system of public safety. Minneapolis has the same population as Oakland. They know their system is broken and they're doing something about it. Are we going to wait for the next George Floyd in Oakland before we start taking this problem seriously. Because without significant change, it's just a matter of time before it happens again. You know this. We need real change. Let us not have the need for a perfect plan stand in the way of bold action. De-fund OPD at least 50%, nothing less is sufficient.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. I will lower your hand in the queue. Next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Nicholas, Nicholas Elizabeth Phoebe. Hello Nicholas.

Nicholas Elizabeth Faby: Hello. I'd like to talk to you about the risk of violence being used against peaceful protestors. I am not bringing I'm... My niece and my nephews are, they cannot safely protest against police brutality, not because of any outside agitators or protestors, but because of police. Because they could have tear gas fired on them or rubber bullets, even though they're out there protesting against the police brutality that could end their lives, they could be subject to violence at that very same protest. I also want to speak in favor of defunding the police and allocate more money towards Macro. I have personal experience as someone with mental illness who was hospitalized using police, and it shouldn't be a police matter it should be a public health matter, and nonviolent, and non-coercive. Thank you.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Juanito Rus: Thank you. At this time, I will lower your hand in the queue. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Rebecca Ruiz. Hello Rebecca, can you hear us?

Rebecca Ruiz: I can. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Rebecca Ruiz: Hi, I'm Rebecca with anti-police terror project. I wanted to urge the council to look into APTP Sacramento's Mental Health First program created through the leadership of the most impacted or remains more autonomous from the city. Unlike Eugene's Cahoot's where mental health calls are fielded through 911 dispatchers that often refer calls to the police when callers directly request Cahoot's. Police presence during a mental health crisis can escalate a situation. I also want to urge the commission to support justice for Erik Salgado murdered by CHP and Brianna Colombo pregnant and shot by CHP in the abdomen in her hands. I know you don't want to say we have no jurisdiction over CHP, but this is the culture of police terror that flourishes when police aren't held accountable, when police funding is prioritized in the budget before adequately funding services for say pregnant women and children, APTP is pushing for at least 50% cut to OPD. She herself just said that 40 to 50% of 911 calls are social service calls. So it seems like we might be in agreement on one thing. I see my time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. I will lower your hand in the queue. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Joe Miller.

Joe Miller: Hi, thank you. Thank you for this opportunity to address the group. The main point I want to try to make and impress upon you is that I think this conversation tonight has been really way too deep in the weeds for what I'm hearing and seeing from the community as I'm out and engaged in civil disobedience with the community. Tonight we talked about crossing guards, abandoned cars, and who's paying for mutual aid. When people in the street are asking for massive reform of this system of policing that we have in this country. That includes the racism that's fundamental to how it's set up, and includes the excessive use of force and violence in situations that don't call for it. Instead of talking about all the details of that, what we're asking you to do is to take big strides, bold motion, cut 50% of the funding for the police department, sort out the details later, that's going to send a message the community is waiting for. If we don't do that, you can Expect more, and more, and more civil unrest and frustration from the community as we watch slow [crosstalk 02:36:14].

Juanito Rus: Your time is up. Next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Tova APTP. Hello Tova can you hear us? T-o-v-a you can un-mute yourself.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Tova: Yes. Hi. I actually am on the same tip as the person who's just spoke before me that we're talking about major transformational change in the police department, which basically says that policing our way to public safety is not where it's at. It's a racist and white supremacist system that we need to get rid of. On the short term, we know we can't get rid of it right away, but what we do need to do is put that money, 50% of the OPD budget, into community services where the money is really needed, and that's how we're going to keep ourselves safe. That's how the community gets to keep ourselves safe, not by nickel and dimeing, and throwing around the stuff in the weeds as the previous speaker talked about. So please defund OPD by 50%, \$150,000. I mean million dollars, sorry. Yes. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Semina Huseman. Hello Semina. You and um-mute yourself.
- Semina Huseman: Hello, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Semina Huseman: Hi, my name is Samina Huseman. I'm the government relations coordinator for the Council on American Islamic Relations. I am urging the commission to... I'm urging that we reduce funding for the Oakland Police Department and move that funding towards more beneficial services, such as mental health services, housing, youth services, restorative justice, that could be better suited in order to serve the community rather than the militarization of the Oakland PD. I also urge the police commission to pass the militarization ordinance to ensure that we reduce or even eliminate these military equipment from Oakland police. And I recede my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Daniel Rovello. Hello, Danielle, can you hear us?
- Daniel Rovello: Yes. Hello good evening. My name is [crosstalk 02:38:59] thank you. My name is Daniel Rovello and I'm a resident of district three, and a member of the Anti-police Terror Project and the Justice Team's Network. We were a community partner of the development of the Macro program. I'm here to ask the commission to join the thousands of Oaklanders who have marched in the streets, emailed or called demanding that city council defunded OPD by at least 50%, invest in The Full Black New Deal, cut the contract with CHP, who brutally murdered Erik Salgado just a week ago, and stop all violence against protestors. OPD gets almost half of our general fund every year, while vital programs get scraps. It's absurd, and it's obscene, and it's got to stop. The people are very clear, we want \$150 million cut from the OPD budget, this budget cycle. We were also a part of the Macro program and we believe... And the community is



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

very clear that it should be entirely independent for law enforcement and designed by and for the most impacted communities. That model exists, it's called MH first in Sacramento, and I encourage the commission to base the Macro model on that model. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Kevin Cantu. Hello Kevin, can you hear us?

Kevin Cantu: Hi. I feel like this commission today has been getting rope-a-dopes instead of discussing crossing guards for two hours, just start picking a percentage and start cutting everything in the Police department's budget. Forced them to prioritize instead of asking the public to justify the replacement of every single cents purpose in the budget. Crossing guards, are you kidding? If we must micromanage their budget for them because they don't collect enough data to justify any of their decisions, then let's focus on ending racist murder by cop. Take their weapons away, take their cars away, take their knees away, do things to actually change the way policing works in Oakland. Now we can be leading this trend, leading this change, be a beacon for other cities to follow. Do that.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Reba Hsu. Hello Reba, can you hear us?

Reba Hsu: Yes, I can. I stand with APTP's demands to defund OPD by 50% and invest that money interventions that actually keep us safe. I am a student mental health clinician who has seen firsthand how Oakland's underfunded social service organizations, desperate [inaudible 02:41:39] . We need our community support. We do not need enforcement, we need prevention. We know that the only way to reduce police violence is to reduce the scope, size, and role of OPD in our community. We will not eliminate police violence through transferring out the crossing guard unit, analyzing the breakdown of calls for service, implementing slalom dashboards, or improving a vision risk management system. We will not eliminate police violence through incremental reforms. Given the OPDs failure to achieve tangible cultural transformation, after nearly two decades of federal oversight, we have little reason to believe that OPD will implement meaningful for reforms now. The police department is fundamentally rooted in structural racism and we cannot let Oakland's progressive exceptionalism lead us to believe that we're somehow immune to that.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Audra. Hello Audra, can you hear us? You can un-mute yourself at this time. Audra? Very well I will lower your hand in the queue and move to the next speaker. The next speaker is listed as Edward Lipton. Hello Edward, can you hear us?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Edward Lipton: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you.

Edward Lipton: Hello. Thank you. I'm an Oakland resident of district three commenting on item 4C. It is my understanding that your recommendations total to 25 mil or 8% of the current \$330 million police budget. This isn't an acceptable number to start with and negotiate down from when the interim police chief herself guesses that officers don't feel qualified to handle about 40% of their calls. The police department have proven that they are incapable of giving an inappropriate response to handle their current duties. So resources must be allocated towards those that can. And your on site on towing they made it clear they think excessive armed escalation is a necessity. This is how innocents gets shot to death. This is why the people risk their safety in the streets to get y'all to hear that Black Lives Matter. You must carry the same passion for the public to support you, but the inability to properly meet this moment will only lead to further disillusionment and insight demands for radical change through radical action. I yield the rest of my time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Yes. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Grace Iyer. Hello Grace, can you hear us? You can un-mute yourself.

Grace Iyer: Hi, can y'all hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Grace Iyer: Great, thank you. Hi, my name is Grace Iyer. I am the program and site coordinator at Girls Rock Camp. I believe you all have already heard all of the facts and opinions you need to know that defunding and start abolishing OPD is the only viable path to justice for black and brown people in Oakland. You also have the wherewithal to understand that Oakland will not stop resisting until you meet the demands of the APTP and Bob. At best, you were in denial and at worst you were intentionally invested in the terrorizing of black and brown communities. Regardless of whether you are ignorant or evil, you are complicit in upholding white supremacy. Fuck OPD, fuck y'all fuck police reform. I yield my time.

Juanito Rus: The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Laura Bekes. Excuse me if I mispronounce your name. Hello, Laura, can you hear us?

Laura Bekes: Hi. Yes, can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Laura Bekes: Hi. I called in tonight to stand with APTP and demand that the commission and the city council defund the Oakland police department by at least 50%, invest that money into passing the full black new deal and cut the contract with CHP and remove them from Oakland. The amount of public dollars we pour into OPD and the violence and terror that OPD and that's on black and brown communities are obscene and unjust.
- Laura Bekes: I know OPD is diverting desperately needed resources from housing, parks, restorative justice, and other vital services that actually keep our communities safe and healthy. A budget is a moral document that reflects our values, and we cannot continue to put our limited public dollars into a police department that abuses and terrorizes our most vulnerable communities.
- Laura Bekes: Why are we even asking OPD to tow cars, to respond to mental health crises, to terrorize unhoused people, to tear gas protestors. Why are we asking OPD to weigh in on their own budget overhaul? When the people have clearly spoken that we want them drastically defunded. As you've heard here tonight and seeing every single day at night of protest, if you do not defund OPD and reinvest in the community, you'll be going against the wish-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is up, I'll lower your hand. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Justin deWolfe. Hello, Justin, can you hear us?
- Justin deWolfe: Yes, I can hear you.
- Juanito Rus: You have one minute whenever you're ready.
- Justin deWolfe: Hi, I'm Justin deWolfe. I live in District 1 and I'm calling tonight for you to defund OPD by a minimum of 50%, \$150 million. We need to pass a full black new deal. We should not be tear gassing protestors or using that type of violence. We need to get CHP out of Oakland because they're murdering our communities, and we need to be funding community programs like Macro, and education, and youth programs. I yield my time. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Chair, I'm seeing a hand raised on the panel. I don't know if you want to go to the panelist.
- Regina Jackson: I've already handled it. Thank you very much.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: But I do want to clarify that we really appreciate public comment, but we really would like folks to refrain from using obscenities.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you, chair.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is lifted as Erica Morris. Hello, Erica, can you hear us? You can unmute yourself, Erica.
- Erica Morris: Hi, my name is Eric Morris. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Erica Morris: Great. Thank you. Thank you for having me and for hosting me for this comment. I'm a resident of Oakland and I'm here with APTP. I'm here to demand that Oakland city council de-fund OPD by at least 50% and reinvest in the community by re-diverting these funds into providing living wage jobs, housing for all, youth programs, health care, restorative justice, and other essential community services.
- Erica Morris: I'd also like to direct a comment to the earlier mentioned by alternate commissioner, David Jordan, regarding repetition of public comments. Our comments are repetitive because these events are repetitive and Oakland is lucky enough to have strong local organizations harnessing the power of our residents to voice these concerns.
- Erica Morris: It's your jobs to listen to each and every one of our comments, no matter how much they echo each other, as we live through echoes of the same violence against our black and brown communities. I yield back the remaining seconds of my time. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Sharmini Subramaniam? Hello, Sharmini, can you hear us?
- Sharmini Subram...: Yeah, I can hear you. It's actually, Sharmini Subramaniam. I'm calling to request that the commission defund the OPD by 50%, by this \$150 million and to reinvest in the community. And by community I don't mean just like putting the label of community policing or community programs and just setting on more armed police officers under the guise of a community program.
- Sharmini Subram...: And also to stop using any kind of violence against protestors. The deputy officer mentioned that protestors who are only provoking folks were met with tear gas and bullets. I can attest that as not correct. I've seen several peaceful protestors being attacked minding their own business, children being attacked with rubber bullets and tear gas, and also to defend from the California Highway Patrol, or end the contract. All right, I yield my time.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Shill Sinha. Hello, Shill. Can you hear us?
- Shill Sinha: Yeah. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Shill Sinha: So first I want to thank the commission for reading all the public comments and listening to them. So, and I wonder you to iterate how certain it is that OPD takes almost half of Oakland's general fund each year, while there are many different areas that we can be investing that money in. So I want to urge city council to defund OPD and reinvest in the community on housing programs, parks, libraries, virtual services.
- Shill Sinha: And I also want to echo commissioner Anderson that I am disturbed by the lack of publicly available data on how the police works. Like us relying on data from 2018 is unacceptable, we can't continue to do that. We need to be informed. The public has a right, we pay for OPD, kill my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Rafa J. Hello? Rafa. Can you hear us? Rafa J?
- Rafa J: Hello?
- Juanito Rus: Hello. You have one minute. Whenever you're ready.
- Rafa J: Thank you. All right, when leaders are out of touch with the needs of their most vulnerable people, not all people suffer equally. It's easy to take a slow crawl toward reform when you aren't the one being harmed by the system. But make no mistake the message that the casual teams of American genocide, these same groups of people who are targeted in every other fascist country, the message that we receive every day from all of the rest of you, is that you're only willing to help us up to a point.
- Rafa J: Only when it doesn't rock the boat and you can keep the power and status that makes you feel like you're doing better than we are. But if we can't get rid of a terrorist organization hiding in plain sight, the one that has tried to suppress every liberationist movement to date, these Oakland police, how on earth are we supposed to survive the white nationalists and male supremacy groups that currently have federal oversight and a clear roster of members.
- Rafa J: Listen to us, look to poor people to learn what doesn't work in society. We're the ones who have been failed, and we're telling you who abolished slavery and



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

all of its forms for us. We are telling you to stop making us homeless, I'll resume best at the next comment.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Natalie Lyons. Hello, Natalie, can you hear us?

Natalie Lyons: Hi. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute whenever you're ready.

Natalie Lyons: Hi, my name is Natalie Lyons. I'm a resident of Oakland. I stand with the community and I'm calling for defunding OPD by 50%. I would like to speak to alternative commissioner. Jordan's comment that the public shouldn't repeat the same talking points so you all can "do your work."

Natalie Lyons: I think you need to hear these comments from every single one of us. This meeting was supposed to be about the budget and the only substance of response that I heard and I've listened to the whole meeting was \$2 million for crossing guards. That's less than 1% of the total police budget.

Natalie Lyons: It's like, you all are not listening to the community. This community needs an overhaul of policing. No more talking, no more scheduling time for talking. No more assurances, no more half measures. The city's enormous investment in policing has not made communities safer. OPD itself is the threat to Oakland's black and brown communities. It's time to defund, it's time defund now and by at least 50%. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Kalya. Hello Kalya, can you hear us?

Kalya: Hi. I'd like to echo what everyone's been saying to defund the police by at least 50%. Currently the community wants full defunding in the longterm and 50% needs to be what happens now. We have a police chief here tonight who is clearly much more troubled by affinities and "horrible looting" with just property damage that can be rebuilt.

Kalya: And thinking violence against peaceful protestors, mass incarceration, which is incredibly oppressive and ruins lives and families, police brutality, and the murder of innocent, black and brown people that we can never get back. Do you even know that tear gas is considered a war crime by the Geneva convention?

Kalya: Why is this woman even weighing in on the police budget? Why are you having these micro level conversations instead of the big picture conversation? And yes, it is absolutely disgusting to try to suppress public comment. We know that



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

maybe some of you don't want to hear this, but this is what the community is crying out loud in the streets for you to hear.

Kalya: So you're going to have to sit down and listen. And frankly, I don't even think you should be allowed to cut off public comment. I think you should have to hear from everyone. Ideally a thousand of us-

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Sangeeta Sarkar. Hello, Sangeeta. Can you hear us?

Sangeeta Sarkar: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Sangeeta Sarkar: Perfect. My name is Sangeeta and I'm a resident taxpayer and voter here in Oakland. And I stand with the anti police terror project demand to defund Oakland police department by 15% or at least \$150,000. I also want to respond to the alternate commissioners comment that many community members are speaking on the same talking points from the same organization.

Sangeeta Sarkar: I think it's something to be proud of that so many people can clearly unite on the exact same policy demands. Also, we listened to you all talking about towing cars in Mutual Aid for two hours. So you can give us the same respect. OPD gets about half for a general fund every year. And I believe this is a ridiculous amount. We should instead fund the black new deal and specific public health interventions like social services, maternal and child care, domestic violence and homeless shelters. I could go on and on.

Sangeeta Sarkar: I also heard it brought up in this meeting that about 40% of police calls are from mental health crises. So I believe the police department is actually in agreement with APTP here. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Anne Spevack. Hello, Anne, can you hear us?

Anne Spevack: Yes.

Juanito Rus: You have one minute.

Anne Spevack: Hi. I am an Oakland resident in District 1. I'm on the line in support and solidarity with the anti police terror project, the 150 other commenters on the line tonight and the thousands of Oakland residents who have called for deep cuts to OPD, reinvestment in our communities and a reimagining of a policing system.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Anne Spevack: Tonight, the chief guide you in a discussion about crossing guards, towing vehicles, and Mutual Aid, aka blaming outside officers instead of OPD. While these issues are important, focusing on them in this moment is a distraction from the day to day abuses of power that implemented this movement.
- Anne Spevack: So far, the commission and council have utterly failed to address these concerns. I don't know why you let the chief come in and set the agenda designed to distract you. It's time to take some leadership, stop focusing on the margins and actually start talking about what we are going to do to fix our broken police system. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Jasmine Fallstich. Hello, Jasmine, can you hear us?
- Jasmine Fallast...: Hi, yeah I can.
- Juanito Rus: One minute? Whenever you're ready.
- Jasmine Fallast...: Thanks so much. Good evening commissioners. It's really frustrating I think for us, when you say that you don't want to hear us repeat the same talking points. Can you just for a minute, imagine how frustrating it is for us to listen to you lot quibble over crossing guards? You don't press interim chief Manheimer when she fails to answer any cost question with an actual number, and then he spends half of a budget meeting, rehashing Mutual Aid that was discussed last meeting when there's so little time left to work on the budget.
- Jasmine Fallast...: So we're here to comment on the work that you're doing, but in the 2.5 hours that we were listening to your meeting, you didn't do any work. The chief came with a single page document with a total of 2 million line item move, which is not good enough. Where are your proposals? Where is your leadership? Where's your-
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Anne. Hello, Anne, can you hear us?
- Anne Janks: Yes.
- Juanito Rus: You have one minute. Whenever you're ready.
- Anne Janks: Chief, your statement that jurisdictions hold officers to their standard and the here it says naive. The worldwide insurrection that began with the murder of George Floyd belies your confidence that other jurisdictions are holding their officers accountable. Lexipol is written to provide officers in jurisdictions wiggle room to justify their actions.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Anne Janks: Oakland should refuse aid from jurisdictions that have inadequate policies or enforcement to protect residents from excessive police use of force. You said that we would have been in a world of hurt in Oakland without Mutual Aid. In Oakland, we have recently been in a world of hurt that you have blamed on the Mutual Aid from other jurisdictions.
- Anne Janks: On house residents are having your vehicles towed frequently often tell him officers that the car is someone's only home and fill up their belongings. The policy is not working on officers do not stop towing vehicles when they're told they belong to unhoused residents. I would ask the commission to please be and to meet with homeless advocates and address the woefully inadequate towing policy. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Alyssa Michaels. Hello, Alyssa, can you hear us?
- Alyssa Michaels: Hi. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you, whenever you're ready.
- Alyssa Michaels: Yes. So firstly, I want to comment on what previous callers have commented about, which is it is your responsibility to listen to public comment. We are all saying the same things because we demand the same things and the fact that you want to cut off public comment, because you don't want to hear it is frankly, just really shitty.
- Alyssa Michaels: The other comment I want to make as the person who is like don't curse at people, I'm sorry that we are angry, that the black community is getting murdered and you care about tone policing. We don't care. I want to see Oakland PD 100% abolished. I think that 50% is not enough.
- Alyssa Michaels: I want to see all of your jobs gone. Just listening to what you've said in the last two and a half hours show shows all of the institutional racism, and how you police the unhoused, and everything that you've done just shows that you are incapable of having any sort of reform. I yield the three seconds.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Emily. Hello, Emily, can you hear us?
- Emily: Hi. Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Emily: I also want to address alternate commissioner Jordan. The people are repeating their message because you are specifically not doing your work. Commissioner Harris is correct in that OPD is just chasing its tail like a little puppy, but you're pulling your people along with you and we're not happy about it.
- Emily: To interim police chief Manheimer and deputy Armstrong, you are missing the point and have wasted all of our time. We don't want your petty details and obfuscated information. We have zero sympathy for you, and it is arrogant for you to ask for any sympathy from us. It is disgusting that you were anything less than honest with us.
- Emily: With few exceptions, we have done an excellent job over the past few weeks, proving that we do not need you. Listen to the demands of the people, APTP and so many other deeply invested partner organizations. You know what they are and they do have plans. This is not occupy, we're all saying the same thing. You're making life more dangerous and traumatized every single person in the country. We want you out.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Brit R. Hello, Britt. Can you hear us?
- Britt R: Yeah.
- Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready
- Britt R: Hi. I'm in District 4, I was of the obligation that my talking points are from a specific organization. And the call for police abolition and the ending of a white supremacist police force build from a legacy of slave patrols is a national one. I would argue that the anti-police terror project and de-fund OPD, get their talking points from us, the community and have done the priceless work of community organizing that speaks for us.
- Britt R: I do not speak for them. They don't know who I am, but they do speak for me. I would love it if you could develop some courage and conviction to stand by the city's values and begin to speak for me too, because right now you're not even close.
- Britt R: What I want to know as a freethinking Oakland resident is how anyone in the city can say black lives matter when 70% of our houseless population is black as a direct result of systemic racism. And you're telling me, we have to argue about [inaudible 03:03:37] which brings only \$6.64 million in the homeless solutions. \$6.64 million budgets ago. Thank you.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Allie. Hello Allie, can you hear us?
- Allie: Yes, I am here.
- Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready?
- Allie: Hi. My name is Allie Bach and I live in District 4 and I stand with APTP. I want to say that these public comments have often said more in one minute than you all have discussed in the last two and a half hours. So I do suggest you listen and hopefully learn something. I'm an educator and I'm here because I care deeply about my community and our young people.
- Allie: Our community is not being kept safe by the violent, racist and corrupt Oakland police department. We can best keep our communities safe by providing living wage jobs, housing for all, youth programs, health care, restorative justice, and other essential community services. I am urging to defund OPD so that those most impacted by police terror can instead have investments in fulfilling futures.
- Allie: The interim chief said that there aren't mental health models on the ground instead of police and use that as an excuse to further their involvement in mental health crises, they are not equipped to deal with and actually escalate. But I want to point to MH first in Sacramento, which is a mobile crisis response model that operates independently of law enforcement and was assigned by and for impacted communities. Defund OPD by at least 50-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is up. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Bella Cooper. Hello, Bella, can you hear us?
- Bella Cooper: Hi. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Bella Cooper: Awesome. OPD takes almost half of Oakland's general fund each year consuming desperately needed resources from housing parks, libraries and other vital services. Investment in policing has not made us safer. OPD remains an embarrassment to the city in a lethal threat to Oakland's black and brown communities. We demand that you guys defund the Oakland police department by at least 50%, but also implement abolition policies as defunding is just the first step.
- Bella Cooper: We also demand that you invest the money from defunding OPD into passing the full black new deal. We also want you to stop the use of violence of any kind against protesters, and you can follow suit ... In following suit a Berkeley and



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

ban tear gas indefinitely, and also cut the contract with the California Highway Patrol who brutally murdered Eric Salgado in East Oakland a week ago.

- Bella Cooper: And remove them completely from Oakland, we can best keeper community safe by using the people's money to provide living wage jobs, housing, youth programs, health care, restorative justice, and other essential community services.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Jennifer Tu. Hello, Jennifer, can you hear us?
- Jennifer Tu: Hi. Yes, I can.
- Juanito Rus: You have one minute?
- Jennifer Tu: Thank you. Madam chair, commissioners. My name is Jennifer Tu, and I'm a resident of District 3. I support cutting the OPD budget by at least 50%. Tonight, I'm very concerned that a number of questions you asked chief Manheimer didn't get a straight answer. In particular, I noticed that questions around numbers for large budget items weren't answered.
- Jennifer Tu: Like commissioner Anderson's question about how much is spent on Mutual Aid. The only numbers we've heard have been the 2 million spent on crossing guards, which is a tiny fraction of the OPB budget. Could we get some of those big budget questions answered so that the commission can make a data driven recommendation on how to cut their PBS budget?
- Jennifer Tu: We need that budget cut by at least 50% so we can fund city services like mental health, housing, education, and programming for the youth of our city. Thank you all very much for all of your hard work in safeguarding the younger generations of our city. Mr. [inaudible 03:07:27] back to you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Connor Carol. Hello, Connor. Can you hear us?
- Connor Carol: Hi. Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.
- Connor Carol: So after listening to the interim police chief Manheimer, it's all more evident that we need to be thinking larger and more systemically. We need to disincentivize the over-criminalization, which creates a positive feedback loops and necessitate more police. And re incentivize community supports with health care, housing support, education, jobs, and training programs.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Connor Carol: The only way to do this is to defund OPD and to redirect that money into those programs. If we keep kicking the can down the road, we will never take the actions necessary to address systemic racism and police violence. Thank you and I yield my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker. I'm showing in the queue is listed as Benjamin Norris. Hello, Benjamin. Can you hear us?
- Benjamin Norris: Hi. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Benjamin Norris: So, I mean, first off, I don't usually speak to war criminals, but I think it's really important to call in demanding the defunding of OPD by least 50% possibly and hopefully 100. We need to support the black new deal, we need to stop the use the violence of any kind against peaceful protestors, we need to get the California Highway Patrol out of here.
- Benjamin Norris: We have to keep our community safe. And I really want to say like, I cannot believe that somebody got fucking lambasted for cursing on this stream when we're talking about the ...
- Juanito Rus: I'm sorry I was muted. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as TK. Hello, TK can you hear us? TK can you hear us?
- TK: me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you, but your internet connection sounds like it's dodgy.
- TK: Hello, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: That's better. You have one minute.
- Justin deWolfe: I just want to say this is the fact that the very euphemistically named Mutual Aid that gassed and attacked peaceful protesters was housed in housing allocated for COVID-19, probably for unhoused residents of the city is shocking and egregious. And the fact that the police can't account for their \$300 million budget is evidence alone of the fact that they're not worthy stewards of it.
- Justin deWolfe: And the only line item that was really saliently discussed was \$2 million. That's so marginal as to be offensive. The chief spoke about standing up wraparound services, social services to take some of the services they're currently executing. The police really shouldn't be involved in standing up those bodies. They need



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

to be independent of the police because the trust has been irrevocably broken. I yield the rest of my time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Zoe Sandoval. Hello, Zoe can you hear us?

Zoe Sandoval: Hi. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Regina Jackson: So I just want to say ... Like cutting the mic on someone who cursed seems like a violation of free speech. So someone on your legal team should look at that because it is unacceptable that you just did that. I just really want to say that Manheimer's performance tonight was ridiculous. She ... They, I don't know, didn't show us anything from the budget.

Regina Jackson: We talked about crosswalks \$2 million, we need bigger change. People are asking for 50% because clearly these people don't know what they're doing with their money. They're paying for settlements of sexual assault. They are paying for overtime. Cut the budgets because they are not going to let you, Oh my God, what kind of agenda did we even see today?

Regina Jackson: It really is laughable and ridiculous, but it's not because black people are dying. Black lives matter, defund OPD and fuck-

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Becks Hicks. Hello, Becks can you hear us?

Becks Hicks: Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Becks Hicks: I was struck by something that Manheimer said that we acknowledge that we are not best equipped to deal with a majority of 911 calls, that have to do with mental health and have to do with vulnerable community members. However, we need to respond to these calls. And so until that is in place, we cannot defund. We can not step aside.

Becks Hicks: This is the time for bold action. This is the time for saying, okay, well, we're not going to wait for something to be in place before we seed some of our enormous budget. This is the time to say, okay, then let's activate what that looks like now. Put the money into developing as you said, a system.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Becks Hicks: There are lots of social services on the ground, but there is not a system that links them together right now. That is what you should be focusing on. Defund Oakland PD by 50%. Please listen to the people, it's genocide, it's urgent.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Sarah Grebe. Hello, Sarah, can you hear us? Hello, Sarah. I see you've unmuted yourself, but I can't hear you. Hello. At this time, I'm going to lower your hand because it looks like you have a technical issue.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Sonja Goetavalon. Hello, Sonja, can you hear us?
- Sonja Goetavalon.: Hi. Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute whenever you're ready.
- Sonja Goetavalon: Hi, thank you so much. My name is Sonja. I'm a resident of Oakland in District 1, and I stand by the APTP demands to defund the Oakland police department by at least 50%. These funds need to be allocated to other social services and education. So many more vital services that are actually keeping our communities safe.
- Sonja Goetavalon: I also wanted to mention again that like others have mentioned tear gas is a war weapon, and it is particularly harmful for young people and for pregnant people. And especially during our global pandemic, it inflames the lungs and burns the skin and stings the eyes and can potentially exacerbate the effects of COVID-19.
- Sonja Goetavalon: So please consider that when deciding to respond to peaceful protesters and youth who are just raising their voices. And it's this, like fellow person said this is genocide. Black lives matter, please defund OPD.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Esther Tsvayg. Hello, Esther, can you hear us?
- Esther Tsvayg: Hey, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute whenever you're ready.
- Esther Tsvayg: Wonderful. I won't curse because apparently cursing negates your right to free speech. But listening to all the people before me has truly been really empowering. It's becoming clear to me that certainly we might be descending into some sort of fascism. If we have no sort of transparency from our elected officials who clearly have no imperative to listen to us or serve with people when you mock us for demanding to stop killing our black neighbors.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Esther Tsvayg: I mean, the fact that everyone who is called in has voiced these concerns means you're not listening, but instead you were traumatizing people by being bad at your jobs. I was in Oakland three weeks ago and was teargassed by officers that you choose to fund instead of giving kids books or something or housing the houseless. This is despicable, and I demand that OPD is immediately defunded.
- Esther Tsvayg: You have the chance to act now or else you will be on the wrong side of history. Implement 8 to Abolition, cut the contract with the California Highway Patrol, who brutally killed Eric Salgado a week ago. Fund restorative justice and essential community services. I mean, we're just telling you what you need to do in order to be good at your job. So please consider being good at your jobs because it would really save people's lives if you were good at your job.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, your time is up. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Evelyn. Hello, Evelyn, can you hear us?
- Evelyn Hunter: Hi, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Evelyn Hunter: Great. My name is Evelyn Hunter and I live in District 2. I'd like to echo the demand to defund OPD by at least 50%, and reinvest that money into the relief and resilience of the town's black and brown communities, through vehicles such as the black new deal or the Macro model. OPD has a longstanding history of abuse of power, including the overuse and under-reporting of brutal and often lethal force against black people, sexual exploitation of minors, planting of drugs, framing of innocent people and rampant racial profiling.
- Evelyn Hunter: We're past the point of reform and we need major change. Oakland also needs to cut contract with CHP who brutally murdered Eric Salgado just a week ago. We need them out of Oakland. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Caitlin Tulloch. Hello, Caitlin. Can you hear us?
- Caitlin Tulloch: I can.
- Juanito Rus: You have one minute whenever you're ready.
- Caitlin Tulloch: Thank you. I want to echo one of the comments that one of the commissioners made during the earlier meeting, pointing out the fact that the opportunity cost of money within the OPD budget is enormously high.

PART 6 OF 10 ENDS [03:18:04]



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Caitlin Tulloch: Cost of money within the OPD budget is enormously high. And it is the opportunity cost of those funds. That is precisely the reason we cannot fund the services that OPD themselves, the interim chief have said are so necessary. In light of COVID government and municipal tax revenue is going to decline. There is nowhere else to turn for that funding. And so if we want those services to exist, the only way is for the OPD budget to be cut. I want to say I work on public financial management in my day job, and usually in situations of humanitarian crisis, we hope and we believe that all of our activities are lifesaving. And we still cut millions from those projects, especially in the last few years. So from a position of empathy, I want to push you. If we really value those services as critical, then the best way to protect and serve our community is to reduce OPD's budget by a lot.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Yuri C. Hello, Yuri, can you hear us?
- Yuri C: Yes. I live in District 1. I stand with all the past speakers. Every year, OPD goes over their huge budget by 120 million or more. So their budget would actually be 450 million. Who can stop this? Regarding homeless encampment, police escorts, the SCIU Local 1021 sent a letter stating they are not asking for police. Why do you keep saying they are? I am glad new cadets will be vetted for history of violence, but what about the officers who train them and who they report to? What will it take to get rid of existing officers with a history of violence like Patrick Gonzalez. He's cost four million in settlements paid out by the general fund, outside of the gigantic police budget. On top of his \$250K salary. Also, is civilian staff better? How are they immune to the culture and biases of the police force if their boss and their coworkers are the police? How many civilian staff were former police officers? Thank you. I yield my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker, I'm showing in the queue is listed as Sean Lee. Hello, Sean, can you hear us?
- Shawn Lee: Yes.
- Juanito Rus: You have one minute.
- Shawn Lee: Thank you very much, Madam Chair, commissioners. My name is Shawn Lee. I'm a lifelong resident of District 1. I graduated from high school in 2012 and I've tutored high schoolers across the OUSD for over 10 years at this point. I would like this commission to remove tear gas, flash bangs, pepper balls, and rubber bullets from the arsenal of OUSD and to remove them in good manual from methods of force permissible to be used within the city limits either by department or by mutual aid forces. In principle, they can be used in a manner consistent with the law, policies and the constitution. But I think recent events



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

have shown that that is not possible. Furthermore, I'd like this commission to seriously consider refocusing almost all of the budget onto investigations and violent crimes and less on minor infraction policing. Thank you very much.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as MPH. MPH, can you hear us?

MPH: Hi. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you.

MPH: Hi. So I wanted to comment on the interim chief's report saying that she knew that police officers were not trained for the mental health capacity that some calls require. And I wanted to go ahead and quote the preliminary report for the need for alternatives for incarceration for the mentally ill in Alameda County as written by the executive director of BOSS, which I know funded or took part in MACRO as well. And I just wanted to state that five years ago it was written that California cut 21% from its total general fund for mental health in budgeting, and that the number of people with serious mental illness in prisons and jails outnumber those in state hospitals 10 to one. Over a five year period, these individuals accounted for nearly 2200 arrests, 27,000 days in jail and 13,000 days in crisis units, state hospitals and emergency rooms to a total cost from the general fund from \$13 million with no reform. Please think about that when you consider defunding the police, we've already defunded mental health.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Amanda Machado. Hello, Amanda, can you hear us?

Amanda Machado: Yeah. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Amanda Machado: Yeah. Hi, I'm just agreeing with everyone who's saying that this meeting hasn't really reflected what's actually happening on the ground. As someone who was protesting two weeks ago, friends were tear-gassed, my friend's children were tear-gassed. I want to make sure that sinks in. Someone has already mentioned that tear gassing is a war crime. This was happening to children in Oakland. As a person of color who lives here, I've never felt safe here when police are present. In fact, I feel the opposite. I feel fucking terrified. As a person who has friends of color here we all feel exactly the same. We can't think of one instance where OPD has helped us or has made us feel more safe. Instead, they make us feel exactly the opposite. I don't feel safe when they're here. They need to be defunded by 50% as everyone has been saying, if not more. Thank you. I yield the rest of my time.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Cherri Murphy. Hello, Cherri. Can you hear us?
- Cherri Murphy: Hi. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute, whenever you're ready.
- Cherri Murphy: Okay. Thank you. Hold on for a second please, my computer went to sleep before I did. Oh geez! I can't get to my speech. I just want to say my name is Cherri Murphy. I'm a minister here in Oakland, District 5. When I attend a play a show I expect an excellent performance, but not when it concerns equitable and sustainable communities. Nothing about the report that OPD presented took accountability of the biases regarding Black and Brown bodies or the 2018 report. The national conversation and the recommendations for our budget is about racial inequities and I am disheartened that it was not lifted adequately tonight. I'm here to speak on the recommendation of the Anti Police-Terror Project, defund OPD budget by \$150 million passing the full Black New Deal. Spare us with platitudes and performance and recommend a budget that exemplifies racial justice. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Ruby Strandlund. Hello, Ruby, can you hear us?
- Ruby Strandlund: Hi, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.
- Ruby Strandlund: Hi. My name is Ruby. I live in District 3. At the risk of sounding repetitive, which I'm more than happy to be after two and a half hours of non-answers. I urge the commission to recommend that city council defund OPD's budget by at least 50%. The excessive amount of funds that are funneled into OPD can be re-allocated towards departments that manage housing, mental health workers, youth programs, restorative justice, and other services that will actually make our citizens safer, especially for our Brown and Black community members. All of these areas are in desperate need and 150 billion should be the minimum diverted to them.
- Ruby Strandlund: Furthermore, these funds could be better invested in passing the Black New Deal, which will help ensure the safety of our Black and houseless community members by supplying them with testing, shelter and PPE resources during the pandemic. It can also be invested in the MACRO programs so that we have a mobile crisis unit that is independent from law enforcement and considers the needs and concerns of impacted communities. Please help make Oakland safer



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

and support the divestment from the racist, corrupt and inefficient police department. Thank you. I yield my time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Alan Marling. Hello, Alan, can you hear us?

Alan Marling: I can. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Alan Marling: Thank you. I appreciate a lot of the comments by the commissioners. It seems that what we need is some sort of mobile social servants, trained in deescalation and mental health resources. In order to fund that and other projects that will make the community safer, I ask for up to 50% defunding the police budget. If these comments seem repetitive, you should see what's happening on the streets. It's not just repetitive. It's consensus. It's unanimous. We want the police budget defunded. Any other response from this commission will show that you're out of touch. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Megan S. Hello, Megan, can you hear us? Megan S. Hello, can you hear us?

Megan S.: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Megan S.: Great. I just want to say this is the third time I've heard Chief Manheimer connect the protest to violence that had nothing to do with protest including the shooting of Federal Security Officer David Underwood. This continued misinformation is criminal and insulting. I understand Manheimer thinks she's making a point about what happens when OPD is stretched thin, but she's actually proving to the public that she cannot be trusted and demonstrating how ineffective OPD is despite its massive budget. This is also the second time I've heard Manheimer and Armstrong use the ongoing protest as an excuse to not produce the reports the commission has requested.

Megan S.: Manheimer, I expect to see or to do list on July 9th and Armstrong, I'm looking forward to your report on the protest on July 15th. We need to defund OPD. Don't start with this paltry crossing guard nonsense. Get rid of the sideshow detail, which is a source of terror and also massive amounts of overtime. Get rid of all those overpaid supervisors, who it turns out officers don't even have to consult before deploying teargas. Manheimer has shown that she'll say literally anything to justify this budget. She'd rather bankrupt the city through misconduct costs than engage with the community in good faith.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is up. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Anant Chopra. Hello, Anant, can you hear us?

Anant Chopra: Yes. Thank you so much. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Anant Chopra: Thank you so much. Yes, first to the Chair for recognizing me and to Mr. Rus for handling all of the comments, really appreciate it. I just want to support the idea that programs like MACRO are entirely viable with an equitable distribution of resources. That's what we're asking for when we say, "Massively redistribute this bulk, these hundreds of millions of dollars into models that we know work, for example, the model that's being used already in Sacramento and the MH first model."

Anant Chopra: I'm a librarian and an information scientist by training. And I work with a few different networks of social justice advocates to strengthen their internal communication sets and practices. So when the chief was talking about needing an updated system for the data, that really spoke to me as someone who's thinking about if something like this can work, how can the information be distributed? And we need to reflect the priorities of APTP and the community. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Ashley Greenwood. Hello, Ashley, can you hear us?

Ashley Greenwood: Hello?

Juanito Rus: You have one minute.

Ashley Greenwood: Thank you. I asked a question at the last meeting to Deputy Chief Armstrong about the auditing process for overtime and he did explain the quite extensive process, but was unable to answer my question about what happens, giving an example of when overtime would be denied or what percentage of overtime is denied, if that information is even kept track of. When these auditors are looking through this, what exactly are they looking for?

Ashley Greenwood: How are they crosschecking this overtime with schedules, with information reports? How does that exactly work? Is this information public? Is it broken out in percentage by cause, for instance, there was a protest on this day, Oh, this person didn't finish their paperwork. Is there some sort of breakdown? And is the overtime budget common knowledge within the departments? Because it seems like there would be a conflict of interest there I'd really like some answers. Thank you.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Rachel Holmstrom. Hello, Rachel, can you hear us?

Rechel Holmstrom: Yeah. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Rechel Holmstrom.: Thank you so much. I'm having a hard time making sense of all of this. I really condemn Manheimer's comments that the police force was necessary for these protests. I think that's counterproductive to David Jordan's comments about talking points. I think it is important that we repeat them because this whole meeting seemed to be arguing about dollars and cents and getting to that 25 million benchmark that council members proposed. But what we're asking for is 50% and I'm just not seeing in this specific meeting, how we're going to get there. So we will continue to demand 50% and flood these comments until we see a plan that reflects that. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Elena Eimart. Hello, Elena, can you hear us?

Elena Eimart: Yes. I can hear you.

Juanito Rus: You have one minute whenever you're ready.

Elena Eimart: Thank you, Mr. Rus. My name's Elena. I'm an Oakland resident and I also stand with APTP. There's a reason so many of us are on this call. Our budget show our values and the current city of Oakland budget does not reflect the values of the people in this community. We value the lives of Black and Brown and indigenous people, not a racist institution but for its white supremacy and the city's budget needs to change to reflect those priorities now. The presentation made by the interim chief showed a mega tiny reduction that many people have already talked about.

Elena Eimart: Even many commissioners on this call acknowledged it was not enough. We need to defund OPD by at least 50% now. Invest that money into passing a Black New Deal, eliminate the agreement with CHP and stop all violence against protestors. Many people have said we don't have the money to pursue other more valuable social services endeavors. And that's because we sink so much money into OPD. We need to free up that money to pay for the services that the people need and want. And in terms of obscenity, in terms of-

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is up. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Katy. Hello, Katy, can you hear us?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Katy: Hello, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.
- Katy: My name is Katy Condo, resident and voter in District 1. Alternate Commissioner Jordan, I resent your attempted undermining public comment. If you cared so much about running an action oriented meeting, you should have actually had ideas and an agenda, instead of letting the interim chief run the conversation with a Word Doc. Undermining or repetitive comments as vague, it means that you haven't done the work to dive more deeply into these policy ideas. We only have 60 seconds. I also want to echo Commissioner Anderson's comment about how the police responds to community calls.
- Katy: We have racist members in our society who call the cops, "Suspicious behavior or people." We've seen this happen recently in Alameda to a black man who was dancing in the street. I want to encourage you to reject the thinking that a community members' call necessitates an armed officer. We need to cut OPD's budget by 50%, starting a path towards total abolition. Give any alternative programs as much time to fail as we have given OPD. Abolish the police.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Samantha Rogers. Hello, Samantha, can you hear us?
- Samantha Rogers: Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.
- Samantha Rogers: Okay. Thank you. I think we as a community spend entirely too much money on our police force. As we continue to develop the budget, I would like to see and strongly believe that we need to dissolve and defund our police department and local carceral system, and use those funds that we currently have and allocate them to prioritizing community services, particularly focusing on free and equitable education, housing, justice, food, justice, public health care, and universal basic income for Alameda County.
- Samantha Rogers: We can also use this as an opportunity to cover the budget deficit that has been created by the ongoing pandemic, as well as invest in remote learning for the use of devices and internet access for all students. In addition, I am also here with APTP to encourage to cutting any contract with the California Highway Patrol after the murder at Los Gato. We can keep our community safe by using our money for living wage jobs, housing-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is up. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is a phone-in attendee with the last four digits, 0501. Hello, 0501, can you hear us?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Jean Hazabel: Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Jean Hazabel: This is Jean Hazabel [inaudible 03:36:31]. Excessive abuse is only the result of a systemic problem, and that's the silence in the coverup and the recycling of abusers in the department. We pay millions of dollars on civil actions, but abusers are not even charged, criminally charged. In 2004, a file case number CO3296, prohibit the use of tear gas and projectiles. How is that outside agencies? Are they under that jurisdiction as well? Also, Mr. Peterson through the chair, what's the cost of this new data system that you have. But I really want to know about the failure to comply with the lawsuit that was filed by the local team, Ohio, WV in 2000-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Hazabel. Your time is up. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Anna Krasner. Hello, Anna, can you hear us?
- Anna Krasner: Hi. I can hear you. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.
- Anna Krasner: Hi, I'm just calling to state that I'm appalled by the lack of accountability displayed by OPD in this meeting and the lack of commitment from the commission to hold them to account. Why didn't you ask why OPD still have Sergeant Patrick Gonzalez on the force who shot people in open and cost Oakland millions in settlements, and pay him a quarter million a year for the trouble. Defund OPD by 50% now. They clearly have too much money, if they can already afford to pay for killer cops.
- Anna Krasner: The mutual aid issue too is very appalling. You call in reinforcements through mutual aid, fully knowing that those forces will use tear gas against Oakland residents, including my friends at peaceful protest. And then say you can't do anything about it because they're from a different jurisdiction. What is wrong with you? That's absolutely messed up and unconscionable. Cut that OPD budget by 50% now and caught the contract with CHP. Thank you. I yield my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing him the queue is listed as Cameron Bird. Hello, Cameron, can you hear us?
- Cameron Bird: Yes, this is actually Vitren, I'm using a different computer, but I'm ready.
- Juanito Rus: Vitren, whenever you're ready.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Cameron Bird: Thanks. Thanks commissioners for volunteering your time tonight in the interest of this defunding conversation. I like to point out that many of the issues brought up signal that deeper, more troubling nature of OPD. I like to know how much money does the city collect from towing and from selling off these 'abandoned vehicles.' Commissioners, what do you think is the root of the city's problematic partnership with foul profit towing companies?

Cameron Bird: Further, there was an audit of OPD overtime, and I found the results to be seriously disturbing. One officer racked up nearly 2.5 million in five years. The audit found that three officers worked more than 70 days in a row and somewhat to overtime while on paid leave. OPD cannot stay in budget. They go over budget year after year as evidence by the presentation of the budget today. What were the actual numbers? This was not a budget meeting. I saw nothing. Defund OPD. All of it. 100%.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Tasha Mente. Hello, Tasha. Can you hear us?

Tasha Mente: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Tasha Mente: Great. There's two citizens here wishing to speak. I'm Tasha Mente, District 1. I agree with the other citizens who are frustrated at the level of minutiae discussed on this call. We spent an hour discussing having one tow officer on staff. This is just a distraction from making bold necessary change. Let's think about this. How many people are dealing with untreated mental illness living on the street? Why don't we put the money first toward helping them? And at the very end circle, back to how many armed soldiers we really need on our streets. Start there. The MACRO program isn't enough. Scrap the city budget and start over.

Joseph Mente: I'm Joseph. I'm a manager in IT operations with a 24/7 on call rotation. I'm deeply troubled by the story that one of the commissioners shared. Four calls in six hours, and I made four calls responding to a single [inaudible 03:41:10] on shoplift. I recognize this as a single data point, but I would be fired for gross incompetence, if my department was so inefficient. We need massive staffing cuts to force the police department to properly triage and allocate resources. Necessity will breed invention [inaudible 00:03:41:26].

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is up. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Travis Moy. Hello, Travis, can you hear us?

Travis Moy: Yes. Can you hear me?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.
- Travis Moy: All right. Thank you. I'm just going to pretend I did the repetitive speech here, blah, blah, blah. Addressing specifically Alternate Commissioner Jordan, if you ask for us to take less time so you can do actual work, we have to have some faith that you are doing actual work, but as many people have said there didn't appear to be a lot that happened in this meeting. I mean the mutual aid sort of just running in circles, the traffic re-allocation, and there was the deeply comical moment when the CIO just airdropped into defend his vision project and say that it was working. How are you supposed to show us that you're doing any work when it just seems like such a clown fiesta here? Thank you. I yield my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is just listed as R. Hello, R, can you hear us? The letter R, can you hear us?
- Naomi: Hello, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Naomi: Okay. My name is Naomi and I'm a student and I demand that Oakland City Council defund OPD and reinvest in the community by defunding the department by at least 50% today and tomorrow, disbanding the police department. Work with local Black led communities to develop alternative models of community care and transformative justice that address root issues. Not community policing, not oppressive tech surveillance, but community can. Pass the Black New Deal in full and implement a permanent ban against violence of any kind against protesters, including tear gas, rubber bullets and arrest. Uphold and release protesters on zero bail. Cut the contract with CHP and get them out of our city.
- Naomi: And honestly, I'm disgusted that you have yet to get absolutely anything done. Every time armed cops enter a community to move the supposedly abandoned vehicle for example, they pose a life threatening risk to its residents. Instead of complaining about abandoned cars and vehicles people live in, invest in creating safe spaces for people to live. How does sending a squad of armed officers deescalate an abandoned vehicle situation? How does this policy like this ever promote or ensure safety? Why are officers trained to kill needed to remove unattended cars?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is up. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Ann Mavromatis. Hello, Ann can you hear us?
- Ann Mavromatis: Can you hear me?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Juanito Rus: We can hear you, Ann.

Ann Mavromatis: Hello.

Juanito Rus: Hello, you have one minute.

Ann Mavromatis: Okay, thank you. So I am a voter and resident of District 1 in Oakland, and I want to thank all of the previous commenters for being so amazing. And I also stand with the Anti Police-Terror Project for doing such excellent work and for making points that really deserve to be heard and honored and enacted by the commission. I would like to see the police budget defunded by at least 50%. And now that a lot of the community is displaced and unemployed. We have so much time and energy that we would love to apply towards improving the situations in Oakland.

Ann Mavromatis: And I think that putting this money towards housing and healthcare and resources for the people, I can't think of a better time to try this amazing experiment and just to see it succeed. And I'm also concerned because I've seen the police fail at solving crimes, fail at stopping crimes, and really I've only ever seen them open up against peaceful protestors. So I'm just curious as to what exactly are they effective at? And if they aren't really effective at anything, why are we giving them so much money?

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is up. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Yoana Tchoukleva. Hello, Yoana, can you hear us?

Yoana Tchoukleva: Hello, can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Yoana Tchoukleva: Thank you so much. Hi there. My name is Yoana Tchoukleva. I am a Civil Rights Fellow at Equal Justice Society living in District 3, and living on an occupied [inaudible 03:45:58] territory. I am calling right now because I am really tired of hearing the same meetings and don't do anything. I'm hearing you all talk about multi data systems and so much money spent on things that are actually deeply harmful. The Oakland Police Department is killing Black and Brown communities and is a product of nately inherently racist structure that is policing in this country. The fact that money is being spent on mutual aid and housing for mutual aid officer when [inaudible 03:46:37] prison, guards are being called into Oakland, who deal with protester, who we are paying for their housing is a city. That is deeply wrong and we cannot send for it anymore.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Yoana. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Sarah Brown. Hello, Sarah, can you hear us?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Sarah Brown: Hi. I can hear you.

Juanito Rus: You have one minute.

Sarah Brown: Hi, my name is Sarah. I'm an educator and resident District 4. I'm calling for defunding of the police by at least 50%. As Chief Manheimer says at least 40 to 50% of calls for service are for mental health costs, which means at least that amount of money should be diverted from the police into those resources. If this is the case, \$1.5 million for MACRO will not be enough. How will you respond to calls when there are not enough MACRO personnel to respond? Will you send police instead? Why can't non police be trained for homeless outreach? Also, I think please overtime should be discussed.

Sarah Brown: How are police becoming the highest paid city workers in Oakland sometimes doubling their salaries? Where is the oversight? Oakland police make over 30 million per year, 10% of OPD's budget. Also, should it be the case that hiring people who are not pleased would save you money? Why should police be paid that much? If non-police you're not and beat it for the same job? There needs to be a total overhaul of leadership and restructuring. I think there needs to be a massive rethinking of what we value in this community and put our money there.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Benjamin Lee. Hello, Benjamin. Can you hear us?

Benjamin Lee: Yes, I can. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you and you have one minute whenever you're ready.

Benjamin Lee: Greetings commissioners, Mr. Rus. Thank you. Please, please listen to what the people have said. We need you to push back on the circular logic. We keep hearing over and over and over again. We've heard that abandoned autos are harms and hazards. Towing can be a tense situation. The tense situation is our brothers and sisters and students and teachers being murdered at the hands of police. We need you to lean in and exert the full weight of your influence to seize this moment and make sure that the city council defunds this system of oppression. I stand today in solidarity with the Anti Police-Terror Project. And I will say in responding to Mr. Jordan's comments, and I'm so thankful to be with all these other talkers on this thing. We're going to keep saying it until it happens, and we are so blessed to have the leadership of APTP. So please listen. Thank you for the time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Gabrielle or Gabriel. Hello, Gabriel, can you hear us?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Gabriel: Hi, my name is Gabriel. I'm a voter and a resident of District 2. Thank you to the commission for hearing us and our calls to defund OPD by a minimum of 50%. I stand with this and all of APTP's demands. And I hope and believe that you will do the right thing. OPD Commissioners, take some risks and make some hard decisions literally every other social service organization in the city. Are we really going to hand OPD all the money they ask for it because they shrugged their shoulders and say the state requires officers to help report towed cars. So there's nothing they can do. Be courageous, be creative. Stop stockpiling military equipment to use on your citizens.
- Gabriel: Fire the cops who are [inaudible 03:50:19] harassment and violence, who are taking home hundreds of thousands of dollars a year. Disarm the police because when you have a hammer, everything looks like a nail. Let me remind you, for years OPD has done more harm than good by terrorizing the communities of color and unhoused individuals. Not to mention they run an underage sex trafficking operation, and a protection here in [inaudible 03:50:36] of color. It might've been [inaudible 03:50:39] OPD meets the peaceful actions tomorrow. It was competition violence-
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is listed as Maria. Hello, Maria, can you hear us? Hello, Maria. I can see you unmuted yourself, but I can't hear you.
- Juanito Rus: Hello, Maria. I can see you unmuted yourself, but I can't hear you. Can you hear us? At this time, I'm going to lower your hand, and if you fix your technical difficulties, you can raise it again. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Tom Hainan. Hello, Tom, can you hear us?
- Tom Hainan: Hi. Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.
- Tom Hainan: Great. Yeah, my name is Tom Hainan. I'm a resident of District one. Thanks for taking the comment. Earlier in the meeting, I heard Chief Manheimer herself voice support for offloading the critical work of mental health interventions, and other safety net supports. But she also stated that funding must remain with the police until those safety nets are fully up and running. I hope you can see the paradox there. If we never redirect funding from OPD, then those safety nets will never be put in place.
- Tom Hainan: Now I appreciate two and a half hours of budgetary minutia, as much as the next guy. But until we take decisive action on police funding, it doesn't matter how many crossing guards and abandoned cars we haggle over. Commissioner Jordan said he doesn't want to hear the same thing over and over again, but he



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

and the rest of you are going to, until we defund the police by at least 50%, because we're not going anywhere on this. And you can have two seconds back.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Will Brotherson. Hello, Will, can you hear us?

Will Brotherson: Yes. Thank you. I am a black public defender and I live in Oakland. On July 15th, 2019, commissioner Anderson said to KTVU news, "We know that law enforcement has been used as a tool of oppression for decades, since our inception as a country." If you know this to be true, then please act accordingly. I stand with APTP and their demands. I also am in favor of the militarized equipment ordinance, which I know this commission was previously in favor of.

Will Brotherson: Madam commissioner mentioned the lack of service East Oakland gets from OPD, but 95% of BearCat deployments went to East Oakland. 127 deployments, only 61 ended with an actual arrest of some sort, more than half of these deployments were clearly not necessary. California Agencies bought at least \$163 million military equipment since the beginning of the DOD 1033 program. Make them sell that stuff back, save millions.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Erin Wingo. Hello, Erin, can you hear us?

Erin Wingo: I can. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Erin Wingo: Okay. Thank you. I am an Oakland resident of District one and a public health professional. And I stand with all of the previous speakers and APTP with the call to defund the OPD, by at least 50%. You must redistribute funds to other more effective community interventions, including increasing access to housing, education and employment programs, mental health and substance use treatment and restorative justice. So I urge you to support the full Black New Deal. Public health research shows that law enforcement systems uphold existing racial and class hierarchies by targeting socially marginalized groups, mainly low income communities of color, as we continue to see here in Oakland.

Erin Wingo: The evidence shows that policing actually reproduces inequitable, social and economic conditions that in turn precipitate intervention by law enforcement. In contrast, there's ample evidence that local reinvestment in community and social services is associated with reduced community trauma and interpersonal harm and improved community health and safety. Follow the evidence, keep our communities safe by redirecting city funds to invest in essential community services. Thank you.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Meredith. Hello, Meredith. Can you hear us?

Meredith: Yes, I can.

Juanito Rus: You have one minute.

Meredith: Thank you. I'm here along with most of the other people who have spoken tonight and along with APTP, to ask the commission to please, use your power to urge the City Council to cut OPD funding by at least 50% and invest that money back into the community. There's been a lot of talk of what we... of that we can't move funds from OPD to for example, alternative programs or emergency mental health crisis response, until there is something already set up that works. But these crisis programs and alternatives won't be able to function unless we have that sufficient funding. So again, I want to restate that I am asking the commission to urge City Council to cut OPD funding by at least 50%. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Gloria Jimenez Moran. Hello, Gloria, can you hear us?

Gloria Jimenez: Can hear you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Gloria Jimenez: Hi. Yes, my name is Gloria Jimenez Moran. I'm born and raised in Oakland and I'm also a clinical licensed social worker. Oakland spends more money on policing than on any other programs or services. Policing does not equal less crimes as they do not address the roots of 'why crimes occur' Like lack of housing, lack of culture development and health services et cetera. Try different, defund OPD by 50% or more and invest in community work that organizations like Courage and the black organizing projects that are already doing. We want and need our black and indigenous and brown youths alive. Don't you? By funding OPD more than anything, you are responsible for the trauma inflicted on these communities and the murder of black, brown and indigenous youths. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Hannah. Hello, Hannah, can you hear us?

Hannah: Hi. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Hannah: All right. I would like to echo what has been said and ask you to defund and dismantle OPD and invest in community. Redirect this huge portion of the general fund to a central community service such as, housing for all, youth programs, health care and restorative justice. Please also stop the use of violence of any kind against protesters and end the contract with the California Highway Patrol and remove them from Oakland in the name of justice for Eric Salgado. And the other course of action will actively put black and brown community members at risk of further violent discrimination. Thank you. I yield my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Sheyda Aboii. Hello Sheyda, can you hear us?
- Sheyda Aboii: Hello. My name is Sheyda Aboii, and I'm calling as an MD-PhD student at the Universities of California, San Francisco and Berkeley. I'm a member of White Coats For Black Lives and the Do No Harm Coalition. Speaking in solidarity with APTP, I call tonight to denounce the overwhelming force we've witnessed against black and brown persons and to call for the Oakland City Council to defund OPD by at least 50%. Instead, invest in a full Black New Deal. As a medical student of color early on in her training, I've witnessed officers in the Bay Area, bate and harass patients who look and don't look like me, awaiting critical care in the emergency department and the medicine ward.
- Sheyda Aboii: This is personal. Lives are on the line. Over three years ago, I chose to move to the Bay Area from a small town in order to train for a future career in medicine. I was hopeful. Instead, in many ways, I've undergone a rapid brutal education and police violence. I urge you to abolish and disband the Oakland Police Department. Cut the contract with the California Highway Patrol. Reform is not an option. Instead, redirect funds to macro and other essential community services. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Michael Connolly. Hello, Michael, can you hear us?
- Michael Connolly: Oh yeah. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.
- Michael Connolly: Thank you. Hi, my name is Michael, I'm a resident of District four, unoccupied Illinois territory. And I deeply urge the Oakland Police Commission to remove funds from OPD and allocate them back into the community. We need to invest into our programs, for housing, education, food security, criminal justice reform, and health care. We do not need to increase law enforcement funding. We need to address the endemic racism in our community that is evident, as the precious



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

lives of our black and brown neighbors are destroyed and ended by an oppressive policing system.

Michael Connolly: We also need to immediately ban the use of tear gas. It is egregious that such a chemical weapon has been deployed during a global respiratory pandemic that disproportionately affects the black community because of systemic societal racism. We need a massive shift in our priorities. You can show the community that you hear us by defunding the OPD by 50%, to start and invest in The Black New Deal. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Excuse me Mr. Rus, I need to call Commissioner Anderson. You've been unmuted.

Tara Anderson: Thank you Chair. I'm happy to wait to the close of public comment or make this comment now. Your discretion.

Regina Jackson: We can do both and we need to extend the meeting because it's almost... it's 10:30 now. So can I get a motion to extend the meeting, 30 minutes?

Tara Anderson: I'll make the motion to extend the meeting, 30 minutes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Excuse me, for the Chair.

Regina Jackson: Hold on. Commissioner Prather, you've been unmuted.

Edwin Prather: Thank you. I'd like to offer a substitute motion. We've got 49 people in the queue, we're going to need-

Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry. You're-

Edwin Prather: Okay. I'd like to move that we extend the meeting to midnight.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Back to you Tara.

Tara Anderson: This is Commissioner Anderson. I accepted a friendly amendment from Commissioner Prather to just go ahead and call it, cause we do this every time and he sees it. It is, extend the meeting till midnight to allow us ample time to hear the public comment and have our subsequent discussion.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So now we'll go back to public comment. Mr. Rousse-

Tara Anderson: I think we need to vote, Chair.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry. Yes. Cause we... Okay. So Commissioner Anderson?

Tara Anderson: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Prather?

Edwin Prather: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harris? Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Aye for myself. Commissioner Harris.

Ginale Harris: Hello.

Regina Jackson: Yes.

Ginale Harris: Are we voting?

Regina Jackson: Yes ma'am, your vote.

Ginale Harris: So I mean, I don't know if I could do midnight. I have to wake up at four-

Regina Jackson: Can-

Ginale Harris: But I will say no.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So the motion passes with three. So thank you very much. We'll go back to public comment and hopefully Commissioner Harris, you can stay on as long as possible.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Madame Chair. At this time, I'm showing the next speaker in the queue listed as Robert Morales. Hello, Robert, can you hear us?

Robert Morales: Yeah. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Robert Morales: Thank you. Look, I'm going to get a slightly different perspective here. I'm a public defender here in Alameda County and these little changes, these little twists in budgets and new rules, aren't going to work. And then when you make a new rule about 'No choke' they'll come up with a new move and not call it a choke move. It's a cat and mouse game. And you're going to ask, how do I



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

know? Because I see the footage. I see the cameras. I see how these cops act when they think no one is looking, when they think that cameras are off. And I see their mind state, they have an, us versus them mind state. And you guys think we're out here lying to you, that we're exaggerating about this? Little changes aren't getting it done. Defund them. You're not listening to us. I see the footage.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the is listed as Mish. Hello Mish, can you hear us?

Mish: Yes. Mish.

Juanito Rus: Mish. Sorry. You have one minute. Whenever you're ready.

Mish: All right. Okay. I want to say that I support defunding Oakland PD aggressively to down 50%. And we definitely want The Black New Deal. Listening to this meeting, has opened my eyes even more to just how inefficient and unnecessary the police department spending is. It's been made clear that we've been dumping millions of dollars in the systems that don't work. It's time to stop wasting money, funding racism, and funds other systems that actually do work. I'd also like to add that I don't appreciate being devalued as an individual person, just because many of us are banding together as a group to show you how important this is. I understand what you're getting at, but the way you're saying it is totally disrespectful. So check yourself, as I give up the rest of my time to another black voice.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Oh, I accidentally lowered the hand of who's listed as Alex. If that person would re-raise their hand in the queue, I will call on you after this next person, who I have listed as AJ Pluss. And Alex Hanna, now you can raise your hand again in the queue and I'll on your next. AJ Pluss, are you there?

AJ Pluss: Yeah. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: I can hear you. Whenever you're ready.

AJ Pluss: Yeah. Hi, I live in District six and I'm here in full support of all of APTP's demands. I'd Like to see OPD's budget cut by 50% and then more. And I just want to say, as a parent of a young child, these last two weeks and months, I've been feeling a lot of grief, a lot of rage, and also a lot of hope for the future. Seeing what people are putting together, doing calling for here and across the country. And I just want you all to channel the bravery of the City Council members in Minneapolis and all of us in Oakland and just throughout the country and world. We're trying to make our communities better. And that takes a lot of vision and bravery. So please stand with us. Proceed.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Juanito Rus: Thank you. At this time, I will call on Alex Hanna. Hello, Alex, can you hear us?

Alex Hanna: I can hear you.

Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready.

Alex Hanna: My name is Alex. I'm a trans woman of color and I'm standing in solidarity with APTP. I'm calling for the defunding of the Oakland Police Department and for Oakland to take bold action by cutting the OPD budget, by at least 150 million and reinvesting in the community. Cops are being asked to do too much in this country, as Dallas Police Chief David Brown has said, "Not enough mental health funding with the cop hand lint, not enough drug addiction funding. Let's give it to cops." OPD takes at least, almost half of Oakland's health fund each year, consuming desperately needed resources, from housing, mental health, healthcare, Parks, libraries, and other vital sources.

Alex Hanna: The investment policing has not made us safer. OPD remains an embarrassment to the city and a lethal threat to Oakland's brown and black communities. We also demand stopping the use of violence of any kind against protestors. Including the use of tear gas during a respiratory pandemic. Defunding the goals... Defunding also doesn't mean dumping money to surveillance and carceral technology. Black lives matter before the police.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Raleigh Denon, or Drennon excuse me. Raleigh, can you hear us? Raleigh?

Raleigh Drennon: Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: I can hear you. You have one minute. Whenever ready.

Raleigh Drennon: I've heard nothing but budgetary platitudes tonight. Shifting funds around or, Oh, we have to wait. \$330 million go to OPD's budget. It actively harms our communities that so much money is going to this militarized department and a budget decrease of 50% would only be a start, and yet current suggestions don't seem to spear a 10th of that. Y'all have a weird definition of mutual aid, whether outside offices or not, tear gas was shot at peaceful demonstrators with impunity and no provocation on multiple nights. They shot Eric Salgado 40 times. Do not get it twisted, riots happened cause cops dress up for them. If any cop cancel the values of our communities, they don't belong in our neighborhoods. We have not forgotten Oscar Grant, we will not forget Eric Salgado. And the fact that police do spent so much time on protestors is telling. I yield my time.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The speaker in the queue is listed as Steve Krause. Hello, Steve, can you hear us? Steve Krause, can you hear us?

Steve Krause: All right. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Steve Krause: Great. Yeah, I'm here tonight to talk and in provocation of demands of APTP. At this point, I'm not really sure if you're listening to anyone, but I mainly just wanted to speak to everyone who's listening right now and say, thank you for everyone talking out. As the Commissioner said in the beginning of the meeting, there are a lot of young professional people listening out in hope of helping of grassroots movements. And I consider myself one of those, but prior to any of this. And that kind of made me concerned, but hearing everyone speak tonight is really putting emotion to like what I feel and what the streets are feeling. So thanks everyone speaking, continue to do it. Keep talking in the extent of this meeting. So just keep saying what you have to say. I yield my time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as, Kelly Ding. Hello, Kelly, can you hear us? Kelly Ding, can you hear us?

Kelly Ding: Oh, yes. Can you-

Juanito Rus: You have one minute.

Kelly Ding: ... hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.

Kelly Ding: Okay. I just wanted to voice my support, like everybody else. I don't really have anything new to add, but I do support defunding in the OPD. Defunding it by at least 50%, investing that money in things that can actually help make our community safer, healthcare, social services, everything that would actually help put the power of community safety into the hands of the people in the community versus trying to use police force and violence through the state, to kind of control people's lives in a very violent way. So yeah, I yield the rest of my time. I just wanted to support what everybody else has been voicing.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I have in the queue is John Lindsay Poland. Hello, John, can you hear us?

John Lindsay-Poland: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

John Lindsay-Poland: I don't think you can kick down the can down the road on making recommendations tonight to the council on deep structural cuts to the budget, even if you have to meet late into the night. But this doesn't stop with budget decisions made this month. The city budget will have to be revised after state revenues are reduced this summer. And that will be an occasion for more cutting, which should be directed at police not needed community services.

John Lindsay-Poland: Second, the invest side of structural change requires decisions, about how funds will be spent way beyond the macro mental health pilot, and requires coordination with agencies that you don't oversee. So besides the immediate necessary recommendations, I urge you to establish an ongoing commission leadership. It could be an ad hoc committee, of this structural change with other city agencies, OUSD, AC Transit and the community. And also please ask the OPD chief to identify its relationship via contract and practice with CHP. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Corey Dusty. Corey, can you hear us?

Corey Dusty: I can. Can You hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.

Corey Dusty: Okay. Thank you. To the CIO, data collection is a shiny dead-end. It's reactionary. It postpones any action. It's results get tied up in bureaucracy, as you said. The crime rate stats, as someone else mentioned are based on what is legislated as crime and how hunted out that crime is. And they are then used to justify gentrification and feed into mass incarceration, became modern slavery. Please stop paying for settlements, ban tear gas, de-equip rubber bullets. All these things are being used contrary to policies that already exist just as the choke holds are already banned, and they used to kill people.

Corey Dusty: And be cops, abolish police, follow the eight abolition. In the meantime, decriminalize sex work and stop pursuing sex workers because this disproportionately harms black trans women. Also no obscenity is strong enough to condemn the systemic police enforcement of racism. And trans people are in and of ourselves considered obscene. So, when you send her things that sound obscene, that's us. As a trans person, it takes time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Ellie H. Hello, Ellie, can you hear us?

Ellie H: Hi. Yes. Can you hear me?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.
- Ellie H: Thank you for the time. I'm in District two and I repeat the demands outlined by APTP, that so many eloquent and powerful commentaries have spoken too. I echo all of them and demand justice for Oakland's black indigenous communities on Illinois land and people of color. I ask for justice for Eric Salgado, Shawn Terosa, Oscar Grant and Nia Wilson. So far, what I've seen and heard is nothing short of unacceptable. If you've heard these comments, I'll ask then, where are your actions?
- Ellie H: There's no good excuse for bringing barely a two page document to discuss the full budget of OPD services. I'm new to this game, but that comes off as incompetent. I work in public policy in the Bay Area, and I couldn't excuse this. There are alternatives that this city has already explored, funded, and proven to be effective in meaningful community supports. Even without that data, how can you defend the outcome of the current system? We are ready to divest from the police and discourses of white supremacy and overturn the funds to our community. I yield the rest of my time to think about that. And to say it last, fuck OPD.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Felicity. Hello, Felicity. Can you hear us?
- Felicity: Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.
- Felicity: Hi, my name is Felicity. And first off, I'd like to point out that I'm a little curious how you can be tired of a message you haven't even truly heard. We collectively are the community response team. This is our voice, and this is our money. Of course OPD has excuses, that's how they leached this money from the community in the first place. But there's still just excuses and it's still our money.
- Felicity: OPD still hasn't responded with respectable actions or facts, regardless of demands and educated advice, which is not surprising because of the 2017 audit, most of the officers involved failed written and oral exams. A couple even failed psychological exams. So when stagnant cars are more of a blight to you, than the blood of our black community in the streets and in the prison systems, yes, we defund you by half because you're not capable of responding with ability. You're incorrigible. Prove me wrong.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as EZ. Hello EZ, can you hear us?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- EZ: Yes, I can hear you. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.
- EZ: Hello. Thank you. I'm a resident of District three unoccupied Illinois land, and I stand with the demands of APTP and all of the community members before me, who have commented, to cut the OPD's budget by at least 50%. \$150 million and reinvest that money. I just wanted to mention, I heard the commissioner's story earlier about many police cars being called, taking hours to deal with a woman walking out of a grocery store with a Capri Sun. Our tax dollars are paying for that, and for OPD to tear gas and brutalize our community members. I attended an action a few weeks ago that was youth led and completely peaceful, where OPD used tear gas while no one posed any threat whatsoever.
- EZ: Using tear gas on youth, and as someone said earlier, children, during a pandemic of a respiratory disease that we are supposedly trying to beat. I've also heard Oakland youth express that their schools are lacking basic necessities like toilet paper. We are paying for the police to spend hours for a stolen Capri Sun and to tear gas community members, while the unhoused population in Alameda County has gone up almost 50% in the last two years. People are going unhoused in a pandemic, children don't have toilet paper in schools. And-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you.
- EZ: ...it's just absolutely-
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker I'm showing in the queue is listed as Catherine Monahan. Hello, Catherine, can you hear us?
- Catherine Monahan: I'm here-
- Juanito Rus: Catherine?
- Catherine Monahan: Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute. Whenever you're ready.
- Catherine Monahan: Thank you. My name is Catherine, I'm a resident of Oakland in District two and I'm calling you to stand by the APTP demands, to defund OPD by at least 50%. You tear gassed me and hundreds of other innocent people, including teenagers on June 1st at 7:40 PM. I then heard OPD blatantly lie about the level of threat presented by that crowd, that I was in. And that is just a drop in the bucket, as our community is literally and figuratively experiencing acts of war against our loved ones, bodies, minds, and spirits.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Catherine Monahan: If you don't overhaul your budget and listen to our collective and unified demands, you're going against the very community you claim to protect. Your stance does not make any sense. What you are saying and what you are doing does not add up. Because of your ineptitude, the public is being forced to research, beg and prepare minute long doctorates and waiting hours to be heard. Gosh, I need a heck, is what I have to say to you my friends. Gosh I need a heck.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Zoe Levitt. Hello, Zoe, can you hear us?

Zoe Levitt: Hello. Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute.

Zoe Levitt: Thank you. Good evening. I'm a Oakland resident of District four. I'm here tonight to add my voice to the strong and growing movement in the city. Calling for defunding our current police department by at least 50% and investing in what actually keeps us safe, including The Black New Deal, programs like macro and vital housing, education and healthcare services. I also want to say the large number of people calling in with similar messages tonight is happening because, and precisely because Oakland's communities are organized, powerful and beyond ready for an entirely different system of public safety.

Zoe Levitt: And that starts with a budget that invests in the wellbeing of our communities rather than police. This is the will of the people. And this is what organized communities look like. So to the Commissioner's earlier concern about the police department not being fully staffed. I ask her as to envision how much safer our communities would be if our libraries, public schools, healthcare programs and housing were fully funded. This moment and movement demands bold leadership, and that means transformation. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Adriana Galgario. Hello, Adriana, can you hear us?

Adriana Galgario: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready. One minute.

Adriana Galgario: Hi. My name is Adriana Galgario and I'm a resident of District one and I would like to further support the defunding of OPD's budget by at least 50% or \$150 million and invest back into essential community services as outlined by The Black New Deal and follow the eight to abolition. Additionally, I would like to urge the commission to demilitarize the police by disallowing the use of all



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

police force against protesters, including tear gas and rubber bullets, as well as any physical force, which in my experience is always disproportionate to the reasonable exercise of our right to assemble.

Adriana Galgario: And going forward, I urge you, as these necessary budget cuts need to and should be made, that these funds are allocated in coalition with black and brown, but especially black-led organizations and do not simply move them around in a shell game that reproduce the same inequities that have been so ineffective in keeping our communities safe, equitable, and ones that will allow our community's beauty and brilliance to flourish. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Courtney. Hello, Courtney, can you hear us?

Courtney Morris: I can hear you. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute, whenever you're ready.

Courtney Morris: My name is Courtney Morris in District three, and I am a new proud and eagerly learning member of the APTP. This is the first time I've ever attended a meeting of the Oakland Police Commission and it's a joke. You were stuck in slow motion talking about towing vehicles. The UN Human Rights Council is suggesting review of systemic racism in the U S. The entire world is literally protesting along with us against police brutality. And you didn't really reflect on systemic racism and systemic police brutality within OPD.

Courtney Morris: I am ashamed, and you shouldn't be too. We are all saying the same thing because we all want the same change. And we won't change our tone, only you can change yours. The divestment of funds in social services in the name of racial and social justice is not rocket science. It will take work, but it's the right thing to do. You all have access to public health statistics. We demand the defunding of the OPD by at least 150 million, and we need to pass the Black New Deal.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Mariano Rossetti. Hello, Marianna, can you hear us?

Mariano Rossetti: Hey, you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute whenever you're ready.

Mariano Rossetti: Great. Thank you. No, I just want to say that I agree with everyone else around here. We definitely have a problem on our hands. Interim Chief Manheimer, I'm sorry, but everything that you presented to us today is a complete joke. The rest



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

of the OPD... I come from a place where if in employment, if you fail your job, you're reprimanded and fired. To the interim chief and the OPD, you have all failed, historically have all failed, and you deserved to be fired. That's that. Done deal. To Commissioner Jordan, who did not want to hear repetitions, let me just say this, defund the police by at least 70%. Defund the police by at least 70%. Defund the police by at least 70%. And by the way, defund to police by at least 70%. you will not shut us down. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is Brittney Jones. Hello, Brittney, can you hear us?

Brittney Jones: Yeah, I can hear you.

Juanito Rus: You have one minute whenever you're ready.

Brittney Jones: Okay. Thank you. I just wanted to say I stand with APTP. I'm also a newer member of this organization, and I just want their voices to be echoed and to be amplified. I cannot believe the police offered only a \$2 million diversion of funds. They defunded nothing tonight. Clearly, they do not believe in reform. Defunding the OPD by 50% is the only option. Why does defunding OPD sound so radical? We've defunded our education system and thus supported and escalated the schools to prison pipeline. I also call for the officers to pay for their own police misconduct payouts. This is overage the enormous budget, and it's completely unnecessary. We need to dissolve the police and rebuild from the ground up with less than half the budget. Focus on people, not property. Focus on the topic at hand, not cursing. Cut funding by 50%. Require deescalation training. Remove military weapons from the police. This is barbaric. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is Christopher Aulbach. Hello, Christopher, can you hear us?

Christopher Aulbach: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute whenever you're ready.

Christopher Aulbach: Hi, I'm a fourth year medical student at UCSF staff, a public health researcher here in Oakland, and a resident of District 3. And I emphatically support cutting OPD's budget by 50% or \$150 million and investing it in passing the full Black New Deal as developed by the Anti Police-Terror Project. In addition to a racial justice and human rights issue, defunding police is a public health intervention and moral imperative, the effects of which will be felt for generations. There's not a single thing you can do with more dramatic health effects on the public health for the city of Oakland.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Christopher Aulbach: I'd be happy to share with you the research demonstrating the harms of police to public health simply by existing and doing their jobs, but we don't need any more studies to know that defunding the police will save lives. I am not exaggerating by saying that by defunding OPD by 50%, you can have a bigger impact on human health than I can have in my entire career as a researcher or a physician. Defund OPD by 50%, use that money to pass the full Black New Deal, stop violence of any kind against protesters. I yield my time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue I have listed as Izzy. Hello, Izzy, can you hear us?

Izzy: Hi. Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute whenever you're ready.

Izzy: Thank you. I'm going to keep it pretty short, but I just want to echo and amplify every single thing that has been said tonight, and just point out that we know what needs to be done. We don't need to continue to invest in surveys or studies or think about these measures of reform that we know do not work. Listen to what the people are saying tonight. Listen to the advance of a APTP, follow their lead, do the right thing, and accept all of their demands. We will continue to show up. We will continue to have our voices heard. You know what you need to do. Take action.

Ryan: Can I say something, too?

Izzy: Wait, one more thing.

Ryan: Also, this is Ryan, Izzy's roommate, I'm a teacher, and I have a lot of friends who teach in OUSD and they don't know that they can continue teaching there anymore because they don't have enough funding, even though they went on strike last year just for resources. So, I think it's really important to focus on education and preventative measures.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is Asha Vora. Hello, Asha, can you hear us?

Asha Vora: Yes. This is Asha. I can hear you. Can you hear me okay?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute whenever you're ready.

Asha Vora: Okay. So, then I press start, correct?

Juanito Rus: Yeah. I'll press start. You go.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Asha Vora: Okay. Good evening. Thank you very much. I apologize for being the last person here. I'm Asha Vora. I work for the Alameda County Public Defender's Office, and I shadow everything, everyone else said. And it's not just about these minuscule changes and whatever the financial issues we discussed today that have no relevance on anything in Alameda County. I've seen the PDRDs. The Black Lives Matter movement is nothing new. When you watch these videos, when you watch the PDRDs and you see what the police do and hide, this racism, this pandemic, everything that's happening is nothing new, and it's time that we really have to defund the police or at least allocate the funds towards more necessary. Because all this is is systemic racism. I'm a POC, but I don't experience the same kind of racism because I'm not black or brown in the same type of way.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. At this time, Chair Jackson, we have made it to the end of our list. I have two individuals who were earlier dropped that I am happy to call on again, but I will leave it to your discretion.
- Regina Jackson: Yes. For those people that were accidentally dropped, please call them back into the queue so that they can have their time. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next person I have on the list then is Sarah Grebe. Hello, Sarah, can you hear us?
- Sarah Grebe: Hi. Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you this time. You have one minute.
- Sarah Grebe: Thank you. It was mentioned earlier that mutual aid can come here and terrorize Oakland residents since they don't live here, but neither do the majority of OPD. As of June 2018, only 9% of Oakland police officers lived in Oakland, and only 33% of officers live in Alameda County. It should be a requirement that the officers live here and stop othering the community they police. I see mentally ill people who I don't know how to help all the time, but I won't call the police. They are not trained and often respond with silence. People with untreated mental illness are 16 times more likely to be killed during an policing encounter. [inaudible 04:32:12] 50% of all calls have a mental health component [inaudible 00:08:18]. She's making the case to reallocate resources and reinvest it into community because we have to start somewhere. Defund the OPD by 50%, invest it back into the communities, and fund macro. Cut your contract from the Highway Patrol. Stop using violence against the protests and stop using chemical weapons that are banned in warfare.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The last person that I have on the list is listed as CCW. Hello, CCW, can you hear us?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- CCW: Hello.
- Juanito Rus: You have one minute whenever you're ready.
- CCW: Okay. First of all, Manheimer said that officers don't usually go out to low level calls like public disturbance unless they've been escalated, meaning to me, you're now sending two, three, four squad cars for a call that could have been deescalated. Not only is this expensive, it's absolutely dangerous with how pointing a gun on someone is a police officer's baseline response. You talk about shortcomings, including data collection and website structure. It makes us all wonder and speculate that your substantial budget goes to egregious salaries, lawsuit settlements, and military-style equipment. What are you using this money for?
- CCW: I also want to put a light that whenever the city cuts budgets on things like education or social services, there's hardly a discussion as rigorous as this. They're left with less money and to just figure it out. Why do police demand better treatment than our communities in social services? We obviously don't trust the OPD to clean up their own house. I push the commission to defund the police by 50%, non-negotiable, and the concrete plans already laid out by BOP and APTP. They've done the job already. Last meeting, it was also mentioned that OPD regular goes over their budget-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. No, that's the end of your time. At this time, Madam Chair, I'll turn the meeting back to you.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. That was incredible content, and I know that we as a commission now need to reflect on the documents that were presented, the voices that were heard. And I know that we also had an attachment of council member Nikki Bass' document recommending defunding \$25 million. I'll now will unmute Commissioner Anderson, whose hand is up.
- Tara Anderson: Thank you, Chair Jackson, and thank you for all of the public comments. I appreciate all of you. I appreciate every minute. I ask you to stay with us to continue to challenge us. This is a long, hard work, and we need all of you to get it done. I look forward to our meeting next week, when we will take actions on items that remove tools of repression, increase accountability, and increased resources to communities and survivors of police violence. It's right to call out in frustration about the line item review of the budget. We need to move beyond the more palatable divestment conversations about unhoused unit, mental health response, all of which I support don't get me wrong, and towards the ending of the police engagement and abuses and activities that harm people who are suffering and in several cases equate to entrapment.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Tara Anderson: What I mean here is defunding, engaging buy/bust operations, and to explain the law enforcement jargon there. Those that are operations whereby officers undercover use marked money to purchase drugs off of individuals. We've found in practice and seeing countless national experts decry this practice as abusive. We need to end reverse stings targeting sex workers. I find the savior dialogue that I've heard in our meetings particularly disturbing. I think that divestment in these two areas, that aren't just the more palatable conversations about shifting line item budgets to other places, directly speak to the activities that we don't want our law enforcement engaging in. I thank council member Bass for giving us something to react to. Largely reflects, I think, that she had staff or she herself was listening to our previous commission meeting.
- Tara Anderson: I think as we shift, and I said this last week and I feel like it's important to say it again, as we shift funds to alternatives to police response, they must not be at a discounted rate. If we were willing to pay for the police to do something at a certain amount, if we are shifting that responsibility back to community hands where it belongs, it should not be at a discounted rate. We also need to be courageous as we compel the city council, who does have authority to take action in this circumstance where we do not, to move beyond the easy to talk about shift in responsibility that law enforcement has admitted themselves should have never been in their hands to begin with, but really, deconstruct some of the structures and activities that our department is engaging in that we no longer desire, especially at a time when we are seeing crime rates on a decline, incarceration on decline, and we are still safe.
- Tara Anderson: I want to be sure that we're moving beyond these talking points, and I hear the frustration, I understand it, we sit in it also. At the same time, details do matter, so I appreciate the questions from my colleagues. I appreciate Interim Chief Manheimer's attempts in earnest to respond to all of our questions. But we need to be courageous and creative and move beyond this. And I think, again, at Commissioner Prather's words of ensuring that budget is truly a reflection of our values, and I would love to hear what he has to say after we've heard all of this.
- Regina Jackson: Just so happens that Commissioner Prather's hand is up. Before he speaks, though, I did want to clarify that I was able to identify that we actually do not have a contract with CHP, so I just wanted to clarify that for anybody who thinks that we did, because I know we heard it several times in the public comment. So, I just wanted to clarify that. Thank you. Commissioner Prather, I'm unmuting you.
- Edwin Prather: Thank you, Madam Chair, and thanks for the lead in Commissioner Anderson. I, too, want to echo the fact that I'm really appreciative of the fact that it's past 11:00 o'clock at night, we've got over 150 Oakland citizens still with us, and had several hundred earlier in the evening. Just really speaks to how impactful we



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

can all be on these issues. I keep going back to ask something I said a couple of meetings ago, which really continues to hit home for me, which is why is it that law enforcement nationally, including OPD, act as if they're not accountable to black Americans? And that's really, as some of the speakers have said, the core of what we should be talking about here. To me, policing has been this tool of violence used historically to facilitate gross inequities, inequalities, and systems of exploitation, such as slavery, colonialism, breaking up of unions, and the suppression of workers' rights. And so, for us, to say that policing is best suited to solve a broad range of community problems is completely misguided and misplaced.

Edwin Prather: Further, the idea that we can fix problems with a series of superficial procedural reforms, to me understands the very nature of the police department and the fact that the Oakland Police Department has been under federal supervision for over 17 years. I hear public comment, and maybe more importantly, I listen to it. Defunding the police department by itself is not what people are asking for, and we hear the call, we hear the phrase, "Defund the police department." But what I hear the citizenry calling for is a redistribution of resources because the city of Oakland, we have problems. We have problems of violence we have problems of disorder, and we need help. And frankly, we need help, but in most of these cases, we don't need help from the police department.

Edwin Prather: And I think we heard from Chief Manheimer tonight, the OPD agrees with that. OPD agrees that they shouldn't be the responding office for most of our problems, but they've become that. And so, to me, the effort needs, and what the discussion we need to be having and the city that needs to be having, is about redistribution and not just defunding. What we do needs to be targeted, and it needs to be specific. But this policing problem, it's a political failure. We have to call that out and call upon the city council, who is the body who can fix this problem. And it's not enough in my mind, it doesn't go nearly far enough to recommend to the city council that we cut the police budget by an arbitrary percentage, whether that's 10% or 25%, 50%, or 75%, it's not enough. It's not enough to put out our arbitrary percentage because we have to go further.

Edwin Prather: I think one of the early speakers said we need to reimagine Oakland, and I wrote that down here on my notepad. And I heard another speaker say we can't wait for a perfect plan. We just have to have a plan. And I believe that, because as a community, Oakland must become less reliant on OPD, and I don't think to say that is controversial. We need to identify the areas where we don't need uniformed and armed officers to respond, and that was the question we were asking in the minutia of the budget. Identifying areas like traffic, crossing guards, dealing with the homeless or housing displaced, dealing with community or business mediations, dealing with neighborhood disputes, dealing with those in a mental health crisis, and even some kind of crimes, including, I'll



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

take a cue from my fellow commissioner, Commissioner Anderson, things like that equate to entrapment such as buy/bust and reverse stings. I hadn't thought of that, but I'd like to adopt that.

Edwin Prather: And maybe the difference is that we don't have officers respond to misdemeanors, but they do to felonies. Or maybe we don't have them respond to nonviolent crimes, but we have them respond to violent crimes. I don't have the answers to that. But as a community, we need to figure out those areas in which we don't want, we don't need, uniformed, armed officers to respond, and I think the police department welcomes that. And so, what I would propose is that we recommend to the city council to adopt a reforms that divert funds to communities of color and to replace police presence in nonviolent, non-criminal situations, and that we replaced them with social workers, homeless outreach workers, and other unarmed professionals with specialized training. In essence, the city must develop a plan to remove OPD from all non-criminal calls. We must recommend that the city council adopt the reforms now and that it create a plan. And yes, this is not a perfect plan, but it's a plan. It's our plan, and frankly, after hearing from 200 public speakers tonight, it's the plan of the citizenry of Oakland.

Edwin Prather: Second, we need to demand that OPD come to our very next police commission meeting on June 25th with a new DGO, a new Department General Order, that states that OPD will not use military weapons against unarmed citizens, including chemical weapons, rubber bullets, militarized vehicles, and the whole lot. I know that we have a militarized weapon plan or ordinance that we're discussing and voting on, and that will cover some of this, but I want OPD to come, having approved its own DGO, its own Department General Order, for implementation. And it needs to do that, and it needs to be prepared for us to adopt it on the 25th to go into effect immediately. Failure for the OPD to do this will show that it's tone deaf, that it's not willing, and that it's not able to change.

Edwin Prather: So, Madam Chair, I will make two motions when you are ready. One, to further our recommendations to city council, and one regarding my desire to have OPD come to the next meeting, our next meeting with a new DGO regarding the use of militarized weapons.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Commissioner Prather. I have one more hand up from Commissioner Harris. I have unmuted you.

Ginale Harris: Thank you, Chair. I have been listening and absorbing all of this comments from the public, and first I want to say that I'm trying to just wrap my head around... I hear defund the police, and I get it. But I want to come up with a concrete plan, a solid, an ad hoc of some sort, to work on what are we going to do with the money? Right? I heard John say we have to work with other departments to see



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

where the need is, to see if we can reallocate funds. It's not you just defund the police. Okay? We defund them, but how are we going to get the money to where we need to go? And I think the Police Commission should come up with a recommendation working with the public to do that. So, not only if we're going to defund them, we need to figure out where we're going to reallocate the money, and that could be a immediate recommendation.

Ginale Harris: Two, I want to bring a point that the finding the police is not going to stop them from killing us, so all that our listening is not going to stop them from killing us. You're still going to have the same disgruntled police officers that don't like black people on the force, so defunding them is not going to stop them from killing us. What's going to stop them from killing us is to take away their protections. And one of the things I said when I became a police commissioner, that my goal was, was to get rid of the police Bill of Rights, because that protects them when they kill us. So, no, I say that not only do all these demands, "Defund the police, defund police," I hear you, but we need to get rid of POBAR because then they will stop killing us, because then they will be held accountable for killing us. They will go to jail like every other person goes to jail when you murder.

Ginale Harris: But because the city of Oakland has a contract with the Police Union that gives them certain protections and amenities that are outrageous, and I don't know if anybody's read it, but it's ridiculous. And who would even agree to it? So, I encourage you all to look at it, because this here is not going to stop them from killing us. So, I hear you, "Defund the police." Okay. And I'll even be part of an ad hoc to come up with where are we going to put the money? Let's make sure that it gets shifted to where it needs to be so we're not waiting a whole year or two years for the money to get rerouted. Let's come up with a plan to tell city council this is where the money's going to go. This is where we want it to go. Since it's ours, this is where we want it to go.

Ginale Harris: But just to say, "Okay, well, defund them," okay, defund them, and then what? Who do we need to talk to? Do we need to go to different departments? Where? Where does the money need to go? We know we needed at our schools, so how do we get it there? Can we just say, "Hey, we want 20 million to go to the schools," and they'll give it to them? Is that how it works? I don't know. But I want to know so we can know and make sure that when we do defund them, the money goes where we want it to go. That's a concern for me. But it's not going to stop them from killing us. So, I'd like to come up with a plan for that because I believe that's why we're all here, so they can stop killing us.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Harris. And yes, I do agree with you. We want them to stop killing everybody, but especially black people. So, there were no other comments. I wanted to clarify that it's the city council's responsibility to manage



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

the budget, and while we can create an ad hoc for the future, there is a specific timeline that they need information and recommendations for right now. And so, I would like to call back on Commissioner Prather to identify his recommendation, and forgive me because it's the hour is late and I need for him to clarify what it is that his recommendation would seek to do. And I think that it will help us get a bit of the ways down to what it is that we want to crystallize in terms of recommendations, not necessarily dollar amounts, but subject amounts. So, here's Commissioner Prather. I've unmuted you.

Edwin Prather: Thank you, Madam Chair. So, I have two motions. I'll make the first first, and then pause. I move that we recommend to the city council via letter that the city council adopt reforms that divert funds to communities of color and replace police presence in nonviolent, non-criminal situations with social workers, homeless outreach workers, and other unarmed professionals with specialized training. We must recommend to the city council that it develop a plan to remove the Oakland Police Department from all non-criminal calls.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Prather. I recognize Commissioner Anderson's hand is up. I'm unmuting you.

Tara Anderson: Commissioner Prather, I wonder if you would take a friendly amendment to incorporate some of the nonviolent criminal activity and engagement that was also discussed.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Prather?

Edwin Prather: Yeah. Commissioner Anderson, I thought I had accommodated that in saying that replacing police presence in nonviolent, non-criminal situations, but does that not go far enough? Are you contemplating something a little different?

Tara Anderson: I apologize. Maybe it's my tired ears. I did not hear that, that distinction. Would you mind restating the motion? My apologies, but I want to make sure that I hear it correctly.

Edwin Prather: Of course. And as is our practice, this recommendation would be in a form of a letter, and the meat of the letter would be this motion, which would be indicated that we voted on and approved if it is approved. I would anticipate that it would also have some discussion of potential areas where there's not a need for uniformed armed officers that really fleshes out these nonviolent, non-criminal situations with more specificity, including language regarding your example of criminal activities that relate to entrapment such as buy/bust and reverse stings. I think that that would be appropriate. So, my motion, just to repeat that portion of it, is that we recommend to city council that it adopt reforms that divert funds to communities of color and replace police presence in



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

nonviolent, non-criminal situations with social workers, homeless outreach workers, and other unarmed professionals with specialized training, and that the city adopt... Or sorry, city council adopt a plan to remove OPD from all non-criminal calls.

Regina Jackson: Back to you, Commissioner Anderson. And then, I have two new hands up.

Tara Anderson: I would like to second that motion.

Regina Jackson: Okay. It has been properly moved and seconded. I know we've already taken public comment. Let me see if there's a call for the question. Commissioner Dorado-

Jose Dorado: Thank you.

Regina Jackson: ... you are unmuted.

Jose Dorado: Thank you, Chair. I appreciate the opportunity to speak after these three hours of comments. A couple of things, one is that I appreciate the thoughtfulness of the commissioners in going through this whole process and listening to all the comments and I'm torn because, I appreciate, I more than appreciate, I applaud all of the speakers. Particularly the 158 that are with us right now, as well as the 300 and some that were with us originally with their tenacity in terms of this issue. But I criticize many of the speakers in a couple of areas. One, do your damn homework in terms of finding out what it is that we actually do here on the police commission and all of the work that we've done, particularly our chair and Janell Harris, our former vice chair.

Jose Dorado: You guys use speakers who criticize the commission as a joke. And I don't take that all that personally, but I do take it personally when you criticize people like our chair and our former vice chair in all of the work that they have done for years. And evidently, you know very little, if anything, about all their sacrifices in terms of time, effort, and in some cases, money. So that's one.

Jose Dorado: The other is that I think I level, another criticism in that it's fine and again, I applaud your tenacity, but we heard much of the same from everybody for hours and would have been really useful if we'd have had some specifics that Commissioner Harris touched on. And that is, what specifically in the OPD budget should be cut and to what extent, so that it better serves the community. And secondly, what is the mechanism by which we determine those funds that are cut from OPD? Where should they go and how should they get there? And to what extent. What's a mechanism by which those decisions should be made. So, take some time, speakers and community, to come up with those specifics, because we could have used that kind of input tonight and in



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

the future. So if anybody wants to respond to these criticisms that I'm leveling, I'm easy to find. Please get in touch with me. I'd love to talk to you. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, commissioner Dorado. Again, we have a motion that has been properly. Second. I have two commissioners in the queue Commissioner Jordan and then Commissioner Harris. You're unmuted. Mr. Jordan.

David Jordan: Okay. Now I'm unmuted. I think we were having a, "you unmute me, then I unmute me" whole thing. I wanted to speak to the motion. I agreed with the motion, except for one small piece of wording in the sort of final line or final bit there just categorizing those people, taking those roles that the police would be exiting as professional. I think that it sort of limits the people we potentially could put in those roles or that the city could put in those roles. And I've had conversations with community members. I spent a lot of time thinking about what this means even before I was on the commission. I do think that we should look to apply a more sort of community-centric perspective on that, and maybe have community members in the sort of peer advocacy sort of role, at least in parts, maybe in tandem with actual clinicians. But as the wording stands, I'm concerned that any program that was piloted or brought online would only be able to use licensed clinicians and bear little fit on the ground, unfortunately, and I just wouldn't want to limit ourselves.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. We'll go to Commissioner Prather, after we hear from Commissioner Harris to see if we can perhaps amend it or clarify to your liking. Commissioner Harris, you're unmuted.

Ginale Harris: Thank you, chair. I am somewhat in agreeance with Commissioner Prather. However, I was in the foster care system when I was a kid and I dealt with a lot of social workers and the experience for black children and brown children in an institution of that nature with social workers is not a good thing. It's not a good thing. You have a lot of social workers that go to school and get these degrees, and they know nothing about our culture or anything about us, but they know what's best for us. And we see that in a lot of situations. My recommendation would be having nonprofit, grassroots agencies be involved because, I am a product of one of those agencies that helped raise me.

Ginale Harris: And I got nothing but love from them. Loving care, open arms. I got wisdom. I got elders, I got kindness. I got treated with respect fairly, and I can always go there. You know, sometimes I ate there. So it was a safe haven for me. I felt totally safe there. I would caution the fact of bringing in social workers. They have a tendency to hurt more than help, especially with black and brown. So I would ask if Commissioner Prather you'd be willing to either broaden or amend your motion to include grassroots community agencies.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Commissioner Harris. Back to you, Commissioner Prather. You're unmuted.

Edwin Prather: Thank you, Madam chair. I'm editing it on the fly. Give me one second here. So just my knee jerk reaction, I don't necessarily believe wordsmithing this, that professionals means clinicians, but if there's ambiguity in it, I'm happy to change professionals to individuals. I'm also happy to add in the phrase, nonprofit organizations. I don't believe that that it requires this much clarity to the city council, but I do want to respect and honor my fellow commissioners, so the motion would currently read that we would recommend to the city council to adopt a reform that divert funds to communities of color and replace police presence in nonviolent non-criminal situations with social workers, nonprofit organizations, homeless outreach workers, and other unarmed individuals with specialized training. The city council must develop a plan to remove OPD from all non-criminal calls.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Anderson, it's to you for the..

Tara Anderson: I second, the motion as amended.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. It has been properly moved and seconded. May we take a vote? Commissioner Prather?

Edwin Prather: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harris?

Ginale Harris: No.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Anderson?

Tara Anderson: Aye.

Regina Jackson: An aye from myself. Motion passes. Commissioner Prather, memory serves that you had a second motion, is that correct?

Edwin Prather: I do, but I do want to have a bit of a discussion beforehand because it just came to my attention that Judge Spiro in Northern district issued an order on a temporary restraining order this afternoon. And the order just came across my desk and it enjoins OPD from, and I'm going to read from the order, using tear



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

gas or any chemical weapons against persons taking part in a protest or demonstration, firing rubber bullets or similar projectiles at person's taking part in a protest or demonstration, firing flash bang grenades at persons taking part in a protest or demonstration.

Edwin Prather: The prohibitions of these three items, and I'm paraphrasing here, do not apply where upon the decision of the OPD operations commander or incident commander is determined that the use of tear gas or any chemical weapon or flash bang grenades is reasonably necessary to protect the lives of people to protect people from serious bodily injury or prevent the imminent destruction of property at Oakland City Hall, the OPD administration building, or the OPD Eastmont mall substation.

Edwin Prather: Flash bang grenades may not be fired directly at persons, but must be fired in a safe direction. To the fullest extent possible such use of tear gas or other chemical weapons and flash bang grenades is allowed only after an audible warning of their use has been issued, and after sufficient time to comply has been granted.

Edwin Prather: In all actions in which the Oakland police department calls in police personnel from other jurisdictions under mutual aid agreements, to the fullest extent possible, OPD personnel shall endeavor to assume frontline positions between mutual aid offers and demonstrators. This order shall remain in effect until further order of the court and shall be heard on July 2nd, 2020 on plaintiff's motion for preliminary injunction.

Edwin Prather: So what I want to bring up to my colleagues here is that when we were discussing mutual aid, I don't recall hearing anything from the department about being issued a TRO today regarding the use of militarized weapons, regarding the use of chemical weapons, rubber bullets, or flash bang grenade. We had a very clear discussion about how mutual aid was going to work and how they could be controlled. It was an opportunity for the department to tell us, well, actually, we got a TRO today and we have to take frontline positions. We have to address the use of these things.

Edwin Prather: And that's very disconcerting to me cause these feel like hide the ball tactics. And so I apologize for this. I literally just pulled this up as I was making them the motion on the other order, but it's clear to me that the department isn't going to come on the 25th and adopt what they were forced to do by the court. But I'm going to make the motion anyway. And I want the department, I move that we demand that OPD come to our June 25th meeting with a department general order that states that they will not use military weapons, such as chemical weapons, rubber bullets, and militarized vehicles against unarmed citizens.



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Regina Jackson: I will second that. I have two hands, it's been properly moved. And second, excuse me. I have Commissioner Jordan's hand up followed by Commissioner Anderson. You've been unmuted Commissioner Jordan.
- David Jordan: I'd actually like to wait until after the vote on this motion. I have something else to discuss that is not this. I can wait,
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Anderson. You've been unmuted.
- Tara Anderson: Thank you, Chair Jackson that seeing in front of me, but just based off what I heard, I do believe that description would fall within, based on the conversations we've had so far with OPD by, fall within the interpretation they have of their own crowd control policy. So while I appreciate the court taking that action, the detail around reasonableness, is a bit... I would like to look forward to having more dialogue around when this matter is brought to us next week. And I appreciate within the motion, the specific call out of the unarmed and no inclusion of qualifiers, but I just do want to call out that I believe that OPD response is highly likely to really be that they believe that their own training bulletin does fall within the existing order or the newly existing order. So it is important that we all do our homework on that training bulletin and be prepared to call out where it does not and ensure that they are responsive and that they respond in creating a general order that does, I would say, go beyond what the court has asked.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you Commissioner Anderson. I agree with your point about the detail around reasonableness, because you can use that as a filler to, to justify anything. So I think it's time for us to vote. We have had a motion, seconded and let's see. Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Prather?
- Edwin Prather: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harris?
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harris? Are you there?
- Ginale Harris: Yes, I'm here, Chair.
- Regina Jackson: I didn't hear your vote. I'm sorry.
- Ginale Harris: Can you repeat the motion?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Prather, would you repeat the motion please?
- Edwin Prather: Yes, chair. I vote that we demand that OPD come to our next meeting on June 25th with a DGO that States that OPD will not use military weapons, such as chemical weapons, rubber bullets, and militarized vehicles, against, unarmed citizens.
- Regina Jackson: That is the motion. It has been seconded. And that's what we're voting on. So back to you Commissioner Harris?
- Ginale Harris: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Great. Thank you. Commissioner Anderson?
- Tara Anderson: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Very good. Thank you. An Aye for myself and that's unanimous.
- Edwin Prather: Yes for me, chair.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry. I thought I got you.
- Edwin Prather: It's been a long night, but thank you. Yes, yes for me.
- Regina Jackson: No, absolutely. Thank you very much. Now, if there wasn't another motion, I think I need to go back to Commissioner Jordan who wanted to say something. You're unmuted Commissioner Jordan.
- David Jordan: Thank you. Thank you, chair. One additional piece that I think that we should consider as a recommendation to city council is a thing that came up at our last meeting that was voiced by Commissioner Gage is that maybe we should suggest that or recommend that they seek to phase out the internal affairs Bureau and bolster the CPRA. At this point, with everything that's going on, it's time for bold moves, and this would both serve to reduce their overall budget and also increase the likelihood of actual real reform going forward and have an oversight with more teeth. I'm just putting that out there.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Commissioner Jordan. There is a hand from Commissioner Dorado and followed by Commissioner Anderson. You're unmuted Commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Thank you. A Chair Jackson just real quickly. I certainly am in favor of phasing out the IED and having those funds go to the CPRA. I think that's exactly the direction that we need to go. One of the things that Commissioner Harris



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

touched on was something I wanted to comment on, and that was that her comment that they will, even despite what we've talked about today, they will still be killing us. And I think that speaks to the fact that the culture, as I've said before, of OPD doesn't need to be reformed, it needs to be destroyed. It needs to be rebuilt from the bottom up.

Jose Dorado: So this is what the speakers, instead of giving us the same set of points that we heard tonight, can give us more specifics around exactly how that might well be done. How can we change the culture within OPD so that in fact it serves the community, our community? What our tax dollars go to and go for. There's public safety. What specifically can be done to change that culture so that in fact it does protect and serve. In fact, it does contribute to public safety. So those are the kinds of things that I would very much like to hear from the community in specific. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much Commissioner Dorado. Commissioner Anderson? You're unmuted.

Tara Anderson: Thank you, Chair Jackson. And I appreciate alternate Commissioner Jordan. We shouldn't be working at this late hour. For bringing up points that I made during our meeting last week. Where I called out that CPRA has one third of the budget of IA, and we were remiss in not including it in this recommendation and so I fully support an advisory being included to call out the need to reallocate funds from IA towards CPRA to create more equity in oversight and accountability.

Regina Jackson: I'll second that motion. It's been moved and seconded, but I see Commissioner Prather's hand. You're unmuted.

Edwin Prather: Well, thank you, chair. I'll wait till after the vote on this motion. Thanks.

Regina Jackson: Okay, so it's been properly moved and seconded. We've taken public comment. Are we ready to vote? Commissioner Harris?

Ginale Harris: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Anderson?

Tara Anderson: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Prather?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

- Edwin Prather: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. An aye for myself, so motion passes unanimously. And so thank you very much. Alternate Commissioner Jordan for raising that. Back to Commissioner Prather who wanted to say something after we voted. You've been unmuted.
- Edwin Prather: Thank you, Madam chair. I think I just wanted to highlight that again in regards to our public speakers. And I know that there's over 130, 140 people who are still with us this evening, that, we've put these recommendations in place and our recommendations will go to city council. And I hope and I trust that this community of people will bring the same energy and passion and statements. And, and even if they're super repetitive, I think that the message is going to be heard.
- Edwin Prather: That it's not about just cuts, but it's about the redistribution. It's about the plan going forward. And we're giving the public the tools that it needs to support in front of city council. And that city council needs to hear your voice. And I'm sorry to say you're going to have to do that all over again, but for as many people that can come out and support this cause in front of the city council now is the time. It's not just no time as the present, but we have a window to affect real change and change in the way the way the police operate and frankly, in the way the city operates for decades to come. And so now is that moment for everyone. And so I think we're all as a commission, happy to be a part of it and happy to offer our recommendations to city council. And we count on this public to continue to carry the water for that, for our recommendation. So I just want to say that.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Prather. If you would be so kind as to send me the language from the motion and then commissioner Anderson, if you could send me the language from this last motion so that I can try to get the letter done tomorrow and sent off to city council, that would be great. Is that something that's possible? Commissioner Prather?
- Edwin Prather: Yes Madame Chair.
- Regina Jackson: Very good. Commissioner Anderson?
- Tara Anderson: Yes, Chair Jackson.
- Regina Jackson: Terrific. Thank you very much. So it is now 11:51. I would like to accept a motion to adjourn our meeting. And again, thank the public. Thank my fellow commissioners for this excellent analysis and debate and set of recommendations. Nobody wants to raise their hand to move to adjourn?



# OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING TRANSCRIPT

June 18, 2020

Edwin Prather: I move to adjourn.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. It has been moved. Commissioner Anderson?

Tara Anderson: I second.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. It's been properly moved and seconded and last vote. Commissioner Anderson?

Tara Anderson: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you. Commissioner Harris?

Ginale Harris: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Prather?

Edwin Prather: Yes. An aye for myself. We are unanimous and it is 1152. We are adjourned. I thank you very, very much for investing and sacrificing and just caring. Thank you. We'll see you guys next week.

Jose Dorado: Night everybody.

Regina Jackson: Night.

Tara Anderson: Goodnight. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you Mr. Rus.

**From:** [Gabriel Kardener](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#); [Office of the Mayor](#); [McElhane, Lynette](#)  
**Subject:** Gabriel Kardener Agenda Item IV, June 18, 2020  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 8:49:35 AM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My name is Gabriel Kardener and I would like to eComment on Agenda Item IV of the Oakland Police Commission's Special Budget Hearing on June 18, 2020. I am an Oakland native and current resident.

The Oakland Police Department takes almost half of Oakland's general fund every year, taking away from desperately needed resources from housing, parks, libraries, and other vital services, yet the investment in policing has not made the Town safer. OPD remains an embarrassment and a lethal threat to our Black and Brown communities. It is time we defunded the police.

The City Council must divest the People's Money from the violent, racist, and corrupt Oakland Police Department, and reinvest in the relief and resilience of the Town's Black and Brown communities.

We DEMAND that the Oakland City Council DEFUND the OPD and REINVEST in the community by:

- Defunding OPD by at least 50%
- Investing these funds into the passage of the full Black New Deal
- Stopping the use of violence of any kind against protestors, including "non-lethal" weapons such as tear gas, pepper spray, and rubber bullets
- Cutting the contract with the California Highway Patrol, who brutally murdered Erik Sagado in East Oakland a week ago, and removing them from Oakland

We can best keep our community safe by using the People's Money to provide living wage jobs, housing for all, youth programs, health care, restorative justice, and other essential community services.

Some of the money from the OPD budget could be used to fund the MACRO model which should mirror successful programs like MH First in Sacramento -- a program which functions independently from law enforcement and was designed by and for impacted communities.

Thank you,

Gabriel Kardener

**From:** [Aviva Kardener](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#); [Office of the Mayor](#); [McElhane, Lynette](#)  
**Subject:** Aviva Kardener Agenda Item IV, June 18, 2020  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 9:05:41 AM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My name is Aviva, and I would like to eComment on Agenda Item IV of the Oakland Police Commission's Special Budget Hearing on June 18, 2020. I am an Oakland native and current resident.

The Oakland Police Department takes almost half of Oakland's general fund every year, taking away from desperately needed resources from housing, parks, libraries, and other vital services, yet the investment in policing has not made the Town safer. OPD remains an embarrassment and a lethal threat to our Black and Brown communities. It is time we defunded the police.

The City Council must divest the People's Money from the violent, racist, and corrupt Oakland Police Department, and reinvest in the relief and resilience of the Town's Black and Brown communities.

We DEMAND that the Oakland City Council DEFUND the OPD and REINVEST in the community by:

- Defunding OPD by at least 50%
- Investing these funds into the passage of the full Black New Deal
- Stopping the use of violence of any kind against protestors, including "non-lethal" weapons such as tear gas, pepper spray, and rubber bullets
- Cutting the contract with the California Highway Patrol, who brutally murdered Erik Sagado in East Oakland a week ago, and removing them from Oakland

We can best keep our community safe by using the People's Money to provide living wage jobs, housing for all, youth programs, health care, restorative justice, and other essential community services.

Some of the money from the OPD budget could be used to fund the MACRO model which should mirror successful programs like MH First in Sacramento -- a program which functions independently from law enforcement and was designed by and for impacted communities.

Thank you,  
Aviva Kardener

**From:** [Jelly Roll](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** In Regards  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 9:42:21 AM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

-----  
Hi I am Pamela Nicole Mint from District 3 and I am in FULL FAVOR OF DEFUNDING OPD. There is no working alternative. Macro has been proven to fail. We need progress and change and this is a start. Reform has been promised without product. We need defunding. As an Oakland resident this is the only option I see making our communities better. Reallocating the money into our communities so that the next generations aren't completely destroyed like ours. We need to decriminalize sex workers. We need to get ever person out of prison who is in there for marijuana charges. If I can go buy weed at a store as if it's Safeway people shouldn't be sitting in prison for this. Abolish the prison system. Slave labor needs to end. We must start with our communities and cities and inspire others. There are people hanging nooses around Lake Merrit. Do you not see what's happening? DEFUND OPD.

**From:** [Jennifer Williams](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Evaluating OPD budget  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 9:45:13 AM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My name is Jennifer Williams and I'm a resident of District 3 in Oakland, CA.

As more and more public schools close, as small businesses struggle to survive the pandemic and families are losing sources of income, and as many individuals are one health crisis away from total financial destitution, it blows my mind to see how much of our city's budget goes towards OPD.

People commit crimes when they are lacking support and resources. I understand some people fear the thought of having police do less, however, wouldn't other trained professionals be better suited for some of the roles police are expected to perform today? Furthermore, criminalizing people only makes it harder for them to find a good job, go to college, or find a place to live - and then are likely to get stuck going in and out of prison.

I urge you to defund OPD by 50% and move those funds to opening more public schools and offering more affordable housing. This current budget isn't working for the people.

Thank you,  
Jennifer Williams

**From:** [Charlie Mintz](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Comment for 6/18 Meeting: Defund / Reinvest  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 9:48:10 AM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My name is Charlie Mintz. I am a resident of District 1. I support the Police Commission's work and urge it to use its power and voice to push the city council towards defunding the police and reinvesting in vital city services. We need the community's voice to be loud and clear on this message. I thank the commission for the work they do, and for representing the best of Oakland.

Sincerely,  
Charlie

**From:** [Adrian Bjune](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#); [Office of the Mayor](#); [McElhane, Lynette](#)  
**Subject:** Adrian Bjune Agenda Item IV, June 18, 2020  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 9:51:50 AM

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Hello,

My name is Adrian Bjune and I would like to eComment on Agenda Item IV of the Oakland Police Commission's Special Budget Hearing on June 18, 2020. I am an Oakland native and current resident.

The Oakland Police Department takes almost half of Oakland's general fund every year, taking away from desperately needed resources from housing, parks, libraries, and other vital services, yet the investment in policing has not made the Town safer. OPD remains an embarrassment and a lethal threat to our Black and Brown communities. It is time we defunded the police.

The City Council must divest the People's Money from the violent, racist, and corrupt Oakland Police Department, and reinvest in the relief and resilience of the Town's Black and Brown communities.

We DEMAND that the Oakland City Council DEFUND the OPD and REINVEST in the community by:

- Defunding OPD by at least 50%
- Investing these funds into the passage of the full Black New Deal
- Stopping the use of violence of any kind against protestors, including "non-lethal" weapons such as tear gas, pepper spray, and rubber bullets
- Cutting the contract with the California Highway Patrol, who brutally murdered Erik Sagado in East Oakland a week ago, and removing them from Oakland

We can best keep our community safe by using the People's Money to provide living wage jobs, housing for all, youth programs, health care, restorative justice, and other essential community services.

Some of the money from the OPD budget could be used to fund the MACRO model which should mirror successful programs like MH First in Sacramento -- a program which functions independently from law enforcement and was designed by and for impacted communities.

Thank you,

Adrian Bjune

**From:** [Gillian Silver](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment: Item IV(b)  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 11:12:43 AM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Dear Police Commission Members,

I have lived in Oakland for nearly 10 years, and I currently live in District 3. Throughout my time in Oakland, I have only seen the police disrupt the local community and harass my neighbors of color and those without homes. Following the guidance of Anti-Police Terror Project, I urge you to DEFUND OPD by 50%, INVEST the remaining \$150 million into the Black New Deal, STOP the use of violence against protesters and CANCEL CHP's contract and REMOVE them from Oakland. Black and Brown people deserve better. Our youth deserve better. Justice for Oscar Grant, Derrick Jones, Davon Jackson, Joshua Pawlick, Jesse Enjaian, Richard Perkins, Nathaniel Wilks, Antonio Clements, Demouria Hogg, Jose Munguia, Antonio Mestas, Broderick Huggins, Alan Blueford, Erik Salgado and the countless others who have been murdered by OPD, the Alameda County Sheriff's Department, CHP or BART Police.

Thank you,  
Gillian Silver

--

[Gillian Silver, MPH, CHES](#)



**From:** [Spencer Murphy](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Comment regarding OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION SPECIAL BUDGET HEARING AGENDA  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 12:36:08 PM

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Hello,

My name is Spencer Murphy, and I have a comment for Agenda Item IV of the Oakland Police Commission's Special Budget Hearing on June 18, 2020. I have been a lifelong member of the Oakland community, and I believe these budget restructurings can have more beneficially profound impact than anything I've witnessed from our local government.

The Oakland Police Department takes almost half of Oakland's general fund every year, taking away from desperately needed resources like housing, libraries, social services and education. This investment in policing has not made the Town safer. We have been trying to solve the symptoms of a unsupported, and undervalued community with police violence and force, instead of trying to fix the cause of such symptoms. OPD remains an embarrassment and a lethal threat to our Black and Brown communities. I OWN is the time to act to make Oakland a safe place for all residents.

The City Council must divest the People's Money from the violent, racist, and corrupt Oakland Police Department, and reinvest in the relief and resilience of the Town's Black and Brown communities.

We DEMAND that the Oakland City Council DEFUND the OPD and REINVEST in the community by:

Defunding OPD by at least 50%

Investing these funds into the programs that would craft a healthier community. Stopping the use of violence of any kind against protestors, including "non-lethal" weapons such as tear gas, pepper spray, and rubber bullets

Cutting the contract with the California Highway Patrol, who brutally murdered Erik Salgado in East Oakland on June 6th, and removing them from Oakland

We can best keep our community safe by using the People's Money to provide living wage jobs, housing for all, youth programs, health care, restorative justice, and other essential community services.

Some of the money from the OPD budget could be used to fund the MACRO model which should mirror successful programs like MH First in Sacramento -- a program which functions independently from law enforcement and was designed by and for impacted communities.

Thank you,

Spencer Murphy

**From:** [Ashley Erickson](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Public comment for Oakland Police Commission special budget hearing  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 1:02:43 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My name is Ashley Erickson and I am an Oakland resident living in District 3. I would like to submit my public comment for Agenda item IV:

I support Council Member Bas's proposal to redirect funding for the Oakland Police Department to community services. But that is not enough - I urge the Special Police Commission to:

- 1) Reduce the general police fund budget by at least 50% and redirect those resources to housing, jobs, youth programs, restorative justice, and mental health workers to keep the community safe.
- 2) Disallow unauthorized overtime by OPD.
- 3) Discontinue use of general fund dollars to pay for settlements due to police murder, misconduct, and negligence.
- 4) Denounce all use of Measure Q funds to pay for salaries of the OPD.

It is time to start listening to those impacted by police violence in our community and start implementing the changes we want to see. The time to divest in policing and invest in our community is long overdue. Please listen seriously to the people you represent.

Thank you,  
Ashley Erickson

**From:** [Natasha](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Budget Meeting Comment/Feedback  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 2:15:28 PM

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Hello,

My name is Natasha Price and I'm from Oakland. I'm writing about tonight's agenda item #4.

I am asking for less money spent on a system (police) that feels violent, oppressive, and unfairly targets people of color. I want Oakland to be a leader in redirecting funds to services to help people instead of hiring enforcers to punish. We could be the city that explores compassionate routes to healing, that provides support. We have a homeless population that is growing and I'm tired of seeing them get shuffled around and their tents destroyed by police, I would rather make sure they are safe and protected, and given access to resources. You can make history or be left in the past, you have the power to make changes that could improve people's lives instead of destroying them. Please Please PLEASE listen to what the protesters are saying, we want the system to fundamentally be changed to serve and protect people via love and support.

Listen to people like [Defund OPD](#), they are doing their homework and being led by people who want to make caring first a priority.



**Natasha Price**  
**UI/UX/GRAPHIC DESIGNER**

email: [REDACTED]

---

[www.natashapricedesign.com](http://www.natashapricedesign.com)

**From:** [Erica Hruby](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Oakland Police Commission 18 June Budget Hearing Public Comment  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 2:36:42 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

My name is Erica Hruby, I am an Oakland resident in District 6 and I am writing to comment on Agenda item IV for tonight's special budget hearing.

I am writing in support of the demands set forth by the Anti Police Terror Project:

1. Reduce OPD's allocation from the General Fund by 50% (roughly \$150 Million).
2. Disallow unauthorized overtime by OPD.
3. Invest in housing, jobs, youth programs, restorative justice, mental health workers and other services that actually keep the community safe.

Furthermore, I would like to address the comments and conduct of Interim Police Chief Susan Mannheimer during the June 11 convening of the police commission.

The video shown by Chief Mannheimer can only be described as propaganda. Missing were the extreme acts of violence from the OPD upon peaceful citizens that precipitated these events. Citizen response of property damage -- not physical violence -- was a direct response to being attacked militaristically by OPD and could have been avoided had OPD not escalated peaceful protest.

Chief Mannheimer's response to the commissioners' queries about how OPD might reduce staff or response in relation to a potential budget cut was frankly offensive. She insisted that eliminating crossing guards is the only place that OPD might release responsibility to civilians. She further mentioned that the towing of cars and response to mental health calls is best handled by sworn officers. Such a response indicates that she is fundamentally misaligned with the needs of our community, which is thoughtful, qualified response to the majority of 911 calls, which have nothing to do with the prevention or reduction of crime.

Last, I would like to issue a correction to the transcript of my comment from the July 11 police commission meeting. Please see page 6 of the document found at <https://cao-94612.s3.amazonaws.com/documents/Police-Commission-6.11.20-Meeting-Transcript.pdf>; my comment in part reads: "They need to be prosecuted for their crimes. Deputy Chief [inaudible 01:13:36] in particular for ordering the attacks on nonviolent protesters on June 1st."

I would like to amend the record to indicate in no unclear terms that I was and am referring to the actions of Deputy Chief Roland Holmgren and his order to attack peaceful, unarmed civilians with projectiles in the early evening of June 1 in Oakland. I suspect that the omission from the transcript is not an accident.

Thank you,

---

Erica Hruby

**From:** [Andrew Morales](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** On Agenda Item 4  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 2:39:08 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

To the Oakland Commission,

We have been unanimous in our demand for defunding the police; Mayor Libby, the police staff, and other council members continue to try and sweep this under the rug and offer half-hearted reforms that have historically proven to be ineffective. So long as police sustain qualified immunity and are the ones holding each other accountable, reforms and tougher laws will do nothing. WE DEMAND DEFUNDING AND REDISTRIBUTION OF FINANCIAL RESOURCES.

- **Defund OPD by 50% at minimum** (about \$150 million), rather than increasing their funding
- **Redistribute this money to community resources that will actually keep the people safe** (and make this for the people and not the state!). Have that money go to housing, medical resources, education, youth programs, jobs (through art, sport, and other activity programs that benefit the children and provide work for the adults), and mental health workers, and you will see an actual decrease in crime.
- **No more unauthorized overtime for OPD**

I am a mental health worker that has been working with kids and families throughout Oakland for over three years now. I have worked across the East Bay, and the common denominator for mental health crises and social dysfunction has ALWAYS been poverty and lack of much needed living resources. Furthermore, at this point, the people have become disillusioned and can see VERY clearly that police put our people at risk and do not keep them safe. The only way you will see the public outrage quell is through defunding the police and taking real steps towards change. *This is just a sober, objective observation.*

DEFUND THE POLICE,  
Andrew Morales

**From:** [Caitlin Enwright](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Defunding the OPD and Investing in the People  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 2:40:15 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello!

First off, I would like to thank the Police Commission for volunteering their time to do this important work.

I am writing because I am in support of defunding the Oakland Police Department by 50% (roughly \$150 million), and investing those funds into vital social services for the city of Oakland, including: youth services, truly affordable housing, community healthcare, restorative justice, accessible mental and behavioral health services, parks and recreation, libraries, community rooted emergency response services, public schools and education, urban and community gardens, food justice, climate change resources, renewable energy, and support for small businesses.

I would like to see an end to unauthorized overtime by OPD.

I am in support of ending our contract with CHP and removing them from our streets.

Our police department has been under federal oversight for 17 years, yet we have not seen reform work. And we have not seen a significant decrease in crime levels despite a skyrocketing police budget.

Thank you again for your work, and I hope the people's demands are heard and met.

**From:** [Joshua Mayfield](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** E-comment 6/18/2020 Budget  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 2:56:52 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My Name is Joshua Mayfield, and I am writing to leave a comment on the proposed budget. I am an educator at Oakland High school. I feel that Oaklands police budget is ridiculously inflated, accounting for over 40% of Oaklands discretionary fund. This is an unnecessary and ridiculous allocation of resources. Public schools in Oakland and being closed, suffering layoffs and are cutting programs. All the while OPD is spending hundreds of millions of dollars on overtime, military equipment, and wasteful projects.

Oakland police need to be defunded by at least 50%, and this money needs to be redistributed into our community. When the disparity between school and police budgeting is this egregious we are just fueling the school to prison pipeline.

Thank you for your time.

sincerely,

-Joshua Mayfield

**From:** [Isaac Katten](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** eComments on police commission meeting 6.18.20  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:02:45 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Comments for item IV: Hearing on the Oakland Police Department Budget and Action on Recommendations to City Council

Dear Oakland Police Commission,

I am writing to ask you to recommend a minimum 50% reduction of the police budget with no more overtime pay drafted from the general fund. Monies divested from the police should be reinvested in education, mental health services, housing, jobs, restorative justice, and other essential structures and services that, when lacking the necessary funding, are the root causes of many social issues that we criminalize. My requests are aligned with the Anti Police-Terror Project demands, but I ask that in addition, you formulate a plan to completely defund the police by 2030.

Thank you,

Isaac Katten

**From:** [Cassandra Carver](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment Agenda Item #4 Oakland Police Commission Meeting Today  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:03:18 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

-----  
Hi,

My name is Cassandra Carver. I am an Oakland resident and would like to provide public comment on agenda item #4 of the police commission meeting this evening. Please find my comments below:

Policing does not work. If police, policing, and incarceration kept us safe, we would be the safest country in the world because we criminalize and incarcerate more people than any other country on the planet. We've seen time and time again that efforts to reform the police have failed. REFORM WILL NOT WORK. There is no amount of implicit bias or deescalation training that can fix the fundamentally racist foundations and culture of the police. City Council needs to listen to the screams of the people of Oakland and ACT by DEFUNDING THE POLICE.

The People of Oakland are sick of seeing OPD's budget bloated, while every other service in our city that could actually keep us safe — like housing, healthcare, education, and youth programs — get starved.

I demand that Libby Schaaf and the Oakland City Council:

- Reduce OPD's allocation from the General Fund by 50% (roughly \$150 Million);
- Disallow unauthorized overtime by OPD;
- Invest in housing, jobs, youth programs, restorative justice, mental health workers and other services that actually keep the community safe.

Thank you,  
Cassandra

**From:** [A. Turner](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Comment for 6/18 Oakland Police Commission Budget Meeting  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:07:57 PM

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Hello Commissioners ,

My name is Amber Turner and this is my comment for the Oakland Police Commission Special Budget Hearing today Item 3.

The people have spoken. We want OPD defunded and disbanded. We are tired of cuts to essential community services because of OPD's over-bloated and constantly ballooning budget.

OPD takes almost half of Oakland's general fund each year--consuming desperately needed resources from housing, parks, libraries, and other vital services. The investment in policing has not made us safer. OPD remains an embarrassment to the city and a lethal threat to Oakland's Black and Brown communities.

Council must divest The People's Money from the violent, racist and corrupt Oakland Police Department and reinvest in the relief and resilience of the town's black and brown communities.

I stand with all those demanding that Oakland City Council defund OPD and reinvest in community, starting immediately by:

- Defunding OPD by at least 50%
- Investing money from defunding OPD into passing the full Black New Deal
- Stopping the use of violence and chemical warfare of any kind against protesters
- Cutting the contract with California Highway Patrol - who murdered Erik Salgado and an unborn baby in East Oakland a week ago and removing them from oakland

OPD is a bad investment. Oakland could better use this money to provide living wage jobs, housing for all, youth programs, health care, restorative justice and other essential services. It is unacceptable only 2.4% goes to Parks and Rec, 2.3% to Human Services, and less to other services.

I support some of the funds from defunding OPD to fund the MACRO program which should mirror successful programs like MH First in Sacramento -- a mobile crisis response model that operates *independently* of law enforcement and was designed by and for our impacted communities.

Funds should also be used for housing and health care, especially as we are still in the middle of the COVID-19 pandemic.

In addition, Measure Q funds should not go to hiring more police.

Reallocating \$25 million is not enough. We need OPD defunded by at least 50%. We need to

work towards demilitarizing and disbanding the police and creating systems of community safety. We need to invest in our community. We need to invest in Oakland.

Thank you,  
Amber Turner

**From:** [Jozefina Logu](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for 6/18/20 Police Commission Special Budget Meeting  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:20:13 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My name is Jozefina Logu and I'm a District 3 resident. I would like to express my support to defund OPD through a public comment (via this email) for the Oakland Commission Police Special Budget Hearing Agenda on 6/18/20. What we've seen is huge distress and tragedy in our neighborhoods for far too long because of police presence. I believe we need to defund OPD's budget by 50% and invest in our communities by reallocating OPD's funds to our schools, mental health services, healthcare, social workers, and various community programs.

Thank you for your review.

Best,  
Jozefina

**From:** [Conor](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** recommend to defund OPD  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:22:04 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

As a constituent of District 3, I want to write to say my support for not only Councilmember Fortunata Bas's recommendation to reduce (and reallocate) OPD's budget by \$25-50 million, but also that we can instead reduce that budget by upwards of 50% (or about \$115 million). As the Councilmember, and other activists, have pointed out, we can redirect this money into housing for the homeless, city services, health care, mental health services, jobs training programs, and a myriad of other programs that research shows truly reduces crime. We can use that money to hire trained professionals with thousands of hours of experience to respond to non-violent offenses, like noise complaints, littering, de-escalating folks in a mental health crisis, and more. Now is the time for us to make the stand that Oakland will be a leader in reconstituting its police force, reinvesting in its communities, and pushing for structural and systemic change to address fundamental racial and economic inequalities.

Best,  
Conor Carroll

**From:** [Eve Brodsky](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Oakland Police Commission Budget Proposal  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:26:49 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My name is Eve and I am a resident of district 1 in Oakland.

The proposed budget cuts are insufficient. We need to cut the OPD general fund budget by a minimum of 50%. In addition, we need to disallow authorized overtime for OPD and to cease providing general fund money to pay settlements due to police misconduct, police negligence, or murder committed by police.

These funds should be reallocated to fund education, jobs, housing, restorative justice, youth programs, homeless support, and mental health services to serve the community.

Thank you,  
Eve

**From:** [Kristina Miller](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Defund OPD  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:27:21 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

My name is Kristina Miller and I am an Oakland resident. Tonight recommendations will be made to the City Council regarding the police budget. I am writing to implore we recommend a budget cut of 50% or about \$110 Million from OPD.

Currently OPD consumes almost half of the general budget yet has failed to make the city any safer, especially for the majority black and brown residents. On the contrary they are a threat to the BIPOC community in Oakland. We must reinvest this money in efforts to reduce crime and increase resiliency in a holistic manner. Please consider rerouting these funds to by adhering to the Black New Deal which would fund healthcare, education, and housing.

Additionally, Oakland City Council must cut their contract with California Highway Patrol - these police do not come from or support our community in any way, yet are responsible for brutal murders such as that of Erik Salgado.

I hope Oakland City Council is prepared to meet our demands, and to be on the right side of history.

Best,

--

**Kristina C. Miller**  
Stevens Institute of Technology '17  
B.E. Mechanical Engineering



**From:** [Ralph Paone](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Commission Meeting Public Comment: Defund OPD  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:30:35 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Christine Love-

Hello. My name is Ralph Paone. I am a 10 year Bay Area resident, and I am writing to request the Police Commission DEFUND OPD and REINVEST in specific community initiatives.

Simply put, OPD is a bad investment for the city of Oakland.

The Oakland police department is vastly over-funded and over-militarized. They are also ill-equipped to handle a wide variety of community needs—from addiction issues to mental health issues to school safety. And years of excessive use of force have destroyed the public's trust in OPD's ability to transform. I have personally experienced OPD's absolutely disgraceful (and all too regular) practice of tear gassing and assaulting peaceful protestors.

At the same time, there are many community issues that desperately need reinvestment and funding.

Specifically: training mental health responders, addiction rehabilitation, programs to house the houseless, public education and community anti-violence initiatives that do not start with armed officers.

OPD has been asked to do too much. It's more than time to focus the department's scope and reinvest in other resources.

Thank you,

Warm regards,

Ralph Paone  
  
San Francisco, CA  
94118

**From:** [Devon O'Rourke](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Police budget review  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:36:55 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hi,

Thank you so much to the Police Commission for volunteering their time to do this important work.

I am an oakland resident writing because I would like to see the city of oakland reduce the police budget to make funds available for critical departments supporting oakland residents through the covid-19 pandemic and the current housing crisis.

I hope that this can be done in part by:

No more payment for unauthorized overtime.

No more payment for legal fees in lawsuits for officer misconduct.

Also, I am in support of ending our contract with CHP and removing them from our streets

And of course, I am in support of defunding the Oakland Police Department by 50% (roughly \$150 million), and investing those funds into vital social services for the city of Oakland, including: youth services, truly affordable housing, community healthcare, restorative justice, accessible mental and behavioral health services, parks and recreation, libraries, community rooted emergency response services, public schools and education, urban and community gardens, food justice, climate change resources, renewable energy, and support for small businesses.

Thank you all again,

-Devon O'Rourke

**From:** [Maya Kulkarni](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment Oakland Police Commission Meeting 6/18  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:39:51 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hi,

I am submitting a public comment to the Oakland Police Commission Special Budget Hearing (June 18), **commenting on Agenda Item IV:**

**My Name:** Maya Kulkarni

**My Comment:** As a long-term resident of Oakland who resides in District 2 in Chinatown just a block away from OPD Headquarters, I have witnessed OPD's violence and police brutality first hand, including being tear gassed in my own residence. My proximity to OPD makes me feel less safe. OPD is a violent, racist institution and a lethal threat to Oakland's Black and Brown communities. I support my Councilmember's push to reduce funding to OPD, and encourage at least a 50% reduction in OPD's General Fund. Please redirect funds from OPD and reinvest them into the safety and wellness of Black and Brown people.

**From:** [Liv Lee](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** public comment for police Commission meeting tonight 6/18  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:51:11 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

To Whom It May Concern,

My name is Olivia Lee and I am commenting on agenda item IV.

I am a taxpayer and voter living in district 1 for over 7 years. In that time I have watched neighbors become unhoused, tent cities grow, Black youth neighbors be arrested for fitting a description with assault rifles pointed at them, coworkers return to the service industry because they couldn't make enough money being teachers to survive, and the price of Covered CA health care rise and rise and rise.

I was so upset to learn that OPD receives nearly half of the general fund. For years I've just thought we needed even higher taxes on those with higher incomes (and we probably still do), but really what's happening is that an absurd amount of tax money is being allocated to the police who are a racist and lethal threat to Black and Brown communities and who are not making anything safer.

I ask that the police Commission advise the City Council to divest 50% of the funding going to OPD (roughly 150 million) and reinvest it into The Black New Deal, housing programs for the unhoused and affordable housing, healthcare, education and other youth programs, living wage jobs, restorative justice, and other social services.

I also ask that the Commission advise City Council to end its contract with CHP - who brutally murdered Erik Salgado in East Oakland two weeks ago. Additionally, I ask that the police be stopped from using any kind of violence against protesters.

Thank you for your time.

Sincerely,  
Olivia Lee



**From:** [T Albinak](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment RE: Defunding OPD  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 3:56:09 PM

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Hello. My name is Teddy Albinak. I am a 5 year Bay Area resident, and I am writing to request the Police Commission DEFUND OPD and REINVEST in specific community initiatives.

Simply put, OPD is a bad investment for the city of Oakland.

The Oakland police department is vastly over-funded and over-militarized. They are also ill-equipped to handle a wide variety of community needs—from addiction issues to mental health issues to school safety. And years of excessive use of force have destroyed the public's trust in OPD's ability to transform. I have personally experienced OPD's absolutely disgraceful (and all too regular) practice of tear gassing and assaulting peaceful protestors.

At the same time, there are many community issues that desperately need reinvestment and funding.

Specifically: training mental health responders, addiction rehabilitation, programs to house the houseless, public education and community anti-violence initiatives that do not start with armed officers.

OPD has been asked to do too much. It's more than time to focus the department's scope and reinvest in other resources.

Thank you,

Teddy Albinak



--

T. Albinak, Ph.D.  
(pronouns: he/him/his)

**From:** [Justin Carder](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Comment for 6/18 Budget meeting  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 4:07:34 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Members of the Police Commission,

My name is Justin Carder. I'm writing today to make a comment on Agenda Item IV.

I'm writing today, to voice my support for defunding and eventually abolishing the police in Oakland. I am a longtime Oakland resident (since 2004) and am a small business owner.

I demand that police funding in Oakland be cut by 50% and that the remaining funds be redirected toward education, job training, healthcare, drug rehab, and programs to help our houseless neighbors.

For too long, the solution to every challenge the city has faced has been to throw money at the police. Police are being asked to do too much, and are playing an outsized, and poorly fitting role in Oakland, and in our society at large.

OPD takes almost half of Oakland's general fund each year—money that is sorely needed elsewhere in our budget. OPD has not made Oakland residents safer, and are not acting in the best interests of our community—they act as an occupying force and a threat to the lives of residents in poor Black and POC neighborhoods.

We are hearing this call from all over the country. These changes are possible. Now is the time for a complete reimagining of what community safety can mean. To end the history of racialized violence and harassment that the police have brought to our communities. It is not the time for half measures or so-called "police reform." The police have shown us time and again that they are incapable of controlling themselves, making themselves accountable, or enacting meaningful reform despite community demands. It is time to take our communities back from this militarized, unaccountable force.

Thank you for considering my comment. I will continue to press this issue until changes are made. Thank you for your time.

—Justin Carder

**From:** [Ester Kang](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment on Agenda Item IV  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 4:08:40 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello, my name is Ester Kang, I go to Merritt College and live in D3.

I was at the city council's most recent meeting on June 16th for 8.5 hours. I waited that entire time to speak, and never got a chance to. Most of the council was completely unmoved by these weeks of massive public outcry.

I was also at the police commission special meeting on June 8th, in regards to the excessive force used by OPD on June 1st. Not only did I get a chance to speak and share my story and make my plea at that meeting, you all stayed with us for hours, listening to us. Thank you for your compassion. It's very telling that the people who are volunteering are the ones doing the hard work, while the elected officials whose very job it is to listen and represent their constituents behave as though they hear nothing.

Thank you so much for actually hearing what we say, please, please help us reach city council. They really seem to just not care at all that the people of Oakland are organized and have a unified message.

I'm writing to reject the proposed midcycle general fund budget. Oakland Police Department's budget needs to be cut by at least 50% (~\$150 million). Those funds should be used to close the deficit, and to invest in community services that are shown to reduce crime and improve quality of life for residents, much more effectively than law enforcement. Additionally, Measure Q needs to be used appropriately, for parks and homeless services, and none of those funds should go to OPD officers.

There needs to be an end to unauthorized overtime for OPD officers.

Oakland needs to cut ties with California Highway Patrol, who very recently have shown, when they murdered Erik Salgado and his unborn child, and seriously injured and traumatized his girlfriend and family and community, that they have no place in our town.

Please help us

**From:** [Jacob Kahn](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Defunding OPD  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 4:18:03 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Dear Chair Regina Jackson and the Oakland Police Commission,

I would like to firstly extend my sincere gratitude for the tremendous time and effort you put in as volunteers for this important work. Your dedication is valued and honored by the people of Oakland.

As a resident of District 5, and previously of 1 and 3, I am writing in unequivocal support of Councilmember Bas' Budget Amendments for Community Safety. It is high time to decrease the budget of OPD and divert our taxpayer funds toward restorative justice services (health, housing, schools, and environmental justice) in Black and Brown communities. That said, I encourage the Police Commission to adopt even greater proposed decreases to OPD's budget, in the range of at least 50% (roughly \$150 million).

In the midst of recent protests and actions, I was alarmed to see at least two specific *increases* to police spending on the agenda of this week's earlier City Council Meeting, for police helicopters and shotspotter. That is the exact opposite of what we need in this moment.

Further, I would like to see an end to unauthorized overtime by OPD, and I am in support of ending our contract with CHP and removing them from our streets.

Our police department has been under federal oversight for 17 years, yet we have not seen reform work. And we have not seen a significant decrease in crime levels despite a skyrocketing police budget.

Thank you again for your work, and I hope the people's demands are heard and met.

Sincerely,

Jacob Kahn

**From:** [b. vaughn sulit](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for 6/18 police budget meeting  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 4:21:53 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello, My name is B. Vaughn Sulit. I am an Oakland resident, and I support defunding OPD. Over the years, Oakland has continued to put more and more money into OPD, yet OPD is as ineffective and dangerous as ever. As a result, social programs that would actually make the city safer by protecting and supporting the people—such as housing, mental health, public transportation, and more—continue to remain drastically underfunded. Oakland must act immediately and reallocate OPD’s exorbitant budget towards social programs such as these. Pouring more money into OPD for reforms \*will not\* fix any problems, and will only make things worse.

We DEMAND that Oakland City Council DEFUND OPD and REINVEST in community by:

- Defunding the Oakland Police Department by at least 50%
- Investing the money from defunding OPD into passing the full Black New Deal
- Stopping the use of violence of any kind against protestors
- Cutting the contract with the California Highway Patrol — who brutally murdered Erik Salgado in East Oakland a week ago — and removing them from Oakland

We can best keep our community safe by using The People’s Money to provide living wage jobs, housing for all, youth programs, health care, restorative justice and other essential community services.

Some of the money from OPD's budget could be used to fund the MACRO (Mobile Assistance Community Responders of Oakland) program, which should mirror successful programs like MH First in Sacramento -- a mobile crisis response model that operates independently of law enforcement and was designed by and for impacted communities.

**From:** [Nora](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** OPD Budget  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 4:22:15 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hello,

I've been attending the last several meetings discussing the OPD's upcoming budget, and once again I would like to voice my continued support of DEFUNDING and DISBANDING the Police.

I fully support APTP's demands and proposals - their suggestions are rooted in community dialogue and accurately reflect what the people of Oakland need right now.

Please, I implore you, LISTEN to what thousands of voices are saying and at the very least, reduce the police budget by 50%. This is not a time for hesitation or tentative measures. These are times unlike any other and I hope your actions now can be ones you will be proud of in the future.

Regards,

Nora McKinnon  
District 3

**From:** [Tim Johnson](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Comment on special budget hearing  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 4:28:08 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Hi there,

My name is Timothy Johnson.

As a resident of oakland, I am writing to share my thoughts on the OPD budget discussion (Agenda item #4).

I am in full support of redirecting a large portion of money spent on the police department towards alternative public safety initiatives. The Mental-Health First-responders program is especially interesting to me as it offers a non-armed alternative for accessing help in situations involving people with mental-health issues. I think many people are more likely to call this program for help rather than risk costly and even dangerous encounters with police in many situations. I also like that the responders are required to have significantly more training for these situations than our current police force has.

This is just one example of where I would like to have more of my money spent. I think 50% of the city budget is far too high for one agency, and there are lots of ways to spend some of that money more effectively to serve and protect the communities here.

Thank you and I am eager to join the meeting tonight.

Tim

**From:** [DREEM DUNGEON](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** police commission meeting  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 4:32:30 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

As I am sure I'm echoing a sentiment among many I am writing to say that OPD needs to be defunded. The idea of defunding is no longer an ideology that cannot be attained. We are seeing San Francisco reject the 2020/2021 police budget, we are seeing Minneapolis move to completely disband their police force. The bay area is supposed to be a leader in progressive changes, and right now it is laughable the job we are doing.

Not only is it no longer unattainable of a model, there has been organizing work done around defunding the OPD for YEARS. The work has already been done for y'all. The wheel does not need to be reinvented. I urge y'all to consider the terms laid out by the Anti Police Terror Project and the Black New Deal.

While council member Nikki Bas's proposal is a nice gesture, cutting the projected 300 million dollar budget by 25, is not going to cut it. The projected budget of \$330 million is a devastatingly egregious use of public funds, particularly in light of OPD's abuse of power, racial profiling, and recent sexual abuse scandals. Their internal systemic racism is even documented by the Oakland Black Officers Association. We are beyond accountability with OPD - there are no precedents that would allow the citizens of Oakland to trust a process of investigation, review and "discipline." The citizens of Oakland need and deserve the city to put funding towards life not lethal police force. Better use of those funds would be towards public services, schools, and health resources.

I am sure that both deputy Manheimer as well as Libby Schaaf will continue to conflate various civil unrests to needing more police. I am sure they are going to site the recent nooses showing up at the lake as a reason to need more police presence. However, we all know that black and brown people do not feel safe around the police. The KKK and other white supremacist terrorist organizations have been a part of the fraternal order of the police since the inception of the police. To further state how unnecessary it would be to increase their unwanted presence, there are already community led patrols being organized. We keep ourselves safe. We feel safer without the police. Do not let Manheimer and Schaaf twist such an ugly and racist outpouring to suit their agendas.

It is imperative that the Oakland Police Department be defunded.  
OPD has continuously abused its power in every regard.  
We do not want or need OPD.

**From:** [Daoud Ra](#)  
**To:** [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)  
**Subject:** Police Commission Comments Item 4  
**Date:** Thursday, June 18, 2020 4:35:04 PM

---

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

---

Oakland Police Commission Comments

Item IV

Dear Esteemed Commissioners,

Thank you for your bold leadership in addressing the City of Oakland Police budget.

As you know, Councilmember Bas has proposed a minimum \$25M divestment from the OPD General fund to reinvest in homeless/homeless prevention; mental health services; OUSD police removal; CSEC; greater police accountability; safety ambassadors; and backfilling for City labor concessions. Certainly, these are the type of reprioritization initiatives we are looking for to create safe and thriving communities, but they are not enough. While I, along with many of the speakers at the most recent Council meeting, support the more aggressive APTP approach of a 50% OPD general fund reduction, I also appreciate what might be politically possible at this time especially considering any limitations with Measure Z. I would like to ask that the Commission consider a “friendly amendment” to Bas’s proposal recommending increasing the percentage amount for divestment to \$50M which would be more in line with maximum allowable Measure Z reductions and would enable a greater level of investment into Oakland’s community health.

Sincerely,

David C. Ralston

Oakland Resident